Cl **4**　　　*SC* **4**　　　　　　　*P* **19**　　　*L* **6**　　　# r01-11

Remein, Duane　　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **X**

Abbreviations should be in alphabetical order

SuggestedRemedy

reorder

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **5**　　　*SC* **5.2**　　　　　　　*P* **21**　　　*L* **34**　　　# r01-1

Anslow, Peter　　　　　　　　　Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **X**

As noted in comment #202 against P802.3cf D2.2, When tables split across pages, the bottom ruling of the table on all but the last page should be
"very thin" and the final bottom ruling should follow the table format as "Thin".
This is not done correctly in D3.1 for:
Table 5-1 where the bottom ruling on page 21 is not overridden to be "Very Thin" (indicating that the table continues)
Table 6-1 where the bottom ruling on page 53 is ok, but the bottom ruling on page 54 should be "Thin" to indicate the end of the table.
Table 7-1 where the bottom rulings on page 75 and on page 76 are not overridden to be "Very Thin" (indicating that the table continues)
Table 8-1 where the bottom rulings on page 127 and on page 128 are not overridden to be "Very Thin" (indicating that the table continues)

SuggestedRemedy

In Table 5-1 override the bottom ruling on page 21 to be "Very Thin" while leaving the bottom ruling on page 22 "Thin".
In Table 6-1 make the bottom ruling on page 54 "Thin" while leaving the bottom ruling on page 53 "Very Thin".
In Table 7-1 override the bottom rulings on page 75 and page 76 to be "Very Thin" while leaving the bottom ruling on page 77 "Thin".
In Table 8-1 override the bottom rulings on page 127 and page 128 to be "Very Thin" while leaving the bottom ruling on page 129 "Thin".

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **5**　　　*SC* **5.3.2**　　　　　　*P* **27**　　　*L* **3**　　　# r01-12

Remein, Duane　　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **X**

"text of description" missing article. Same error pg/line: 56/3, 81/3, and 133/3

SuggestedRemedy

change to "text of the description" in 4x

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **5**　　　*SC* **5.3.2.1**　　　　　*P* **27**　　　*L* **21**　　　# r01-13

Remein, Duane　　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **T**　　　*Comment Status* **X**

The statement "revision <publication-date-in-yyyy-mm-dd-format> {" should be properly indented. Same issues pg/line: 44/44, 56/17, 81/18, and 133/18

SuggestedRemedy

Add indenting 5x

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

Cl **5**　　　*SC* **5.3.2.2**　　　　　*P* **45**　　　*L* **5**　　　# r01-2

Zhuang, Yan　　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **G**　　　*Comment Status* **X**

we've changed the reference of iana-if-type in ethernet-interface module and should change it in other modules as well.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete editorial notes and change the reference of iana-if-type to
"http://www.iana.org/assignments/yang-parameters/iana-if-type@2018-07-03.yang"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **5**
SC **5.3.2.2**

Page 1 of 4
12/13/2018 10:51:30 AM

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.4.2**   *P* **80**   *L* **26**   # r01-14

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

Incomplete sentence in description:
"For a complete description of how the LLID is used in an EPON device.";"

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: "For a complete description of how the LLID is used in an EPON device see Std 802.3, Clause 65 for 1G-EPON and Clause 76 for 10G-EPON.";"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.4.2**   *P* **82**   *L* **10**   # r01-15

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

There are two instances where we changed
"This object indicates that the given Ethernet interface supports MPCP ..." to
"This object indicates that the given EPON interface supports MPCP ..."
I don't know of any EPON interfaces which don't support MPCP.

SuggestedRemedy

At the following locations change:
"This object indicates that the given EPON interface supports MPCP ... " to :
"This object indicates that the given interface supports MPCP ... "
Pg/Line - 81/10, 90/52

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.4.2**   *P* **87**   *L* **42**   # r01-4

Zhuang, Yan   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

missing period.

SuggestedRemedy

change:
description
    "Exit EPON logical interface power-down state";
to
description
    "Exit EPON logical interface power-down state.";

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.4.2**   *P* **90**   *L* **62**   # r01-16

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

There are five instances where we changed
"an Ethernet interface implementing MPCP, ..." to
"an EPON interface implementing MPCP"
I don't know of any EPON interfaces which don't support MPCP.

SuggestedRemedy

At the following locations change:
" an EPON interface implementing MPCP, ..." to
"an EPON interface, ..."
Pg/Line - 90/62, 97/41, 102/62, 104/37, & 108/30

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.4.2**   *P* **94**   *L* **34**   # r01-5

Zhuang, Yan   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

both "the" and "a" appear as article and delete one.

same at:
pg 94, line 30 and line 61.

SuggestedRemedy

change
This object is applicable for an OLT and has the a distinct value for each logical link.

to
This object is applicable for an OLT and has a distinct value for each logical link.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.4.2**   *P* **108**   *L* **48**   # r01-17

Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **X**

phrase has unmatched single quotes - " ... 'Carrier Extend Error" ..."

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "... 'Carrier Extend Error' ..." (matched single quotes)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **7**
SC **7.4.2**

Page 2 of 4
12/13/2018 10:51:30 AM

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.4.2**   *P* **108**   *L* **48**   # r01-6
Zhuang, Yan   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

'Carrier Extend Error" has error character

SuggestedRemedy

change
'Carrier Extend Error"
to
'Carrier Extend Error'

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.4.2**   *P* **109**   *L* **39**   # r01-18
Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Unconstrained "it" in phrase "it is a count". Same unconstrained it on pg 110 line 4.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "it is a count of" to "this object represents a count of" 2x

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.4.2**   *P* **116**   *L* **35**   # r01-19
Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

This statement is self contradiction: "A count of the number of times a frame reception event results in a frame being queued in (for ONUs) or received from (for OLTs) the corresponding queue. This object is incremented by one for each frame received, when it is input into the associated queue." The last sentence does not agree with the first, in the OLT the received frame is not "put into the associated queue".

SuggestedRemedy

Change
"This object is incremented by one for each frame received, when it is input into the associated queue." to read
"This object is incremented by one for each frame written to (in the case of the ONU) or received for (in case of the OLT) the associated queue."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.4.2**   *P* **116**   *L* **45**   # r01-20
Remein, Duane   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

This sentence applies only to the OLT "It has a
distinct value for each logical link and each queue."

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "At the OLT, it has a distinct value for each logical link and each queue."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.4.2**   *P* **121**   *L* **19**   # r01-7
Zhuang, Yan   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **G**   *Comment Status* **X**

yang error reported by yang validation tools.

SuggestedRemedy

change
leaf mpcp-round-trip-time {
    when "../../ompe-mode = 'olt'";
to
leaf mpcp-round-trip-time {
    when "../ompe-mode = 'olt'";

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.4.2**   *P* **121**   *L* **45**   # r01-8
Zhuang, Yan   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **G**   *Comment Status* **X**

yang error reported by yang validation tools

SuggestedRemedy

change
leaf mpcp-maximum-grant-count {
    when "../../ompe-mode = 'onu'";
to
leaf mpcp-maximum-grant-count {
    when "../ompe-mode = 'onu'";

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **7**   Page 3 of 4
SC **7.4.2**   12/13/2018 10:51:30 AM

Cl **7**   *SC* **7.4.2**   *P* **122**   *L* **26**   # r01-9

Zhuang, Yan   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **G**   *Comment Status*   **X**

yang errors reported by yang validation tools

SuggestedRemedy

change
 leaf mpcp-maximum-queue-count-per-report {
    when "../../ompe-mode = olt'";
to
 leaf mpcp-maximum-queue-count-per-report {
    when "../ompe-mode = olt'";

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **8**   *SC* **8.5.2**   *P* **133**   *L* **40**   # r01-3

Zhuang, Yan   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **G**   *Comment Status*   **X**

we've changed the reference of iana-if-type in ethernet-interface module and should
change it in other modules as well

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the editor note in line 39-40.
Change the reference of iana-if-type to "http://www.iana.org/assignments/yang-
parameters/iana-if-type@2018-07-03.yang"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

Cl **8**   *SC* **8.5.2**   *P* **138**   *L* **65**   # r01-10

Zhuang, Yan   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **G**   *Comment Status*   **X**

string type is not defined in 'yang'.

SuggestedRemedy

change
typedef vendor-oui {
   type yang:string {
to
typedef vendor-oui {
   type string {

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **8**   Page 4 of 4
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *SC* **8.5.2**   12/13/2018 10:51:30 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line