Cl **12** *SC* **12.10.1**   *P* **30**   *L* **13**   # 1

Marris, Arthur   Cadence Design Systems

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

 Should the word "isolation" be included?

SuggestedRemedy

 Change "Electrical requirements are in J.1" to "Electrical isolation requirements are
 specified in J.1"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

 Resolved by Comment 6:
 Resolution to Comment 6 is:

 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE

 Page 30 line 12 Add:
 "Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since
 _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

 Page 30 line 13 change the sentence to the following:
 "NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for
 this clause. Since ____ 202x, electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."

Cl **23** *SC* **23.5.1,1**   *P* **35**   *L* **15**   # 2

Marris, Arthur   Cadence Design Systems

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **A**

 Safety information is in J.2 not J.1

SuggestedRemedy

 Either change the reference to J.2 or change to say isolation requirements are specified in
 J.1. Same issue in 32.6.1.1 and similar issue in 38.7.1 (where text refers to isolation rather
 than general safety)

Response   *Response Status* **C**

 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

 The J.2 is correct, however, the sentence needs to clearly call out isolation requirements
 and not safety requirements.

 Page 35 line 15 change:
 "Safety information may be found in J.1."
 to:
 "Electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."

 Page 35 line 38 change:
 "Safety information may be found in J.2."
 to:
 "Safety information is in J.2."

Cl **149** *SC* **149.9.1**   *P* **119**   *L* **16**   # 3

Carlson, Steven   Robert Bosch, Ethernovia

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **A**

 P802.3ch and P802.3cr are now aligned and the Editor's Note is no longer needed.

SuggestedRemedy

 Remove Editor's Note at line 16:
 Editor's Note (to be removed prior to SA ballot)–Clause 149 was added by IEEE P802.3ch
 which is currently in Standards Association ballot and is expected to be completed prior to
 this draft. Comments are invited to bring in approved text of IEEE P802.3ch and modify to
 align with the purposes of this draft.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

 ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **3**   Page 1 of 7
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   3/31/2020 11:04:01 AM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **9**   *SC* **9.1.3.1**   *P* **28**   *L* **15**   # 4

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**

It would be more helpful to the reader to add a date to the NOTE.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication):
Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of
approval. At line 15, edit sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, electrical isolation …"

Response   *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add Editor's Note at Page 28 Line 11.
"Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since
_____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Change Page 28 line 12 to the following:
"NOTE—Since _____ 202x, electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."

Cl **10**   *SC* **10.8.3**   *P* **29**   *L* **13**   # 5

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2011 date applies to the electrical
requirements sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication):
Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of
approval. At line 13, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, electrical
requirements …"

Response   *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Modified suggested remedy to additionally resolve comment #1.

Page 29 line 12: Add
"Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since
_____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Change Page 29 line 13 to the following:
"NOTE—Since September 2011, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for
this clause. Since _____ 202x, electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."

Cl **12**   *SC* **12.10.1**   *P* **30**   *L* **13**   # 6

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the electrical
requirements sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication):
Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of
approval. At line 13, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, electrical
requirements …"

Response   *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Modified suggested remedy to additionally resolve comment #1.

Page 30 line 12 Add:
"Editor's Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since
_____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Page 30 line 13 change the sentence to the following:
"NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for
this clause. Since _____ 202x, electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **6**   Page 2 of 7
3/31/2020 11:04:02 AM

Cl **23**   *SC* **23.5.1.1**   *P* **35**   *L* **13**   # 7

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence. It also isn't clear why the note talks about "safety information" when the subclause is "Isolation requirement".

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 15, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, isolaton requirements …"

Response   *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 35 line 14 add Editor's Note:
"Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Page 35 lin 15 change line to the following:
"NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since _____ 202x, electrical isolation requirements are in J.1."

Cl **23**   *SC* **23.9.1**   *P* **35**   *L* **38**   # 8

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 38, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, safety information …"

Response   *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT.

Cl **27**   *SC* **27.5.1**   *P* **38**   *L* **12**   # 9

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2011 date applies to the safety information sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 38, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, safety information …"

Response   *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 38 line 12 Add Editor's Note:
"Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Page 38 line 13 change line to the following:
"NOTE—Since September 2011, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since _____ 202x, safety information is in J.2."

Cl **32**   *SC* **32.6.1.1**   *P* **39**   *L* **15**   # 10

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence. It also isn't clear why the note talks about "safety information" when the subclause is "Isolation requirement".

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 15, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, isolaton requirements …"

Response   *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 39 line 14 add Editor's Note:
"Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Page 39 line 15 change line to the following:
"NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since _____ 202x, safety information is in J.1."

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **10**   Page 3 of 7
3/31/2020 11:04:02 AM

Cl **32**   *SC* **32.10.1**   *P* **39**   *L* **37**   # 11

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2003 date applies to the safety information sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 38, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, safety information …"

Response   *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 39 line 36 add Editor's Note:
"Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Page 39 line 37 change line to the following:
"NOTE—Since September 2003, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since _____ 202x, safety information is in J.2."

Cl **41**   *SC* **41.4.1**   *P* **48**   *L* **13**   # 12

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**

As it reads, a reader might think the September 2011 date applies to the electrical requirements sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert following Change instruction: Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval. At line 13, edit second sentence to read: "Since _____ 202x, safety information …"

Response   *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 48 line 12 add Editor's Note:
"Editor"s Note (to be removed prior to publication): Publication editor should edit "Since _____ 202x" in below NOTE with month and year of approval."

Page 48 line 13 change line to the following:
"NOTE—Since September 2011, maintenance changes are no longer being considered for this clause. Since _____ 202x, safety information is in J.2."

Cl **96**   *SC* **96.9.1**   *P* **84**   *L* **9**   # 13

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

With the editing instruction "change" you need to show the old text with "strikethrough" and the new text with "underline". Instead, I think you want to use "replace".

SuggestedRemedy

Change editing instruction to "Replace all text in 96.9.1 with the following text." Alternatively you can make the editing instruction "Delete all text in 96.9.1 and Insert the following text."

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change editing instruction to "Delete all text in 96.9.1 and Insert the following text."

Cl **97**   *SC* **97.9.1**   *P* **86**   *L* **9**   # 14

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

With the editing instruction "change" you need to show the old text with "strikethrough" and the new text with "underline". Instead, I think you want to use "replace".

SuggestedRemedy

Change editing instruction to "Replace all text in 96.9.1 with the following text." Alternatively you can make the editing instruction "Delete all text in 97.9.1 and Insert the following text."

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change editing instruction to "Delete all text in 97.9.1 and Insert the following text."

Cl **149**   *SC* **149**   *P* **119**   *L* **1**   # 15

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **A**

The text in 149 is identical to P802.3ch D3.2. As P802.3ch will be published prior to P802.3cr and P802.3cr is not making any changes to this, this Clause is not needed in cr.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete Clause 149 and all subclauses from P802.3cr.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **15**   Page 4 of 7
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   3/31/2020 11:04:02 AM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.9.1**   *P* **116**   *L* **14**   # 16

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

Not all the text that is being deleted by cr is shown in strikethrough.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "J.2 or IEC61010-1"
To: "J.2 (start strikethrough) IEC60950-1, IEC62368-1, (end strikethrough) or IEC61010-1"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.9.1**   *P* **116**   *L* **19**   # 17

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

The editor's note is no longer needed.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete Editor's Note.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.10.1**   *P* **118**   *L* **12**   # 18

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

Not all the text that is being deleted by cr is shown in strikethrough.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "J.2 or IEC61010-1"
To: "J.2 (start strikethrough) IEC60950-1, IEC62368-1, (end strikethrough) or IEC61010-1"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.10.1**   *P* **118**   *L* **17**   # 19

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

The editor's note is no longer needed.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete Editor's Note.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Duplicate of #17

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.10.1**   *P* **118**   *L* **12**   # 20

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

There is new text that is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline: "the general safety requirements in"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.10.1**   *P* **118**   *L* **13**   # 21

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *EZ*

There is new text that is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline: ",as appropriate"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **21**   Page 5 of 7
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   3/31/2020 11:04:02 AM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **146**　　*SC* **146.9.1**　　　　　　*P* **116**　　　*L* **14**　　　　# 22

Zimmerman, George　　　　　　　　CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTek

Comment Type **T**　　　*Comment Status* **D**

As written, this would bring in all the port isolation tests.　The change to clause 147 seems more appropriate here, incorporating just the general safety requirements in J.2.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "shall conform to J.2" to "shall conform to the general safety requirements in J.2". Change PICS item ES1 (page 117) feature to read the same.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **Z**

REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **146**　　*SC* **146.9.1**　　　　　　*P* **116**　　　*L* **12**　　　　# 23

Zimmerman, George　　　　　　　　CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTek

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　　　　　　　*EZ*

Editing instruction for the PICS has been used for 146.9.1, and the editing instruction for 146.9.1 is missing, along with strikeout and underline in 146.9.1

SuggestedRemedy

Move editing instruction "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 145.9.1 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" on P116 L12 to P117 L10, under 146.11.4.6 header
Add new editing instruction at P116 L12: "Change text in 146.9.1 as shown:"
Add text in strikeout, between (existing) "to " and (inserted) "J.2", "IEC 60950-1, IEC 62368-1,"

Response　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 116 Line 12 delete editing instruction "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 145.9.1 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" on P116 L12 to

Page 117 Line 10, add editing instruction: "Change PICS Item ES1 in the table in 146.11.4.6 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"

Add new editing instruction at P116 L12: "Change text in 146.9.1 as shown:"
Add text in strikeout, between (existing) "to " and (inserted) "J.2", "IEC 60950-1, IEC 62368-1,"

Cl **147**　　*SC* **147.10.1**　　　　　　*P* **118**　　　*L* **11**　　　　# 24

Zimmerman, George　　　　　　　　CME Cons/ADI, Cisco, CommScope, Marvell, SenTek

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　　　　　　　*EZ*

147.10.1 needs editing instruction (I understand an other commenter has dealt with strikeout & underline)

SuggestedRemedy

Add new editing instruction at P118 L11 (after header for 147.10.1) "Change text of 147.10.1 as shown:"

Response　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　　　　*P* **11**　　　*L* **3**　　　　# 25

Maguire, Valerie　　　　　　　　The Siemon Company

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **A**

The text, "and its amendments," is not used when describing 802.3bt, 802.3cd, 802.3cn, 802.3cq, 802.3cm, and 802.3cr. Consider with other related Maguire comment. Note: this comment was also submitted against 802.3cv (please coordinate resolution with TG Chair).

SuggestedRemedy

Preferred resolution: Delete "and its amendments," from the clause. Alternately, you could add "and its amendments" to the 802.3bt, 802.3cd, 802.3cn, 802.3cq, 802.3cm, and 802.3cr text, but I don't think a comma is supposed to go after the word "amendments".

Response　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete "and its amendments," from page 11 line 3.

Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　　　　*P* **10**　　　*L* **30**　　　　# 26

Maguire, Valerie　　　　　　　　The Siemon Company

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **A**

802.3cb is the first amendment to 802.3, so it's not changing "IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and its amendments". Consider with other related Maguire comment. Note: this comment was also submitted against 802.3cv (please coordinate resolution with TG Chair).

SuggestedRemedy

Delete, "and its amendments,"

Response　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **26**

Page 6 of 7
3/31/2020 11:04:02 AM

Cl **J**   *SC* **J.1**   *P* **123**   *L* **18**   # 27

Maguire, Valerie   The Siemon Company

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**

It seems as though a definite article ("The") is not needed here. Start the clause with, "Electrical isolation shall…"

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the underlined word "The", extend the strikeout under the word "This" to the next empty space, add an "E" in underline immediately before the start of the word "electrical", add a strikeout to the "e" in "electrical".

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change line as follows:
"The electrical isolation…"
to
"Electrical isolation…"

Cl **9**   *SC* **9**   *P* **28**   *L* **5**   # 28

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**   *LATE*

Sub-clause 9.9 is missing between Clause 9 and sub-clause 9.9.3.

SuggestedRemedy

Before 9.9.3 add "9.9 Medium attachment unit and baseband medium specification for a vendor-independent FOIRL"

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **112**   *SC* **112.11**   *P* **93**   *L* **5**   # 29

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors Company

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**   *LATE*

Sub-clause112.11.4 is missing between sub-clause 112.11 and sub-clause 112.11.4.5.

SuggestedRemedy

Before 112.11.4.5 add "112.11.4 PICS proforma tables for Physical Medium Dependent (PMD) sublayer and medium, type 25GBASE-SR"

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **29**   Page 7 of 7
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   3/31/2020 11:04:02 AM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID