

IEEE P802.3cq D3.0 2-Pair PoE Maintenance Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 33 SC 33.8.3.2 P24 L39 # i-1
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 It is customary to start text in Value/Comment field with a capital.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "when" to "When"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 33 SC 33.2.4.4 P18 L31 # i-2
 Anslow, Peter Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 There is an extraneous period "." after "(see Table 33-23)"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete the period between "see Table 33-23)" and "that indicates"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 33 SC 33.2.9.1.2 P19 L39 # i-3
 Anslow, Peter Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 In Equation (33-7a) there should be a space between the number and its unit.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "250ms" to "250 ms"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 0 SC 0 P L # i-4
 Gibbons, Patrick
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 This draft meets all editorial requirements.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 33 SC 33.2.9.1.2 P19 L28 # i-5
 Rannow, R K Myself
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D
 Two instances of "shall consider ..." which appears ambiguous.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Perhaps something like:
 A DC MPS component shall be present if IPort is greater than or equal to IHold max for a minimum of TMPS. A DC MPS component shall be absent if IPort is less than or equal to IHold min. A DC MPS component shall be either present or absent if IPort is in the range of IHold
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 TFTD.

CI 1 SC 1.4 P16 L6 # i-6
 Kabra, Lokesh Synopsys, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Definition 1.4.294 is deleted by IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018.
 Hence MDI is now defined in 1.4.323
 SuggestedRemedy
 Modify the instruction to
 Change 1.4.323 (re-numbered from 1.4.324 due to the deletion of 1.4.294 by IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018) as follows :
 Modify the index number in line 8 to "1.4.323" accordingly.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change "1.4.324" to "1.4.323".

IEEE P802.3cq D3.0 2-Pair PoE Maintenance Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 1 SC 1.4.324 P16 L10 # i-7

Thompson, Geoff

Comment Type E Comment Status D

As long as we are cracking open this definition and fiddling with the referenced clauses we should make the list complete.
To that end we need to include references to PoDL interfaces as well.
(It is open to interpretation whether this comment should go against this project or P802.3cg. P802.3cg is not altering this definition and is in a later state of balloting where the scope has narrowed to to exclude this topic. I believe that this comment (albeit a stretch) is within the scope of P802.3cq.

SuggestedRemedy

Change from the following text:
(optional per IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 33 and Clause 145)
To the following text:
(optional per IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 33, Clause 104 and Clause 145)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change from the following text:
(optional per IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 33 and Clause 145)
To the following text:
(optional per IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 33, Clause 104, and Clause 145)