

IEEE P802.3cr D3.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

<i>CI</i>	FM	<i>SC</i>	FM	<i>P</i>	13	<i>L</i>	43	#	R2-1
Thompson, Geoffrey		GraCaSI S.A.							
<i>Comment Type</i>	ER	<i>Comment Status</i>	A						
Isolation misspelled									
<i>SuggestedRemedy</i>									
Remove one of the eyes									
<i>Response</i>	<i>Response Status</i>		C						
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.									
Page 31 line 8: Add editing instruction prior to 14.3.1.1 "Replace title of subclause 14.3.1.1 as follows" Replace title of 14.3.1.1 with "Electrical isolation"									

<i>CI</i>	FM	<i>SC</i>	FM	<i>P</i>	14	<i>L</i>	48	#	R2-3
Thompson, Geoffrey		GraCaSI S.A.							
<i>Comment Type</i>	ER	<i>Comment Status</i>	A						
Isolation misspelled									
<i>SuggestedRemedy</i>									
Remove one of the eyes									
<i>Response</i>	<i>Response Status</i>		C						
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.									
Page 40 line 6: Add editing instruction prior to 33.4.1 "Replace title of subclause 33.4.1 as follows" Replace title of 33.4.1 with "Electrical isolation"									

<i>CI</i>	FM	<i>SC</i>	FM	<i>P</i>	13	<i>L</i>	51	#	R2-2
Thompson, Geoffrey		GraCaSI S.A.							
<i>Comment Type</i>	ER	<i>Comment Status</i>	A						
Isolation misspelled									
<i>SuggestedRemedy</i>									
Remove one of the eyes									
<i>Response</i>	<i>Response Status</i>		C						
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.									
Page 31 line 48: Add editing instruction prior to 14.10.4.5.11 "Replace title of subclause 14.10.4.5.11 as follows" Replace title of 14.10.4.5.11 with "Electrical isolation"									

<i>CI</i>	FM	<i>SC</i>	FM	<i>P</i>	15	<i>L</i>	22	#	R2-4
Thompson, Geoffrey		GraCaSI S.A.							
<i>Comment Type</i>	ER	<i>Comment Status</i>	A						
Isolation misspelled									
<i>SuggestedRemedy</i>									
Remove one of the eyes									
<i>Response</i>	<i>Response Status</i>		C						
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.									
Page 45 line 8: Add editing instruction prior to 40.6.1.1 "Replace title of subclause 40.6.1.1 as follows" Replace title of 40.6.1.1 with "Electrical isolation"									

IEEE P802.3cr D3.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

CI **FM** SC **FM** P16 L10 # R2-5
 Thompson, Geoffrey GraCaSI S.A.
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A**
 Isolation misspelled
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove one of the eyes
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Page 53 line 6:
 Add editing instruction prior to 55.5.1 "Replace title of subclause 55.5.1 as follows"
 Replace title of 55.5.1 with "Electrical isolation"

CI **14** SC **14.3.1.1** P31 L9 # R2-8
 Thompson, Geoffrey GraCaSI S.A.
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A**
 Change as shown in COMPARE version does not match change shown in CLEAN version.
 COMPARE version shows edit as whole word changes. CLEAN version shows edit as a
 character change.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Consistently use whole word edits in both documents.
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Will be professionally edited prior to publication. Comments should also be created based
 on the clean version of the draft which is correct.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P20 L23 # R2-6
 Thompson, Geoffrey GraCaSI S.A.
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A**
 Isolation misspelled
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove one of the eyes
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Page 94 line 6:
 Add editing instruction prior to 113.5.1 "Replace title of subclause 113.5.1 as follows"
 Replace title of 113.5.1 with "Electrical isolation"

CI **14** SC **14.10.4.5.11** P31 L49 # R2-9
 Thompson, Geoffrey GraCaSI S.A.
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A**
 Change as shown in COMPARE version does not match change shown in CLEAN version.
 COMPARE version shows edit as whole word changes. CLEAN version shows edit as a
 character change.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Consistently use whole word edits in both documents.
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Will be professionally edited prior to publication. Comments should also be created based
 on the clean version of the draft which is correct.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P20 L49 # R2-7
 Thompson, Geoffrey GraCaSI S.A.
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A**
 Isolation misspelled
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove one of the eyes
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Page 98 line 6:
 Add editing instruction prior to 126.5.1 "Replace title of subclause 126.5.1 as follows"
 Replace title of 126.5.1 with "Electrical isolation"

IEEE P802.3cr D3.2 Maintenance #14: Isolation 2nd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

Cl 15 SC 15.3.4 P33 L11 # R2-10

Thompson, Geoffrey GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type T Comment Status R

FOR DISCUSSION IN TF: Note that this is a media spec. whereas all (?) others are equipment specs. Note that there is an MDI to MDI for MAU isolation requirement with no specs. It would be a MAU spec if it said "socket" instead of "plug."

SuggestedRemedy

Just want to make sure we are doing the right thing here, lumping eqpt. Specs & media specs together.

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

The suggested remedy did not propose sufficient details on the changes necessary to the draft. The CRG discussed this comment and determined no change to the draft was necessary.

Cl 33 SC 33.4.1 P40 L7 # R2-11

Thompson, Geoffrey GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Change as shown in COMPARE version does not match change shown in CLEAN version. COMPARE version shows edit as both whole word change and letter change and shows wrong sub-clause number. CLEAN version shows edit as a character change.

SuggestedRemedy

Consistently use whole word edits in both documents.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Will be professionally edited prior to publication. Comments should also be created based on the clean version of the draft which is correct.

Cl 33 SC 33.4.1 P40 L17 # R2-12

Thompson, Geoffrey GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

This text does not meet the project goal of consolidating the isolation test specs in a normative annex.

SuggestedRemedy

Move spec portion of the text to Annex so both (all 3?) PoE specs can point to the same text

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add Note in J.1 on page 120, line 27 that is indented to the same level as item c

Note to J.1, item c "NOTE "em-dash" If the MDI is also a Clause 33 or Clause 145 PI then see 33.4.1 or 145.4.1 for specific requirements associated with option c."

Page 120, line 33. Change "NOTE: IEEE Std ..." to "NOTE "em-dash" IEEE Std ..."

Cl 33 SC 33.8.3.4 P41 L14 # R2-13

Thompson, Geoffrey GraCaSI S.A.

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

Tests in table do not point to currents tests in 33.4.1 (which should be moved).

SuggestedRemedy

Make PICS consistent with body text in 33.4.1

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 41 line 14: Change Value/Comment field of EL1 to: "Conforms to J.1 with electrical strength test c) details as specified in 33.4.1"

Page 114 line 5: bring in PICS EL2 to EL4 from 145.7.3.3 from IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018
 Add editing instruction "Change PICS Item EL2, delete PICS Items EL3 and EL4, renumber remaining rows in the table in 145.7.3.3 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"
 Change Value/Comment for PICS EL2 to "Conforms to J.1 with electrical strength test c) details as specified in 145.4.1"
 Strikethrough text for EL3 and EL4
 Add "..." at the beginning and end rows of the table