

File comments.csv 3rd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P **12** L **33** # **r03-4**
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A**

The 802.3 chair has updated the frontmatter text in relation to 802.3.1.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace the paragraph with:
 "Two companion documents exist, IEEE Std 802.3.1 and IEEE Std 802.3.2. IEEE Std 802.3.1 describes Ethernet management information base (MIB) modules for use with the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP). IEEE Std 802.3.2 describes YANG data models for Ethernet. IEEE Std 802.3.1 and IEEE Std 802.3.2 are updated to add management capability for enhancements to IEEE Std 802.3 after approval of those enhancements."

Response Response Status **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **45** SC **45.2.3.15.4** P **36** L **5** # **r03-5**
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A**

Comment i-2 against D3.0 of the revision project:
<http://www.ieee802.org/3/cj/comments/P8023-D3p0-Comments-Final-byID.pdf>
 has changed the text of the third sentence of 45.2.3.15.4.

SuggestedRemedy

Change:
 "... the hi_ber variable in the 64B/66B state diagram and is defined in ..." to:
 "... the hi_ber variable in the BER monitor state diagrams as defined in ..."

Response Response Status **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **45** SC **45.2.3.15.5** P **36** L **12** # **r03-2**
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syst

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A**

Make this match the text in the revision project

SuggestedRemedy

Change the third sentence of 45.2.3.15.5 from:
 For a 10GBASE-R or 25GBASE-R PCS, this bit is a direct reflection of the state of the block_lock variable defined in 49.2.13.2.2.

To:
 For a 5/10/25GBASE-R PCS, this bit is a direct reflection of the state of the block_lock variable defined in 49.2.13.2.2.

Response Response Status **U**

ACCEPT.

Cl **45** SC **45.2.3.15.5** P **36** L **12** # **r03-6**
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A**

Comment i-3 against D3.0 of the revision project:
<http://www.ieee802.org/3/cj/comments/P8023-D3p0-Comments-Final-byID.pdf#page=2>
 has changed the text of the third sentence of 45.2.3.15.5 to:
 "For a 10GBASE-R or 25GBASE-R PCS, this bit is a direct reflection of the state of the block_lock variable defined in 49.2.13.2.2."

SuggestedRemedy

Change the sentence to:
 "For a 10GBASE-R ~~or~~ 25GBASE-R PCS, this bit is a direct reflection of the state of the block_lock variable defined in 49.2.13.2.2."
 where:
<u> and </u> are the start and end of underline font, respectively
~~<s>~~ and ~~</s>~~ are the start and end of strikethrough font, respectively

Response Response Status **C**

ACCEPT.

File comments.csv 3rd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

Cl 45 **SC 45.5.3.3** **P 40** **L 30** # **r03-7**
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A**
 Comment i-64 against D3.0 of the revision project:
<http://www.ieee802.org/3/cj/comments/P8023-D3p0-Comments-Final-byID.pdf#page=21>
 has changed: "is set to 1 for" to: "is set to one for"

SuggestedRemedy
 Change "is set to 1 for" to "is set to one for"

Response *Response Status* **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 73 **SC 73.7.1** **P 48** **L 32** # **r03-9**
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A**
 Comment i-49 against D3.0 of the revision project:
<http://www.ieee802.org/3/cj/comments/P8023-D3p0-Comments-Final-byID.pdf#page=17>
 has removed the list of PHYs in brackets from 73.7.1.
 This removes the need for any modification to be made by the P802.3cb draft.

SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the whole of 73.7.1 from the draft.

Response *Response Status* **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 73 **SC 73.3** **P 47** **L 41** # **r03-1**
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syst

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **A**
 Align with Clause 73 in the revision project 802.3cj

SuggestedRemedy
 Delete the following subclauses:
 73.3 on page 47
 73.7.1 on page 48
 73.11.4.7 on page 51

Response *Response Status* **U**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 73 **SC 73.7.4.1** **P 48** **L 40** # **r03-10**
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A**
 "Change 73.7.4.1 ..." should be "Change the first two paragraphs of 73.7.4.1 ..."
 Also, the heading for 73.7.4 is missing.

SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Change 73.7.4.1 ..." to "Change the first two paragraphs of 73.7.4.1 ..."
 Add the heading for 73.7.4.

Response *Response Status* **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 73 **SC 73.3** **P 47** **L 44** # **r03-8**
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A**
 Comment i-48 against D3.0 of the revision project:
<http://www.ieee802.org/3/cj/comments/P8023-D3p0-Comments-Final-byID.pdf#page=17>
 has removed the list of Technology-Dependent PHYs from the third paragraph of 73.3 and
 replaced it with:
 "Technology-Dependent PHYs are those supported by the Auto-Negotiation process (see
 Table 73-4)."
 This removes the need for any modification to be made by the P802.3cb draft.

SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the whole of 73.3 from the draft.

Response *Response Status* **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 73 **SC 73.7.6** **P 49** **L 19** # **r03-3**
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syst

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A**
 Should the inserted rows be underlined?

SuggestedRemedy
 Consider underling the rows for 5GBASE-KR and 2.5GBASE-KX.

Response *Response Status* **C**
 ACCEPT.

File comments.csv 3rd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

Cl 73 SC 73.11.4.7 P 51 L 1 # r03-11
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status A
 Comment i-50 against D3.0 of the revision project:
<http://www.ieee802.org/3/cj/comments/P8023-D3p0-Comments-Final-byID.pdf#page=17>
 has changed the value of PICS entry SD15 in 73.11.4.7 to just read:
 "The values in Table 73-7"
 This removes the need for any modification to be made by the P802.3cb draft.

SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the whole of 73.11.4.7 from the draft.

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 125 SC 125.1.2 P 55 L 11 # r03-12
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status A
 The third sentence starts: "While this specification defines ...", but this should be "While this standard defines ..."

SuggestedRemedy
 Change: "specification" to "standard"

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 125 SC 125.3 P 58 L 44 # r03-13
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status A
 "See 1.4.117" should be "See 1.4.160"

SuggestedRemedy
 Change "See 1.4.117" to "See 1.4.160"

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 128 SC 128.7.1.5 P 109 L 37 # r03-14
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status A
 "Insertion_loss(f)" on the left side of Equation (128-3) should be "Return_loss(f)"

SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Insertion_loss(f)" to "Return_loss(f)"

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 128 SC 128.7.1.6 P 110 L 33 # r03-15
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status A
 "Insertion_loss(f)" on the left side of Equation (128-4) should be "Return_loss(f)"

SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Insertion_loss(f)" to "Return_loss(f)"

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 128 SC 128.7.1.8 P 111 L 39 # r03-16
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status A
 "test pattern shall the high-frequency" does not make sense.

SuggestedRemedy
 Change:
 "test pattern shall the high-frequency" to:
 "test pattern shall be the high-frequency"

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

File comments.csv 3rd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

Cl 128A **SC 128A.3.1** **P 176** **L 25** # **r03-20**
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **A**
 In Table 128A-1, add "(max)" at the end of the text for Peak-to-peak differential output voltage, for transmit disabled (7th row of the table).
SuggestedRemedy
 Change 'Parameter' column to read: "Peak-to-peak differential output voltage (max) transmitter disabled".
Response *Response Status* **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 128A **SC 128A.3.2** **P 179** **L 51** # **r03-31**
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **A**
 Change unneeded Interference tolerance and Jitter tolerance references in Table 128A-2.
SuggestedRemedy
 In Table 128A-2, omit text from 'Value' column for the Interference tolerance and Jitter tolerance rows. Place hyphens in the empty columns.
Response *Response Status* **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 128A **SC 128A.3.2.2** **P 180** **L 8** # **r03-32**
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **A**
 Change 2nd sentence to point to correct values for calibration procedure.
SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "Table 128A-3" with "the calibration procedure shown below". Delete Table 128A-3.
Response *Response Status* **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 128A **SC 128A.3.2.2** **P 180** **L 28** # **r03-30**
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **A**
 Change wrong SNDR cross ref to the table.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change bullet e) to read: Adjust noise to meet the required SNDR in Table 128A-1.
Response *Response Status* **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 128A **SC 128A.3.2.2** **P 181** **L 29** # **r03-33**
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **A**
 Add missing table reference to bullet f).
SuggestedRemedy
 Bullet f) sentence should read: "Adjust pattern generator random jitter to the required value in Table 128A-1...."
Response *Response Status* **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Should be page 180 not 181.

Cl 128A **SC 128A.3.2.3** **P 181** **L 37** # **r03-34**
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **A**
 Change 2nd sentence to point to correct values for calibration procedure.
SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "Table 128A-4" with "the calibration procedure shown below". Delete Table 128A-4.
Response *Response Status* **C**
 ACCEPT.

File comments.csv 3rd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

CI 128A SC 128A.3.2.3 P 181 L 48 # r03-24
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Missing word: add "maximum" in front of "transition time" for bullet c).
 SuggestedRemedy
 see comment
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change wording to:
 "Adjust the ISI channel to the limit of the maximum transition time in Table 128A-1."
 Also change same wording in 128.3.2.2.

CI 128A SC 128A.3.2.3 P 181 L 49 # r03-26
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Missing word: add "(max)" after "output voltage" for bullet d).
 SuggestedRemedy
 see comment
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 This is a stress test that requires minimum not maximum voltage.
 Change the wording to:
 "Peak-to-peak differential output voltage (min) transmitter enabled."

CI 128A SC 128A.3.2.3 P 181 L 50 # r03-28
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Missing reference: add to the end of the sentence at bullet e): "in Table 128A-1"
 SuggestedRemedy
 see comment
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 128A SC 128A.3.2.3 P 181 L 51 # r03-35
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Add missing table reference to bullet e).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Bullet e) sentence should read: "Adjust pattern generator random jitter to the required value in Table 128A-1...."
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 128A SC 128A.3.3 P 184 L 22 # r03-21
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 In Table 128A-6, add "(max)" at the end of the text for Peak-to-peak differential output voltage, for transmit disabled (7th row of the table).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 'Parameter' column to read: "Peak-to-peak differential output voltage (max) transmitter disabled".
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 128A SC 128A.3.4 P 185 L 14 # r03-36
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Change unneeded Interference tolerance and Jitter tolerance references in Table 128A-7.
 SuggestedRemedy
 In Table 128A-7, omit text from 'Value' column for the Interference tolerance and Jitter tolerance rows. Place hyphens in the empty columns.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

File comments.csv 3rd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

CI 128A SC 128A.3.4.2 P 185 L 27 # r03-37
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Change 2nd sentence to point to correct values for calibration procedure.

SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "Table 128A-6" with "the calibration procedure shown below".

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 128A SC 128A.3.4.2 P 185 L 47 # r03-38
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Add missing table reference to bullet f).

SuggestedRemedy
 Bullet f) sentence should read: "Adjust pattern generator random jitter to the required value in Table 128A-6...."

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 128A SC 128A.3.4.3 P 185 L 27 # r03-39
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Change first sentence to point to correct values for calibration procedure.

SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "Table 128A-8" with "the calibration procedure shown below". Delete Table 128A-8.

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Should be page 186, line 39 not 185, line 27.

CI 128A SC 128A.3.4.3 P 186 L 51 # r03-25
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Missing word: add "maximum" in front of "transition time" for bullet c).

SuggestedRemedy
 see comment

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change wording to:
 "Adjust the ISI channel to the limit of the maximum transition time in Table 128A-6."
 Also change same wording in 128.3.4.2.

CI 128A SC 128A.3.4.3 P 186 L 52 # r03-27
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Missing word: add "(max)" after "output voltage" for bullet d).

SuggestedRemedy
 see comment

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

This is a stress test that requires minimum not maximum voltage.
 Change the wording to:
 "Peak-to-peak differential output voltage (min) transmitter enabled."

CI 128A SC 128A.3.4.3 P 186 L 53 # r03-29
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Missing reference: add to the end of the sentence at bullet e): "in Table 128A-6"

SuggestedRemedy
 see comment

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

File comments.csv 3rd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

Cl **128B** SC **128B.1.2** P **193** L **48** # **r03-19**
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A**
 Add "(dB)" after the equation at (128B-1). During recirc #2, r02-49 was partially completed.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment for change. Also repeat at equations (128B-2) and (128B-3).
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl **130A** SC **130A.1** P **210** L **1** # **r03-17**
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A**
 For consistency between text shown directly above Figure 128A-2 and Figure 130A-2, as was changed in comment r02-30 for draft D3.2, restructure the paragraph above Figure 130A-2.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Reword the entire paragraph above Figure 130A-2 as follows:
 The 5GSEI link is described in terms of a host 5GSEI component with associated insertion loss and a drive 5GSEI component. Figure 130A-2 (one direction shown) depicts the informative differential insertion loss budget at 2.578125 GHz for a typical 5GSEI application. The informative maximum differential insertion loss from TP0 to TP5 is given in Equation (130A-1) and depicted in Figure 130A-3. The 5GSEI interface consists of independent data paths in each direction. Each data path contains one differential lane, which is AC-coupled on the receiver side. The nominal signaling rate for each lane is 5.15625 GBd.
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl **130A** SC **130A.1** P **210** L **8** # **r03-18**
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A**
 For consistency between like figures, change Figure 130A-2 to have the same TP alignment as Figure 128A-2.

SuggestedRemedy
 Using comment r02-31 for draft D3.2 as basis, change Figure 130A-2 to have the same re-alignment of TP0 and TP1 as in Figure 128A-2. Do not change any of the TP names or the numerical values in the existing Figure 130A-2, only change the rearrangement and re-alignment of TP0 and TP1 as shown in Figure 128A-2.
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl **130A** SC **130A.3.1** P **205** L **20** # **r03-23**
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D**
 Change Table 130A-7, row 5, to become 3 rows as shown in Table 128A-6, rows 5, 6, and 7, for consistency of the table formats.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change row "Differential peak-to-peak output voltage (max)" to become 3, independent rows as in Table 128A-6. Maintain the current 'Subclause reference' and 'Values' shown in the current table. Add the new row, "Peak-to-peak differential output voltage (min) transmitter enabled" with a value of 800mV.
 Proposed Response Response Status **Z**
 REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

File comments.csv 3rd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

Cl 130A **SC 130A.3.1** **P 205** **L 20** # **r03-22**
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type **ER** **Comment Status** **A**
 Change Table 130A-1, row 5, to become 3 rows as shown in Table 128A-1, rows 5, 6, and 7, for consistency of the table formats.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change row "Differential peak-to-peak output voltage (max)" to become 3, independent rows as in Table 128A-1. Maintain the current 'Subclause reference' and 'Values' shown in the current table. Add the new row, "Peak-to-peak differential output voltage (min) transmitter enabled" with a value of 800mV.
Response **Response Status** **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 130A **SC 130A.6.1** **P 216** **L 30** # **r03-42**
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type **ER** **Comment Status** **A**
 Change incorrect reference to "f1".
SuggestedRemedy
 Change Table 128B-1 to Table 69B-2.
Response **Response Status** **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 130A **SC 130A.4** **P 209** **L 34** # **r03-40**
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **A**
 Add missing hyphens to empty spaces in Table 130A-3.
SuggestedRemedy
 In Table 130A-3, place hyphens in the empty columns of Interference tolerance and Jitter tolerance rows.
Response **Response Status** **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 130A **SC 130A.4.2** **P 209** **L 49** # **r03-41**
 Smith, Daniel Seagate Technology L

Comment Type **ER** **Comment Status** **A**
 Change incorrect reference to "f1".
SuggestedRemedy
 Change Table 128B-1 to Table 69B-2.
Response **Response Status** **C**
 ACCEPT.