

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P1 L1 # i-18  
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 "IEEE P802.3.2(TM)/D2.1" should be "IEEE P802.3.2(TM)/D3.0"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 replace "D2.1" with the draft number text inset.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P2 L1 # i-19  
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 The even page header in the front matter is for P802.3cc  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Make consistent with the other headers.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P7 L21 # i-20  
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 The column sizes in the list of WG ballot participants need changing to avoid any names wrapping across two lines.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Re-size the columns to be the same as the latest version of the 802.3 FrameMaker template.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P8 L2 # i-21  
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 The first 6 names on page 8 are repeats of names on page 7.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove "McMillan, Larry" through "Migueluez, Phil" from the list on page 8  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P10 L1 # i-116  
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 The title "Introduction" is missing.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Please restore the title. (If necessary, get the templates fixed.)  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P10 L1 # i-22  
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 The heading for "Introduction" is missing.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add the heading  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P10 L7 # i-118  
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 The 2018 revision has been published.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 The Introduction should reference IEEE Std 802.3-2018 (not 201X).  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P**10** L**8** # **i-119**  
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 Grammar.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 "results" should be "result"  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **0** SC **0** P L # **i-27**  
 Perry, Lisa  
 Comment Type **G** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 This draft meets all editorial requirements.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **1** SC **1** P**14** L**6** # **i-121**  
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 Inconsistent capitalization of Multipoint Control Protocol (though Std 802.3 is not consistent, this capitalization is most common).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change this instance.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Change "multipoint control protocol (MPCP)," to "Multipoint Control Protocol (MPCP),"

Cl **1** SC **1.4** P**14** L**44** # **i-31**  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type **T** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 It would be better if we did not restrict the higher protocol to just NETCONF and RESTCONF as in the following statement: Managed objects defined using YANG modelling language are hosted on the managed device and accessed through NETCONF (see IETF RFC 6241) or RESTCONF (see IETF RFC 8040).  
 Same issue pg 17 line 10.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Change:  
 "NETCONF (see IETF RFC 6241) and RESTCONF (see IETF RFC 8040)" to  
 "NETCONF (see IETF RFC 6241) or RESTCONF (see IETF RFC 8040)"

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED REJECT.  
 Text already reads "NETCONF (see IETF RFC 6241) or RESTCONF (see IETF RFC 8040)."

Cl **1** SC **1.5** P**14** L**51** # **i-32**  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 There are multiple modules.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change:  
 "The YANG module defined ..." to  
 "The YANG modules defined ..."

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **1** SC **1.5** P**14** L**63** # **i-33**  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 There are multiple modules.  
 The same issue exists on pg 15 line 4 and 9

SuggestedRemedy  
 Change:  
 "this YANG module ..." to  
 "these YANG modules ..."

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 2 SC 2 P16 L13 # i-1  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 An editorial note can be removed. Also, fix the publication date for 802.3-2018 to read 31 August 2018  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Per comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 2 SC 2 P16 L13 # i-35  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 It is highly unlikely that the edition of 802.3 will change from that referenced and P802.3cj has completed it's work.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 remove the Ed Note.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 2 SC 2 P16 L13 # i-123  
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 The Editorial Note is no longer relevant  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove the note.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 2 SC 2 P16 L30 # i-127  
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 With the addition of Table 5-2, RFC 3635, EtherLike MIB should be added to the normative references.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add reference.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add reference IETF RFC 3635, Definitions of Managed Objects for the Ethernet-like Interface Types, September 2003  
 Cl 2 SC 2 P16 L31 # i-37  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 RFC 5246  
 Per <https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/rfc8446/> RFC 5246 is obsolete.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace with RFC 8446  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 2 SC 2 P16 L39 # i-38  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 RFC 6241  
 Per <https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/rfc8446/> RFC 6241 has been updated by RFC 7803  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add ref to RFC 7803  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 2 SC 2 P16 L46 # i-39  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 RFC 6536  
 Per <https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/rfc6536/> RFC 6536 is obsolete.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace with RFC 8341  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 2 SC 2 P16 L55 # i-40  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 RFC 7950  
 Per <https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/rfc7950/> RFC 7950 has been updated.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add ref to RFC 8342  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 3 SC 3.1 P17 L7 # i-41  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 missing period at end of sentence.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 per comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.2 P19 L49 # i-42  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 The Editorial Note seems to be conveying information that would be useful to the reader which should be retained in the published document. Furthermore there is no reference to Table 5-3.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove the Editorial Note and add the following at the end of the para in 5.2. Nodes that do not map into RFC 2819 (RMON) but into the ETHERLIKE MIB appear in Table 5-3.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Remove the Editorial Note

Cl 5 SC 5.2 P19 L50 # i-2  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 Unnecessary editorial note  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove the note on line 50-52.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.2 P21 L45 # i-23  
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 The final bottom border in Table 5-1 should be "Thin" i.e., follow the table definition.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove the override from the final bottom border in Table 5-1  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

**Cl 5 SC 5.2 P22 L19 # i-126**  
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting  
**Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket**  
 The titles of Table 5-2 and 5-3 are inconsistent. One uses the RFC (RFC 2819, RMON) and the other the common name (RFC 3635 EtherLike MIB).  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Make consistent, preferably using RFC #.  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Change title of Table 5-3 to read: "Mapping between IETF RFC 3635 managed objects and ieee802-ethernet-interface YANG data nodes"

**Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P26 L3 # i-43**  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
**Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket**  
 The sub-clause refers to multiple YANG modules.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Change:  
 "In the following YANG module definition, ..." to  
 "In the following YANG module definitions, ..."  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P28 L57 # i-4**  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio  
**Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket**  
 No need to use the reference to 802.3 anymore, it is clearly defined that any "Ethernet interface" is an IEEE Std 802.3 compliant Ethernet interface  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Change "IEEE Std 802.3 Ethernet interface" to "Ethernet interface" in following locations (page/line):  
 28/57  
 32/39  
 44/31  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P32 L56 # i-47**  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
**Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket**  
 Indentation of "(IETF RFC 8343).";"  
 Same issue pg 33 line 11.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 align with rest of description  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P34 L12 # i-164**  
 Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation  
**Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket**  
 fps is written differently compared to Gb/s  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Change to f/s  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.2 P45 L6 # i-24**  
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation  
**Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket**  
 "10GB/s" should be "10 Gb/s" (add a space and lower case B)  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Change "10GB/s" to "10 Gb/s"  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.2 P45 L21 # i-48**  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
**Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket**  
 Indentation of augment statement.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 line 19-20 is Indented by one extra level.  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 6 SC 6.1 P50 L13 # i-49  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Is this a test to see who is paying attention? There is only one data module in this clause and there are 2 in Clause 5.

SuggestedRemedy

Change:  
 "The YANG modules defined in this clause extend the Ethernetinterface YANG data module defined in Clause 5 ..." to  
 "The YANG module defined in this clause extends the Ethernetinterface YANG data modules defined in Clause 5..." pointers follow

^ ^ ^

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.2 P50 L20 # i-50  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 missing verb

SuggestedRemedy

Change  
 "clause focused" to  
 "clause is focused"

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.2 P50 L21 # i-51  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 missing "the"

SuggestedRemedy

Change:  
 "Power over Ethernet (PoE) function" to:  
 "the Power over Ethernet (PoE) function"  
 and on line 24 change:  
 "for PoE function" to  
 "for the PoE function"

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.2 P50 L22 # i-52  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

"power over data line" or "Power over Data Line"? We should be consistent.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: "power over data line" to "Power over Data Line"

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.3 P50 L12 # i-129  
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 First use of PD in document not expanded.

SuggestedRemedy

Add expansion Powered Device.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.3 P51 L1 # i-53  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Why does 6.3 warrant starting on a new page?

SuggestedRemedy

Remove page break

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 6 SC 6.3 P51 L5 # i-54  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Grammar  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change  
 "There are a number of data nodes defined in this YANG module as configuration with read-write." to  
 "There are a number of data nodes defined in this YANG module that are configurable as read-write."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.3 P51 L30 # i-55  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Grammar  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change:  
 "and possible to encrypt their values" to:  
 "and to possibly encrypt their values"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.5.1 P60 L27 # i-156  
 Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 units definition should be plural and without quoting  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change to millijoules  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.5.1 P60 L47 # i-153  
 Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 units definition should be plural and without quoting  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change to milliwatts  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.5.1 P60 L59 # i-154  
 Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 units definition should be plural and without quoting  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change to milliwatts  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.5.1 P64 L21 # i-148  
 Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 units definition should be plural and without quoting  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change to milliwatts  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.5.1 P64 L36 # i-149  
 Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 units definition should be plural and without quoting  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change to milliwatts  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P61 L12 # i-56  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Indenting the line beginning ""PoDL PSE configuration ..." is excessively indented and therefore wraps to the next line.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Removed excess indents and ensure the line wraps properly is required to fit on two lines.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.2.1 P65 L59 # i-130  
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 First use of PMD in document not expanded.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add expansion Physical Medium Dependent (though Std 802.3 uses an uncapitalized version in 1.5 a quick check of expansions in the document uses the capitalized version).  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P63 L15 # i-57  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Indenting the line beginning "enters the the SIGNATURE\_INVALID ..." needs an additional space indentation and one less "the".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 per comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.2.1 P65 L62 # i-131  
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 First use of PCS in document not expanded.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add expansion Physical Coding Sublayer (though Std 802.3 uses an uncapitalized version in 1.5 a quick check of expansions in the document mostly uses the capitalized version).  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.2 P65 L12 # i-58  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 missing verb  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change  
 "clause focused" to  
 "clause is focused"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.2.1 P66 L20 # i-5  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 MPCP is already expanded and defined  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change  
 Clause 77: MPCP (Multipoint Control Protocol), which  
 to  
 Clause 77: MPCP, which  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

## Proposed Responses

## IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

**Cl 7**    **SC 7.2.1**                      **P66**            **L65**            # **i-133**  
 Grow, Robert                              RMG Consulting  
**Comment Type**    **E**            **Comment Status**    **D**                              *bucket*  
 First use of FEC in document not expanded.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Add expansion forward error correction (Std 802.3 uses an uncapitalized version in 1.5 but capitalized on a variant, RS-FEC a quick check of expansions in the document mostly uses the uncapitalized version).  
**Proposed Response**            **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
  
 Add expansion Forward Error Correction - we just need to be consistent in our document  
 Page number fixed (should be 66, line 65)

**Cl 7**    **SC 7.2.1**                      **P76**            **L1**            # **i-132**  
 Grow, Robert                              RMG Consulting  
**Comment Type**    **E**            **Comment Status**    **D**                              *bucket*  
 First use of PMA in document not expanded.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Add expansion Physical Medium Dependent (though Std 802.3 uses an uncapitalized version in 1.5 a quick check of expansions in the document mostly uses the capitalized version).  
**Proposed Response**            **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 7**    **SC 7.2.2**                      **P66**            **L28**            # **i-6**  
 Hajduczenia, Marek                      Charter Communicatio  
**Comment Type**    **E**            **Comment Status**    **D**                              *bucket*  
 Missing comma after "802.3"  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Per comment  
**Proposed Response**            **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 7**    **SC 7.2.3**                      **P67**            **L34**            # **i-134**  
 Grow, Robert                              RMG Consulting  
**Comment Type**    **E**            **Comment Status**    **D**                              *bucket*  
 Figure 7-2 title has inconsistent capitalization of Multipoint MAC Control (Std 802.3 seems to use this capitalization).  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Capitalize Control.  
**Proposed Response**            **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 7**    **SC 7.2.3**                      **P67**            **L38**            # **i-135**  
 Grow, Robert                              RMG Consulting  
**Comment Type**    **E**            **Comment Status**    **D**                              *bucket*  
 Inconsistent capitalization of time-division multiple access (Std 802.3 is 2:1 on hyphenation, and uses lower case in all three occurrences).  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Change to: time-division multiple access.  
**Proposed Response**            **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 7**    **SC 7.2.6**                      **P70**            **L50**            # **i-70**  
 Remein, Duane                              Huawei Technologies  
**Comment Type**    **E**            **Comment Status**    **D**                              *bucket*  
 "an non-overlapping" should be "a non-overlapping"  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 per comment  
**Proposed Response**            **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 7 SC 7.2.6 P70 L55 # i-71  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 "ONU, decision" should be "ONU, a decision"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 per comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P81 L34 # i-12  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 "mpcp" should be all caps  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "mpcp" to "MPCP"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.3 P75 L57 # i-25  
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 The final bottom border in Table 7-1 should be "Thin" i.e., follow the table definition.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove the override from the final bottom border in Table 7-1  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P81 L64 # i-13  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket  
 These are not "Ethernet interfaces" but "EPON interfaces" that this module defines, being the extension of Ethernet interfaces.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change all instances of "Ethernet interface" to "EPON interface" in this module  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P76 L50 # i-75  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type G Comment Status D bucket  
 There are only two instances of "Clause 64/77" while there are 29 instances of "Clause 64 and Clause 77". To make future maintenance simpler we should use "Clause 64 and Clause 77" consistently.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace both instances of "Clause 64/77" with "Clause 64 and Clause 77"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P84 L57 # i-77  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket  
 It seems odd to have a blank Reference  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "" to "Not Applicable"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #-14

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P84 L57 # i-14  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Empty reference field  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Strike  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P86 L10 # i-79  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Indenting the line beginning "This action applies to an OLT or ONU virtual interface.;"  
 should be indented one additional space.  
 Same issue line 23.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 per comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P86 L23 # i-80  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Indenting the line beginning "This action applies to an OLT or ONU virtual interface." should  
 be indented one additional space.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 per comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P88 L37 # i-83  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 The sentence reads poorly "Contain all Ethernet interface specific capabilities."  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to "This container includes all Ethernet interface specific capabilities."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change to "This container includes all Ethernet interface-specific capabilities."  
 (added missing hyphen)

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P90 L9 # i-86  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Indenting the line beginning "re-initialization of the management system, and at other  
 times" should be indented one less space.  
 Exact same issue line 38, pg 91 line 4, pg 91 line 34, pg 91 line 64, pg 93 line 25., pg 95  
 line 54, pg 97 line 45, pg 98 line 7, pg 98 line 35, pg 99 line 2, pg 98 line 65, pg 100 line  
 31., pg 106 line 44, pg 107 line 9, pg 107 line 38, pg 108 line 3, pg 114 line 35, and pg 115  
 line 1.  
 Note there are instances where the quoted text is correctly indented and thus a global  
 search and replace cannot be used.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 per comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P96 L35 # i-17  
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communicatio  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Stranded reference to 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Insert "IEEE Std 802.3, " before "65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1", "65.1.3.3.2 or 76.2.6.1.3.2",  
 and "65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3", where reference to 802.3 is absent  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P96 L46 # i-96  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 "has distinct values for each virtual interface" really? Multiple values for each LLID?  
 Same issue pg 97 line 12  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change:  
 "has distinct values" to:  
 "has a distinct value"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P99 L33 # i-99  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Indenting  
 The line beginning "re-initialization of the management system, and at other times" and the  
 next line should be indented one less space.  
 The line beginning "defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343).";" should  
 be indented two less spaces.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 per comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P109 L6 # i-103  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Change "in to" to "to"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 per comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P110 L3 # i-104  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 This statement is redundant "It has a distinct value for each logical link and every queue. At  
 the ONU, it has a distinct value for every queue." because the previous sentence is  
 missing "At the OLT"  
 Same issue pg 110 line 40, pg 111 line 14, pg 111 line 43, 112 line 65, and pg 114 line 31.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change:  
 "It has a distinct value for each logical link and every queue." to:  
 "At the OLT it has a distinct value for each logical link and every queue."

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Change:  
 "It has a distinct value for each logical link and every queue." to:  
 "At the OLT, this object has a distinct value for each logical link and every queue."  
 (replaced "it" with ", this object")

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P110 L35 # i-105  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Indenting the line beginning "ONU. It can have a value between 0 and 7, limited by the  
 value" should be indented one less space.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 per comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P115 L19 # i-107  
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Indenting  
 In the description beginning ""This object reflects the number of frame drop events from" all  
 lines except the first line should be indented one additional space.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 per comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

## Proposed Responses

## IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

**Cl 7**    **SC 7.4.2**                      **P116**        **L65**                      # **i-109**  
 Remein, Duane                                      Huawei Technologies  
*Comment Type*    **E**                      *Comment Status*    **D**                                      *bucket*  
 There is no cable in EPON "is cable of supporting"  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Change cable to capable  
*Proposed Response*                      *Response Status*    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 7**    **SC 7.4.2**                      **P120**        **L1**                      # **i-112**  
 Remein, Duane                                      Huawei Technologies  
*Comment Type*    **E**                      *Comment Status*    **D**                                      *bucket*  
 Indenting the line beginning "This object is applicable for an OLT and an ONU. It has the same" should be indented one less space.  
 Exact same issue exists on line 49  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 per comment  
*Proposed Response*                      *Response Status*    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 8**    **SC 8.2.4**                      **P122**        **L3**                      # **i-136**  
 Grow, Robert                                      RMG Consulting  
*Comment Type*    **E**                      *Comment Status*    **D**                                      *bucket*  
 The expansion and acronym for OAMPDU are not closely enough linked.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Add "(OAMPDU)" after "Ethernet OAM protocol data unit".  
*Proposed Response*                      *Response Status*    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 8**    **SC 8.3**                                      **P122**        **L46**                      # **i-137**  
 Grow, Robert                                      RMG Consulting  
*Comment Type*    **E**                      *Comment Status*    **D**                                      *bucket*  
 Netconf/Restconf are not capitalized in this case.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 NETCONF/RESTCONF  
*Proposed Response*                      *Response Status*    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 8**    **SC 8.3.**                                      **P122**        **L46**                      # **i-114**  
 Remein, Duane                                      Huawei Technologies  
*Comment Type*    **E**                      *Comment Status*    **D**                                      *bucket*  
 Capitalization "Netconf/Restconf" should be in all caps  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 per comment  
*Proposed Response*                      *Response Status*    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 8**    **SC 8.4**                                      **P126**        **L46**                      # **i-26**  
 Anslow, Peter                                      Ciena Corporation  
*Comment Type*    **E**                      *Comment Status*    **D**                                      *bucket*  
 The final bottom border in Table 8-1 should be "Thin" i.e., follow the table definition.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Remove the override from the final bottom border in Table 8-1  
*Proposed Response*                      *Response Status*    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 8**    **SC 8.5.2**                                      **P143**        **L23**                      # **i-115**  
 Remein, Duane                                      Huawei Technologies  
*Comment Type*    **E**                      *Comment Status*    **D**                                      *bucket*  
 Indenting the line beginning ""Enable or disable monitoring." appear to be indented less than the rest of the description for no apparent reason.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Adjust the indenting to match the rest of the description  
*Proposed Response*                      *Response Status*    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.