

IEEE P802.3cr D2.1 Maintenance #14: Isolation 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 00 SC 0 P10 L30 # 26

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A

802.3cb is the first amendment to 802.3, so it's not changing "IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and its amendments". Consider with other related Maguire comment. Note: this comment was also submitted against 802.3cv (please coordinate resolution with TG Chair).

SuggestedRemedy

Delete, "and its amendments,"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P11 L3 # 25

Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A

The text, "and its amendments," is not used when describing 802.3bt, 802.3cd, 802.3cn, 802.3cq, 802.3cm, and 802.3cr. Consider with other related Maguire comment. Note: this comment was also submitted against 802.3cv (please coordinate resolution with TG Chair).

SuggestedRemedy

Preferred resolution: Delete "and its amendments," from the clause. Alternately, you could add "and its amendments" to the 802.3bt, 802.3cd, 802.3cn, 802.3cq, 802.3cm, and 802.3cr text, but I don't think a comma is supposed to go after the word "amendments".

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete "and its amendments," from page 11 line 3.

Cl 9 SC 9 P28 L5 # 28

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A LATE

Sub-clause 9.9 is missing between Clause 9 and sub-clause 9.9.3.

SuggestedRemedy

Before 9.9.3 add "9.9 Medium attachment unit and baseband medium specification for a vendor-independent FOIRL"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 9 SC 9.1.3.1 P28 L15 # 4

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

It would be more helpful to the reader to add a date to the NOTE.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 15, edit sentence to read: "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, electrical isolation ..."

Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add Editor's Note at Page 28 Line 11.

"Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Change Page 28 line 12 to the following:

"NOTE—Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."

Cl 10 SC 10.8.3 P29 L13 # 5

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2011 date applies to the electrical requirements sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 13, edit second sentence to read: "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, electrical requirements ..."

Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Modified suggested remedy to additionally resolve comment #1.

Page 29 line 12: Add

"Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Change Page 29 line 13 to the following:

"NOTE—Since September 2011, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."

IEEE P802.3cr D2.1 Maintenance #14: Isolation 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 12 SC 12.10.1 P30 L13 # 1  
Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems  
Comment Type T Comment Status A EZ  
Should the word "isolation" be included?  
SuggestedRemedy  
Change "Electrical requirements are in J.1" to "Electrical isolation requirements are specified in J.1"  
Response Response Status C  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
Resolved by Comment 6:  
Resolution to Comment 6 is:  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE  
Page 30 line 12 Add:  
"Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."  
Page 30 line 13 change the sentence to the following:  
"NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."

Cl 12 SC 12.10.1 P30 L13 # 6  
Grow, Robert RMG Consulting  
Comment Type ER Comment Status A  
As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the electrical requirements sentence.  
SuggestedRemedy  
Insert following Change instruction: Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 13, edit second sentence to read: "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, electrical requirements ..."  
Response Response Status W  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
Modified suggested remedy to additionally resolve comment #1.  
Page 30 line 12 Add:  
"Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."  
Page 30 line 13 change the sentence to the following:  
"NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."

IEEE P802.3cr D2.1 Maintenance #14: Isolation 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 23 SC 23.5.1.1 P35 L13 # 7

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence. It also isn't clear why the note talks about "safety information" when the subclause is "Isolation requirement".

*SuggestedRemedy*

Insert following Change instruction: Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication):  
 Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 15, edit second sentence to read: "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, isolation requirements ..."

Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 35 line 14 add Editor's Note:

"Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Page 35 lin 15 change line to the following:

"NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."

Cl 23 SC 23.5.1.1 P35 L15 # 2

Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems

Comment Type T Comment Status A

Safety information is in J.2 not J.1

*SuggestedRemedy*

Either change the reference to J.2 or change to say isolation requirements are specified in J.1. Same issue in 32.6.1.1 and similar issue in 38.7.1 (where text refers to isolation rather than general safety)

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The J.2 is correct, however, the sentence needs to clearly call out isolation requirements and not safety requirements.

Page 35 line 15 change:

"Safety information may be found in J.1."

to:

"Electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."

Page 35 line 38 change:

"Safety information may be found in J.2."

to:

"Safety information is in J.2."

Cl 23 SC 23.9.1 P35 L38 # 8

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Insert following Change instruction: Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication):  
 Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 38, edit second sentence to read: "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, safety information ..."

Response Response Status W

ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.1 Maintenance #14: Isolation 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 27 SC 27.5.1 P38 L12 # 9

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2011 date applies to the safety information sentence.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Insert following Change instruction: Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 38, edit second sentence to read: "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, safety information ..."

Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 38 line 12 Add Editor's Note:

"Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Page 38 line 13 change line to the following:

"NOTE—Since September 2011, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, safety information is in J.2."

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.1 P39 L15 # 10

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence. It also isn't clear why the note talks about "safety information" when the subclause is "Isolation requirement".

*SuggestedRemedy*

Insert following Change instruction: Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 15, edit second sentence to read: "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, isolation requirements ..."

Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 39 line 14 add Editor's Note:

"Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Page 39 line 15 change line to the following:

"NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, safety information is in J.1."

Cl 32 SC 32.10.1 P39 L37 # 11

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Insert following Change instruction: Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 38, edit second sentence to read: "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, safety information ..."

Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 39 line 36 add Editor's Note:

"Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Page 39 line 37 change line to the following:

"NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, safety information is in J.2."

Cl 41 SC 41.4.1 P48 L13 # 12

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2011 date applies to the electrical requirements sentence.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Insert following Change instruction: Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 13, edit second sentence to read: "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, safety information ..."

Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 48 line 12 add Editor's Note:

"Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since \_\_\_\_ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Page 48 line 13 change line to the following:

"NOTE—Since September 2011, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since \_\_\_\_ 202x, safety information is in J.2."

IEEE P802.3cr D2.1 Maintenance #14: Isolation 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 96 SC 96.9.1 P84 L9 # 13  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status A  
 With the editing instruction "change" you need to show the old text with "strikethrough" and the new text with "underline". Instead, I think you want to use "replace".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change editing instruction to "Replace all text in 96.9.1 with the following text."  
 Alternatively you can make the editing instruction "Delete all text in 96.9.1 and Insert the following text."  
 Response Response Status C  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Change editing instruction to "Delete all text in 96.9.1 and Insert the following text."

Cl 97 SC 97.9.1 P86 L9 # 14  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status A  
 With the editing instruction "change" you need to show the old text with "strikethrough" and the new text with "underline". Instead, I think you want to use "replace".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change editing instruction to "Replace all text in 96.9.1 with the following text."  
 Alternatively you can make the editing instruction "Delete all text in 97.9.1 and Insert the following text."  
 Response Response Status C  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Change editing instruction to "Delete all text in 97.9.1 and Insert the following text."

Cl 112 SC 112.11 P93 L5 # 29  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status A LATE  
 Sub-clause 112.11.4 is missing between sub-clause 112.11 and sub-clause 112.11.4.5.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Before 112.11.4.5 add "112.11.4 PICS proforma tables for Physical Medium Dependent (PMD) sublayer and medium, type 25GBASE-SR"  
 Response Response Status C  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.9.1 P116 L12 # 23  
 Zimmerman, George CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTe  
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ  
 Editing instruction for the PICS has been used for 146.9.1, and the editing instruction for 146.9.1 is missing, along with strikeout and underline in 146.9.1  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Move editing instruction "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 145.9.1 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" on P116 L12 to P117 L10, under 146.11.4.6 header  
 Add new editing instruction at P116 L12: "Change text in 146.9.1 as shown:"  
 Add text in strikeout, between (existing) "to " and (inserted) "J.2", "IEC 60950-1, IEC 62368-1,"  
 Response Response Status C  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 116 Line 12 delete editing instruction "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 145.9.1 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" on P116 L12 to  
 Page 117 Line 10, add editing instruction: "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 146.11.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"  
 Add new editing instruction at P116 L12: "Change text in 146.9.1 as shown:"  
 Add text in strikeout, between (existing) "to " and (inserted) "J.2", "IEC 60950-1, IEC 62368-1,"

Cl 146 SC 146.9.1 P116 L14 # 22  
 Zimmerman, George CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTe  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D  
 As written, this would bring in all the port isolation tests. The change to clause 147 seems more appropriate here, incorporating just the general safety requirements in J.2.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "shall conform to J.2" to "shall conform to the general safety requirements in J.2".  
 Change PICS item ES1 (page 117) feature to read the same.  
 Proposed Response Response Status Z  
 REJECT.  
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.1 Maintenance #14: Isolation 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 146 SC 146.9.1 P116 L14 # 16  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ  
 Not all the text that is being deleted by cr is shown in strikethrough.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "J.2 or IEC61010-1"  
 To: "J.2 (start strikethrough) IEC60950-1, IEC62368-1, (end strikethrough) or IEC61010-1"  
 Response Response Status C  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.10.1 P118 L12 # 18  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ  
 Not all the text that is being deleted by cr is shown in strikethrough.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "J.2 or IEC61010-1"  
 To: "J.2 (start strikethrough) IEC60950-1, IEC62368-1, (end strikethrough) or IEC61010-1"  
 Response Response Status C  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 146 SC 146.9.1 P116 L19 # 17  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ  
 The editor's note is no longer needed.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete Editor's Note.  
 Response Response Status C  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.10.1 P118 L12 # 20  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ  
 There is new text that is not underlined.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Underline: "the general safety requirements in"  
 Response Response Status C  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.10.1 P118 L11 # 24  
 Zimmerman, George CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTe  
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ  
 147.10.1 needs editing instruction (I understand an other commenter has dealt with  
 strikeout & underline)  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add new editing instruction at P118 L11 (after header for 147.10.1) "Change text of  
 147.10.1 as shown:"  
 Response Response Status C  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 147 SC 147.10.1 P118 L13 # 21  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ  
 There is new text that is not underlined.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Underline: ",as appropriate"  
 Response Response Status C  
 ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.1 Maintenance #14: Isolation 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 147 SC 147.10.1 P118 L17 # 19  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ  
 The editor's note is no longer needed.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete Editor's Note.  
 Response Response Status C  
 ACCEPT.  
 Duplicate of #17

Cl J SC J.1 P123 L18 # 27  
 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company  
 Comment Type E Comment Status A  
 It seems as though a definite article ("The") is not needed here. Start the clause with, "Electrical isolation shall..."  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete the underlined word "The", extend the strikeout under the word "This" to the next empty space, add an "E" in underline immediately before the start of the word "electrical", add a strikeout to the "e" in "electrical".  
 Response Response Status C  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Cl 149 SC 149 P119 L1 # 15  
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company  
 Comment Type T Comment Status A  
 The text in 149 is identical to P802.3ch D3.2. As P802.3ch will be published prior to P802.3cr and P802.3cr is not making any changes to this, this Clause is not needed in cr.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete Clause 149 and all subclauses from P802.3cr.  
 Response Response Status C  
 ACCEPT.

Change line as follows:  
 "The electrical isolation..."  
 to  
 "Electrical isolation..."

Cl 149 SC 149.9.1 P119 L16 # 3  
 Carlson, Steven Robert Bosch, Ethernovia  
 Comment Type T Comment Status A  
 P802.3ch and P802.3cr are now aligned and the Editor's Note is no longer needed.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove Editor's Note at line 16:  
 Editor's Note (to be removed prior to SA ballot)—Clause 149 was added by IEEE P802.3ch which is currently in Standards Association ballot and is expected to be completed prior to this draft. Comments are invited to bring in approved text of IEEE P802.3ch and modify to align with the purposes of this draft.  
 Response Response Status C  
 ACCEPT.