

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 150 SC 150 P119 L1 # 22
 Anslow, Pete Self
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "P802.3cm" should be "IEEE Std 802.3cm-2020"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "P802.3cm" to "IEEE Std 802.3cm-2020"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI J SC J.3 P122 L1 # 23
 Anslow, Pete Self
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 The PICS proforma in J.3 is not formatted correctly.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the title of J.3 to "Protocol implementation conformance statement (PICS) proforma for Annex J, Electrical isolation and general safety"
 Apply the following footnote to the end of this title: "Copyright release for PICS proformas: Users of this standard may freely reproduce the PICS proforma in this subclause so that it can be used for its intended purpose and may further publish the completed PICS."
 Insert before the existing J.3.1 sections for:
 J.3.1 Introduction
 J.3.2 Identification
 J.3.2.1 Implementation identification
 J.3.2.2 Protocol summary
 as per the PICS in the 802.3 FrameMaker template
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change the title of J.3 to "Protocol implementation conformance statement (PICS) proforma for Annex J, Electrical isolation and general safety"
 Apply the following footnote to the end of this title: "Copyright release for PICS proformas: Users of this standard may freely reproduce the PICS proforma in this subclause so that it can be used for its intended purpose and may further publish the completed PICS."
 Insert before the existing J.3.1 sections for:
 J.3.1 Introduction
 J.3.2 Identification
 J.3.2.1 Implementation identification
 J.3.2.2 Protocol summary
 as per the PICS in the 802.3 FrameMaker template
 Editorial license granted to align PICs with publication editor guidelines.

CI FM SC FM P1 L23 # 24
 Anslow, Pete Self
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 IEEE Std 802.3cq-2020 and IEEE Std 802.3cm-2020 are now published.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change all instances of "IEEE Std 802.3cq-20xx" to " IEEE Std 802.3cq-2020"
 Change all instances of "IEEE Std 802.3cm-20xx" to " IEEE Std 802.3cm-2020"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P11 L23 # 25
 Anslow, Pete Self
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 In ""Information technology equipment - Safety - Part 1:" the two instances of " - " (space hyphen space) should be em dashes.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Information technology equipment - Safety - Part 1:" to "Information technology equipment<em dash>Safety<em dash>Part 1:"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 8 SC 8.8.6.11 P27 L8 # 26
 Anslow, Pete Self
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 The editing instruction is specific to item 2, but the whole table is shown.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Either:
 Change the editing instruction to "Change the table in 8.8.6.11 as follows:"
 or:
 Change the editing instruction to "Change Item 2 in the table in 8.8.6.11 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"
 Replace the row for Item 1 with a row containing only an ellipsis
 Replace the rows for Items 3 and 4 with a row containing only an ellipsis
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change the editing instruction to "Change the table in 8.8.6.11 as follows:"

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 104 SC 104.8.1 P90 L9 # 27

Anslow, Pete Self

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

The deleted text in this paragraph is not shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Show the deleted text in strikethrough font.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add strikethrough text "IEC 60950-1" after "J.2" in the first sentence.

Add strikethrough text "IEC 60950-1" after "2018" in the second sentence.

CI FM SC FM P1 L23 # 28

Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

802.3cq-2020 and 802.3cm-2020 have been published

SuggestedRemedy

Change "802.3cq-20XX and 802.3cm-20XX" to "802.3cq-2020 and 802.3cm-2020" throughout the document

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 32 SC 32.6.1.1 P39 L22 # 29

Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Safety information is in J.2 not J.1

SuggestedRemedy

Change J.1 to J.2

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE by Comment 66

Text is incorrect but the Annex section is correct as this section is about Electrical Isolation.

Proposed response for Comment 66 is:

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE

Change "safety information is in J.1" to "electrical isolation requirements are in J.1"

CI 38 SC 38.7.1 P43 L12 # 30

Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

This subclause is about safety

SuggestedRemedy

Change text to "All equipment subject to this clause shall conform to the general safety requirements as specified in J.2."

Response Response Status W

ACCEPT.

CI 38 SC 38.12.4.1 P44 L21 # 31

Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems

Comment Type E Comment Status A

This subclause is about safety

SuggestedRemedy

Change feature name to "General safety"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 146 SC 146.11.4.6 P117 L16 # 32

Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Change feature name to "General safety" make comment "Conforms to J.2"

SuggestedRemedy

Change feature name to "General safety" make comment "Conforms to J.2"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change feature name to "General Safety"

Change Value/Comment to "Conform to J.2 or IEC 61010-1, as appropriate"

with editorial license for strikethrough/underline as needed.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 8 SC 8.8.6.8 P26 L15 # 33
 Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Systems
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 Isolation is specified in J.1 not J.2
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change J.2 to J.1
 Response Response Status W
 ACCEPT.

Cl FM SC FM P11 L6 # 34
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 IEEE Std 802.3ca will be approved prior to cr.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add "IEEE Std 802.3ca™-20xx Amendment y—This amendment to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 extends the operation of Ethernet Passive Optical Networks (EPONs) to multiple channels of 25 Gb/s providing both symmetric and asymmetric operation for the following data rates (downstream/upstream): 25/10 Gb/s, 25/25 Gb/s, 50/10 Gb/s, 50/25 Gb/s, and 50/50 Gb/s. This amendment specifies the 25 Gb/s EPON Multi-Channel Reconciliation Sublayer (MCRS), 25GBASE-Nx25G-EPON PHYSical Coding Sublayers (PCSs), Physical Media Attachments (PMAs), and Physical Medium Dependent sublayers (PMDs) that support both symmetric and asymmetric data rates while maintaining backward compatibility with already deployed 10 Gb/s EPON equipment. The EPON operation is defined for distances of at least 20 km, and for a split ratio of at least 1:32."
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add "IEEE Std 802.3ca™-20xx Amendment 9—This amendment to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 extends the operation of Ethernet Passive Optical Networks (EPONs) to multiple channels of 25 Gb/s providing both symmetric and asymmetric operation for the following data rates (downstream/upstream): 25/10 Gb/s, 25/25 Gb/s, 50/10 Gb/s, 50/25 Gb/s, and 50/50 Gb/s. This amendment specifies the 25 Gb/s EPON Multi-Channel Reconciliation Sublayer (MCRS), 25GBASE-Nx25G-EPON PHYSical Coding Sublayers (PCSs), Physical Media Attachments (PMAs), and Physical Medium Dependent sublayers (PMDs) that support both symmetric and asymmetric data rates while maintaining backward compatibility with already deployed 10 Gb/s EPON equipment. The EPON operation is defined for distances of at least 20 km, and for a split ratio of at least 1:32."

Cl 25 SC 25.6.4.2 P37 L10 # 35
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Incomplete Editors instrucion.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change " Change Table as follows:" to "Change Table as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 25 SC 25.6.4.2 P37 L15 # 36
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Need a row to show the unchanged rows.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert a row under the heading row of the table. "Stradle" the columns in the row. Add an elipses (...) in the row.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 38 SC 38.7.1 P43 L12 # 37
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 General safety requirements are in J.2, not isolation.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "isolation" to "general safety"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Resolved with Comment 30.
 Resolution to Comment 30 is:
 ACCEPT
 Suggested Remedy from Comment 30 is:
 "Change text to "All equipment subject to this clause shall conform to the general safety requirements as specified in J.2.""

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4.1 P44 L21 # 38
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Electrical Isolation" to "General safety"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 58 SC 58.8.1 P55 L12 # 41
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Added text is not underlined.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 42 SC 42.12.10 P47 L10 # 39
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Need a row to show the unchanged rows.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert a row under the last row in the table. "Stradle" the columns in the row. Add an
 elipses (...) in the row.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 59 SC 59.8.1 P57 L12 # 42
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Added text is not underlined.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 53 SC 53.15.4.5 P52 L14 # 40
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Need a row to show the unchanged rows before the changed row.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert a row under the heading row of the table. "Stradle" the columns in the row. Add an
 elipses (...) in the row.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.1 P59 L12 # 43
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Added text is not underlined.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 75 SC 75.8.1 P66 L11 # 44
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Added text is not underlined.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 80 SC 80.4.10 P68 L11 # 45
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Added text is not underlined.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 88 SC 88.9.1 P74 L11 # 49
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Added text is not underlined.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 84 SC 84.11.4.5 P69 L19 # 46
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 An unchanged row is shown.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete "ES2" row.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 89 SC 89.8.1 P76 L11 # 50
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Added text is not underlined.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 86 SC 86.9.1 P70 L11 # 47
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Added text is not underlined.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 95 SC 95.9.1 P82 L11 # 51
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Added text is not underlined.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 87 SC 87.9.1 P72 L11 # 48
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Added text is not underlined.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 96 SC 96.11.4.9 P85 L10 # 52

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

Incorrect Editor's instruction. The PICS Item is now being deleted so the remaining items need to be renumbered.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the Editor's instruction to: Delete row for ES1 (renumber subsequent rows appropriately) as follows (unchanged rows not shown):

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 97 SC 97.11.13 P87 L7 # 53

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

Needs to also include the instruction to renumber.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the Editor's instruction to: Delete row for ES1 (renumber subsequent rows appropriately) as follows (unchanged rows not shown):

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 100 SC 100.5.1 P88 L11 # 54

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

Added text is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.8.1 P90 L10 # 55

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

Deleted text is not shown in strikethrough.

SuggestedRemedy

Before J.2, add this text in strikethrough "IEC 60950-1". Add this same text in strikethrough before Annex Q.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.9.4.8 P91 L19 # 56

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

Deleted text is not shown in strikethrough.

SuggestedRemedy

Before Annex Q, add this text in strikethrough "IEC 60950-1".

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 112 SC 112.8.1 P92 L11 # 57

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

Added text is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 112 SC 112.8.1 P94 L31 # 58

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company

Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ

Added text is not underlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 126 SC 126.9.1 P98 L31 # 59
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Added text is not underlined.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 128 SC 128.9.1 P100 L11 # 60
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Added text is not underlined.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified in"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 130 SC 130.9.1 P102 L12 # 61
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Added text is not underlined and removed text is not shown in strikethrough.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "the general safety requirements in"
 Also, after J.2 and before IEC, add the following text in strikethrough "applicable sections (including isolation requirements) of"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 145 SC 145.6.1 P114 L7 # 62
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Removed text is not shown in strikethrough.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Before (or after) J.2 add in strikethrough "IEC 60950-1 or IEC 62368-1".
 Before Annex Q add in strikethrough "IEC 60950-1 or".
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 130 SC 130 P102 L1 # 63
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Needs a note to say how Clause 130 was added as it is not part of IEEE Std 802.3-2018.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add before the start of the Clause "Clause 130 was added by IEEE Std 802.3cb-2018"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 128 SC 128 P100 L1 # 64
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Needs a note to say how Clause 128 was added as it is not part of IEEE Std 802.3-2018.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add before the start of the Clause "Clause 128 was added by IEEE Std 802.3cb-2018"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 86A SC 86A.7.1 P127 L17 # 65
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Added text is not underlined.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "to the general safety requirements as specified"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cr D2.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 32 SC 32.6.1.1 P39 L22 # 66
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 typo - J.1 contains electrical isolation not safety
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "safety information is in J.1" to "electrical isolation requirements are".
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change "safety information is in J.1" to "electrical isolation requirements are in J.1"

CI FM SC FM P11 L6 # 69
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 IEEE Std 802.3ch will be approved prior to cr.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add "IEEE Std 802.3ch™-20xx
 Amendment x—This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and adds Clause 149 and Annex 149A, Annex 149B, and Annex 149C. This amendment adds physical layer specifications and management parameters for operation at 2.5 Gb/s, 5 Gb/s, and 10 Gb/s over a single balanced pair of conductors."
 Response Response Status C

CI FM SC FM P1 L23 # 67
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 802.3cq was approved in 2020
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "802.3cq-20xx" to "802.3cq-2020" also on P11 L6
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Add "IEEE Std 802.3ch™-20xx
 Amendment 8—This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and adds Clause 149 and Annex 149A, Annex 149B, and Annex 149C. This amendment adds physical layer specifications and management parameters for operation at 2.5 Gb/s, 5 Gb/s, and 10 Gb/s over a single balanced pair of conductors."

CI FM SC FM P1 L23 # 68
 Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 802.3cm was approved in 2020
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "802.3cm-20xx" to "802.3cm-2020" also on P11 L12
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.