

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cs D3.2 SuperPON Task Force 2nd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

CI **FM** SC **FM** P **13** L **7** # **R2-13**
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 P802.3de is not assigned Amendment 3 (it is assigned Amendment 6).
SuggestedRemedy
 Delete Amendment 3 description. (The commenter believes this comment is non-substantive and qualified to be passed to the Publication editor for consideration during publication preparation.)
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **0** SC **0** P L # **R2-25**
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **GR** Comment Status **D**
 Base text needs to be verified by other reviewers. The number and substance of existing differences needs to be remedied to avoid reintroducing what is now modified content from the current revision project.
SuggestedRemedy
 Check and update base text per specific comments and from any other differences found during review.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **1** SC **1.4.543c** P **21** L **52** # **R2-14**
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 Apparently this D3.0 comment somehow got dropped (or I failed to properly submit the second comment file.) Wrong insert point, should be 197a.
SuggestedRemedy
 Create editing instruction to insert after 1.4.197 arbitration (move definition to proper subclause number). Renumber as 1.4.197a.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Inserted editorial instruction "Insert the following new definitions after 1.4.197 "arbitration":
 on page 21, line 51 and renumbered 1.4.543c to 1.4.197a

CI **30** SC **30.3.2.1.2** P **23** L **12** # **R2-15**
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D**
 P802.3 sort order for aPhyType was clarified to be: 1. increasing rate, 2. Alphanumeric (see P802.3/D3.0, #i-51). Sort order for x/y data rate in P802.3/D3.2 appears to ignore the "/" and put x/y data rates at the top of the x rate list (the y rate alphanumerically coming before the "B" of BASE).
SuggestedRemedy
 The correct order would be 10/1GBASE-PRS (P802.3/D3.2), 10/2.5GBASE-SP (P802.3cs), 10GBASE-PR (P802.3/D3.2), 10GBASE-SP (P802.3cs). This requires changing the order in the draft and adding a second editing instruction.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Changed content of 30.3.2.1.2 to read as follows:
 Insert new entries in the APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section of 30.3.2.1.2 after the entry for 10/1GBASE-PRS as follows:
 10/2.5GBASE-SP 164.3 10 Gb/s downstream and 2.5 Gb/s upstream Super-PON 256B/257B
 Insert new entries in the APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section of 30.3.2.1.2 after the entry for 10GBASE-PR as follows:
 10GBASE-SP 164.3 10 Gb/s Super-PON 256B/257B

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cs D3.2 SuperPON Task Force 2nd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

CI 30 SC 30.3.2.1.2 P23 L 20 # R2-16

Grow, Robert

RMG Consulting

Comment Type ER Comment Status D

P802.3 sort order for aPhyTypeList was clarified to be: 1. increasing rate, 2. Alphanumeric (see P802.3/D3.0, #-51). Sort order for x/y data rate in P802.3/D3.2 appears to ignore the "/" and put x/y data rates at the top of the x rate list (the y rate alphanumerically coming before the "B" of BASE).

SuggestedRemedy

The correct order would be 10/1GBASE-PRS (P802.3/D3.2), 10/2.5GBASE-SP (P802.3cs), 10GBASE-PR (P802.3/D3.2), 10GBASE-SP (P802.3cs). This requires changing the order in the draft and adding a second editing instruction.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Changed content of 30.3.2.1.3 to read as follows:

Insert new entries in the APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section of 30.3.2.1.3 after the entry for 10/1GBASE-PRS as follows:

10/2.5GBASE-SP 164.3 10 Gb/s downstream and 2.5 Gb/s upstream Super-PON 256B/257B

Insert new entries in the APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section of 30.3.2.1.3 after the entry for 10GBASE-PR as follows:

10GBASE-SP 164.3 10 Gb/s Super-PON 256B/257B

CI 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P24 L 19 # R2-17

Grow, Robert

RMG Consulting

Comment Type ER Comment Status D

P802.3 sort order for aMAUTypeList was clarified to be: 1. increasing rate, 2. Alphanumeric (see P802.3/D3.0, #-51). Sort order for x/y data rate in P802.3/D3.2 appears to ignore the "/" and put x/y data rates at the top of the x rate list (the y rate alphanumerically coming before the "B" of BASE).

SuggestedRemedy

10/2.5GBASE-SP1-Dx and 10/2.5GBASE-SP1-Uxy should be inserted after 10/1GBASE-PRX-U4. A new editing instruction then needs to be created to insert 10GBASE-SP1-Dx and 10GBASE-SP1-Uxy after 10GBASE-R.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Changed content of 30.5.1.1.2 to read as follows:

Insert new entries in the APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section of 30.5.1.1.2 after the entry for 10/1GBASE-PRX-U4 as follows:

10/2.5GBASE-SP1-Dx One single-mode fiber 10.3125 GBd continuous downstream / 2.578125 GBd burst mode upstream OLT PHY supporting channel x of Super-PON FSR set 1, as specified in 164.2
10/2.5GBASE-SP1-Uxy One single-mode fiber 10.3125 GBd continuous downstream / 2.578125 GBd burst mode upstream ONU PHY supporting channels x to y of Super-PON FSR set 1, as specified in 164.2

Insert new entries in the APPROPRIATE SYNTAX section of 30.5.1.1.2 after the entry for 10GBASE-R as follows:

10GBASE-SP1-Dx One single-mode fiber 10.3125 GBd continuous downstream / 10.3125 GBd burst mode upstream OLT PHY supporting channel x of Super-PON FSR set 1, as specified in 164.2
10GBASE-SP1-Uxy One single-mode fiber 10.3125 GBd continuous downstream / 10.3125 GBd burst mode upstream ONU PHY supporting channels x to y of Super-PON FSR set 1, as specified in 164.2

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cs D3.2 SuperPON Task Force 2nd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

CI 45 SC 45.2 P25 L 5 # R2-18
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Base text error.
 SuggestedRemedy
 P802.3/D3.2 has this as "MDI Interface registers"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.27.2 P25 L 51 # R2-19
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Base text error.
 SuggestedRemedy
 P802.3/D3.2 has lower case registers ("(registers 1.1000...").
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Changed all 12 instances of "(Register" to "(register"

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.42 P32 L 23 # R2-20
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D
 Unmarked change that probably should have been fixed in P802.3. Both Registers 3.78 and 3.79 are listed as "lower" in P802.3/D3.2.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Register 3.79.15:0 under name should have a strikethrough "lower" and "upper" in underscore.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Changed the register name from "uncorrected FEC codewords upper" to "uncorrected FEC codewords lower" (correct name per P802.3/D3.2.
 Changed description from "uncorrected_FEC_codeords_counter" to "uncorrected_FEC_codewords_counter" (fixing typo)

CI 45 SC 45.2.3.43 P32 L 45 # R2-21
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Base text error, the word "timer" (Name column) does not appear in P802.3/D3.2.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete strikethrough "timer" in Name column.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 56 SC 56.1 P36 L 5 # R2-22
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Base text error. The proposed change is now to the third paragraph of P802.3/D3.2, 56.1.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change instruction third paragraph and update base text (delete the first sentence as it is now a stand alone paragraph 2).
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Deleted two first sentences in 56.1.
 Changed editing instructions to "Change the third paragraph in 56.1 as follows:"

CI 56 SC 56.1.2.1 P36 L 50 # R2-23
 Grow, Robert RMG Consulting
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Base text error. "Figure 56-2" does not appear in P802.3/D3.2, "and Figure 56-7" is in P802.3/D3.2 but not in the base text in this draft. Strikethrough "and" also appears with Figure 56-7 rather than where it is here as base text.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Correct base text and change mark appropriately.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Changed text "in Figure 56-2, Figure 56-3, Figure 56-4,<strike> and</strike> Figure 56-5<underline>, and Figure 56-7a</underline>" to read "in Figure 56-3, Figure 56-4, Figure 56-5,<strike> and</strike> Figure 56-7<underline>, and Figure 56-7a</underline>"

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cs D3.2 SuperPON Task Force 2nd Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

<i>Cl</i> 56	<i>SC</i> 56.1.3	<i>P</i> 38	<i>L</i> 18	<i>#</i> R2-24
---------------------	-------------------------	--------------------	--------------------	-----------------------

Grow, Robert RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D**

It is not clear if the new paragraph is to be inserted before or after the lettered list.

SuggestedRemedy

Clarify insert point.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Changed editorial instructions on page 38 line 18 to read "Insert a new paragraph in 56.1.3 after the paragraph "All 10G-EPON PMDs are defined in Clause 75.""