Cl **12**   *SC* **12.10.1**   *P* **30**   *L* **13**   # **1**

Marris, Arthur   Cadence Design Systems

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Should the word "isolation" be included?

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Electrical requirements are in J.1" to "Electrical isolation requirements are specified in J.1"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **23**   *SC* **23.5.1,1**   *P* **35**   *L* **15**   # **2**

Marris, Arthur   Cadence Design Systems

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**

Safety information is in J.2 not J.1

SuggestedRemedy

Either change the reference to J.2 or change to say isolation requirements are specified in J.1. Same issue in 32.6.1.1 and similar issue in 38.7.1 (where text refers to isolation rather than general safety)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The J.2 is correct, however, the sentence needs to clearly call out isolation requirements and not safety requirements.

Change:
"NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Safety information may be found in J.1."
to:
"NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Electrical isolation information may be found in J.1."

Cl **149**   *SC* **149.9.1**   *P* **119**   *L* **16**   # **3**

Carlson, Steven   Robert Bosch, Ethernovia

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**

P802.3ch and P802.3cr are now aligned and the Editor's Note is no longer needed.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove Editor's Note at line 16:
Editor's Note (to be removed prior to SA ballot)–Clause 149 was added by IEEE P802.3ch which is currently in Standards Association ballot and is expected to be completed prior to this draft. Comments are invited to bring in approved text of IEEE P802.3ch and modify to align with the purposes of this draft.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE comment #15

Cl **9**   *SC* **9.1.3.1**   *P* **28**   *L* **15**   # **4**

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**

It would be more helpful to the reader to add a date to the NOTE.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 15, edit sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, electrical isolation …"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **10**   *SC* **10.8.3**   *P* **29**   *L* **13**   # **5**

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2011 date applies to the electrical requirements sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 13, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, electrical requirements …"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **5**   Page 1 of 5
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   3/13/2020 1:49:00 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **12**   *SC* **12.10.1**   *P* **30**   *L* **13**   # **6**
Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting
Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the electrical requirements sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 13, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, electrical requirements …"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **23**   *SC* **23.5.1.1**   *P* **35**   *L* **13**   # **7**
Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting
Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence. It also isn't clear why the note talks about "safety information" when the subclause is "Isolation requirement".

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 15, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, isolaton requirements …"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **23**   *SC* **23.9.1**   *P* **35**   *L* **38**   # **8**
Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting
Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 38, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, safety information …"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **27**   *SC* **27.5.1**   *P* **38**   *L* **12**   # **9**
Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting
Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2011 date applies to the safety information sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 38, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, safety information …"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **32**   *SC* **32.6.1.1**   *P* **39**   *L* **15**   # **10**
Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting
Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence. It also isn't clear why the note talks about "safety information" when the subclause is "Isolation requirement".

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 15, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, isolaton requirements …"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **32**   *SC* **32.10.1**   *P* **39**   *L* **37**   # **11**
Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting
Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 38, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, safety information …"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **11**

Page 2 of 5
3/13/2020 1:49:00 PM

Cl **41**   *SC* **41.4.1**   *P* **48**   *L* **13**   # **12**

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2011 date applies to the electrical requirements sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 13, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, safety information …"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **96**   *SC* **96.9.1**   *P* **84**   *L* **9**   # **13**

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

With the editing instruction "change" you need to show the old text with "strikethrough" and the new text with "underline". Instead, I think you want to use "replace".

SuggestedRemedy

Change editing instruction to "Replace all text in 96.9.1 with the following text." Alternatively you can make the editing instruction "Delete all text in 96.9.1 and Insert the following text."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change editing instruction to "Replace all text in 96.9.1 with the following text."

Cl **97**   *SC* **97.9.1**   *P* **86**   *L* **9**   # **14**

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

With the editing instruction "change" you need to show the old text with "strikethrough" and the new text with "underline". Instead, I think you want to use "replace".

SuggestedRemedy

Change editing instruction to "Replace all text in 96.9.1 with the following text." Alternatively you can make the editing instruction "Delete all text in 97.9.1 and Insert the following text."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change editing instruction to "Replace all text in 96.9.1 with the following text."

Cl **149**   *SC* **149**   *P* **119**   *L* **1**   # **15**

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**

The text in 149 is identical to P802.3ch D3.2. As P802.3ch will be published prior to P802.3cr and P802.3cr is not making any changes to this, this Clause is not needed in cr.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete Clause 149 and all subclauses from P802.3cr.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.9.1**   *P* **116**   *L* **14**   # **16**

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Not all the text that is being deleted by cr is shown in strikethrough.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "J.2 or IEC61010-1"
To: "J.2 (start strikethrough) IEC60950-1, IEC62368-1, (end strikethrough) or IEC61010-1"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.9.1**   *P* **116**   *L* **19**   # **17**

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

The editor's note is no longer needed.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete Editor's Note.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **17**

Page 3 of 5
3/13/2020 1:49:00 PM

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.10.1**   *P* **118**   *L* **12**   # 18

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Not all the text that is being deleted by cr is shown in strikethrough.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "J.2 or IEC61010-1"
To: "J.2 (start strikethrough) IEC60950-1, IEC62368-1, (end strikethrough) or IEC61010-1"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.10.1**   *P* **118**   *L* **17**   # 19

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

The editor's note is no longer needed.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete Editor's Note.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Duplicate of #17

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.10.1**   *P* **118**   *L* **12**   # 20

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

There is new text that is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline: "the general safety requirements in"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.10.1**   *P* **118**   *L* **13**   # 21

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

There is new text that is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline: ",as appropriate"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.9.1**   *P* **116**   *L* **14**   # 22

Zimmerman, George   CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTek

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**

As written, this would bring in all the port isolation tests. The change to clause 147 seems more appropriate here, incorporating just the general safety requirements in J.2.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "shall conform to J.2" to "shall conform to the general safety requirements in J.2". Change PICS item ES1 (page 117) feature to read the same.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.9.1**   *P* **116**   *L* **12**   # 23

Zimmerman, George   CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTek

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Editing instruction for the PICS has been used for 146.9.1, and the editing instruction for 146.9.1 is missing, along with strikeout and underline in 146.9.1

SuggestedRemedy

Move editing instruction "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 145.9.1 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" on P116 L12 to P117 L10, under 146.11.4.6 header
Add new editing instruction at P116 L12: "Change text in 146.9.1 as shown:"
Add text in strikeout, between (existing) "to " and (inserted) "J.2", "IEC 60950-1, IEC 62368-1,"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **23**

Page 4 of 5
3/13/2020 1:49:00 PM

Cl **147** *SC* **147.10.1** *P***118** *L* **11** # 24

Zimmerman, George CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTek

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

147.10.1 needs editing instruction (I understand an other commenter has dealt with strikeout & underline)

SuggestedRemedy

Add new editing instruction at P118 L11 (after header for 147.10.1) "Change text of 147.10.1 as shown:"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **00** *SC* **0** *P***11** *L* **3** # 25

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D**

The text, "and its amendments," is not used when describing 802.3bt, 802.3cd, 802.3cn, 802.3cq, 802.3cm, and 802.3cr. Consider with other related Maguire comment. Note: this comment was also submitted against 802.3cv (please coordinate resolution with TG Chair).

SuggestedRemedy

Preferred resolution: Delete "and its amendments," from the clause. Alternately, you could add "and its amendments" to the 802.3bt, 802.3cd, 802.3cn, 802.3cq, 802.3cm, and 802.3cr text, but I don't think a comma is supposed to go after the word "amendments".

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

TFTD

Cl **00** *SC* **0** *P***10** *L* **30** # 26

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D**

802.3cb is the first amendment to 802.3, so it's not changing "IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and its amendments". Consider with other related Maguire comment. Note: this comment was also submitted against 802.3cv (please coordinate resolution with TG Chair).

SuggestedRemedy

Delete, "and its amendments,"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **J** *SC* **J.1** *P***123** *L* **18** # 27

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D**

It seems as though a definite article ("The") is not needed here. Start the clause with, "Electrical isolation shall…"

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the underlined word "The", extend the strikeout under the word "This" to the next empty space, add an "E" in underline immediately before the start of the word "electrical", add a strikeout to the "e" in "electrical".

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

TFTD.

Comment against D2.1 changed "This" to "The". "This Electrical … " has been used in the isolation for some time.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general *Comment ID* **27** Page 5 of 5
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn 3/13/2020 1:49:00 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID