Cl **1** *SC* **1** *P* **14** *L* **4** # i-120

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A**

The use of an undated reference (i.e., IEEE Std 802.3) indicates the current version of the reference. Today, this reference includes approved P802.3bt, approved P802.3cb, and by completion should include at a minimum P802.3cd. This standard clearly can't track a moving target. A dated reference should be used, and clarity should be added on what parts of IEEE Std 802.3-2018 are not included. It appears that the current approved amendments are not included. It would also be appropriate to indicate that the YANG modules do not include all cmanagement capabilities for DTE specified in Clause 30.

SuggestedRemedy

Add appropriate words about this standard incorporating selected management capabilities for some DTEs defined in IEEE Std 802.3-2018.

Response *Response Status* **U**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change

This standard defines YANG modules for Ethernet data terminal equipment (DTE) specified in IEEE Std 802.3. This includes DTEs operating on mixing segments, using either Carrier Sense Multiple Access / Collision Detection (CSMA/CD) or multipoint control protocol (MPCP), link segments, and as Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE).

To

This standard defines YANG modules for various Ethernet devices specified in IEEE Std 802.3. This includes half-duplex and full-duplex data terminal equipment (DTE) using either Carrier Sense Multiple Access / Collision Detection (CSMA/CD) or multipoint control protocol (MPCP), and Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE).

Cl **2** *SC* **2** *P* **16** *L* **30** # i-127

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A** *bucket*

With the addition of Table 5-2, RFC 3635, EtherLike MIB should be added to the normative references.

SuggestedRemedy

Add reference.

Response *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add reference IETF RFC 3635, Definitions of Managed Objects for the Ethernet-like Interface Types, September 2003

Cl **5** *SC* **5.2** *P* **20** *L* **24** # i-231

Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *SI*

speed is m/s according to SI units

SuggestedRemedy

Change to data rate

Response *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.

Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223 defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.

Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

Cl **5** *SC* **5.3.1** *P* **24** *L* **19** # i-232

Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *SI*

speed is m/s according to SI units

SuggestedRemedy

Change to data rate

Response *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.

Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223 defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.

Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

Cl **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **27** *L* **10** # i-233

Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *SI*

speed is m/s according to SI units

SuggestedRemedy

Change to data rate

Response *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.

Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223 defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.

Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

Cl **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **27** *L* **17** # i-234

Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *SI*

speed is m/s according to SI units

SuggestedRemedy

Change to data rate

Response *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.

Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223 defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.

Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

Cl **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **30** *L* **48** # i-235

Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *SI*

speed is m/s according to SI units

SuggestedRemedy

Change to data rate

Response *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.

Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223 defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.

Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

Cl **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **30** *L* **49** # i-236

Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *SI*

speed is m/s according to SI units

SuggestedRemedy

Change to data rate

Response *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.

Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223 defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.

Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

Cl **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **30** *L* **53** # i-237

Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **A**

speed is m/s according to SI units

SuggestedRemedy

Change to data rate

Response *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "Operational speed" to "Operational speed (data rate)"

Cl **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **27** *L* **10** # i-158

Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *SI*

speed-type is not the appropriate term (speed should mean "data rate")

SuggestedRemedy

Replace this parameter by "phy-type" according to IEEE 802.3 30.3.2.1.2

Response *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.

Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223 defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.

Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

Cl **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **33** *L* **48** # i-163

Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R**

According to 30.3.1.1.37, Max Frame is a enumerated value

SuggestedRemedy

Change definition to the 4 enumeration values

Response *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.

A pre-configured value is more useful, especially considering support for frames larger than allowed by 30.3.1.1.37