Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P*   *L*   # **R3-1**

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*

The publication editor should be made aware of some front matter items that she or he would likely catch, but just in case I propose this comment be passed to the publication editor.

SuggestedRemedy

1. Presumably, the publication editor will get the amendment list correct. P802.3de is currently targeted to be Amdnement 6 and should not appear in the list.
2. Mandated frontmatter in this draft is not current and should be updated (e.g., opening paragraphs, through page 7 where IMPORTANT NOTICE is missing).
3. Front matter Introduction -- P802.3/D3.2 includes minor editorial differences in its Introduction (e.g., "EtherType" capitalization currently preferred by the RAC, grammar change to Section Nine text, etc.)

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Draft frontmatter was updated to the latest frontmatter from P802.3/D3.2

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **1**   *L* **28**   # **R3-4**

Brown, Matthew   Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*

802.3de is Amendment 6, while 802.3cs is Amendment 2 so the former should not be listed here.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete ", and IEEE Std 802.3de-20xx"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **0**   *SC* **0**   *P* **0**   *L* **0**   # **R3-14**

Brown, Matthew   Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

The page footer is inconsistent with the amendment template. The page number should always be in the cent above the text "Copyright © 2022 IEEE. All rights reserved. This is an unapproved IEEE Standards draft, subject to change." Whereas, in some clauses the page number is right justified and sometimes is left justified.

SuggestedRemedy

Align the page footer format with the latest amendment template.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **0**   *SC* **0**   *P* **0**   *L* **0**   # **R3-12**

Brown, Matthew   Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

Many figures use font size and/or font type that are inconsistent with the style guide. The style guide recommends Arial font type and 9 pt font size (alternate 8 or 10).

SuggestedRemedy

Check all figures and set all text to Arial 9 pt.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Figures were validated and confirmed to be consistent with the style manual, less figures covered under comments R3-6, R3-7, and R3-9

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.4**   *P* **21**   *L* **8**   # **R3-2**

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*

Something likely to be caught in publication preparation, but just in case pass to publication ecitor.

SuggestedRemedy

"Update" is not a defined editing instruction, should be "Change".

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.5**   *P* **22**   *L* **9**   # **R3-5**

Brown, Matthew   Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*

The paragraph format is incorrect and there should be no colon.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove colons and apply correct paragraph format.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **1**   Page 1 of 3
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *SC* **1.5**   5/19/2022 12:28:59 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.1.2.27**   *P* **25**   *L* **22**   # R3-3

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

The response to Comment #R2-19 went too far. The changes are not consistent with the decisions on capitalization of "Register" on P802.3/D3.0 (maintained through D3.2). It is an IEEE editorial decision if in the subclause titles "(Register x.y)" should be capitalized as it is in P802.3/D3.2 or if publication will change the capitalization to "(register x.y)" as in this draft. (While I disagreed with this P802.3 decision, consistency is more important.) Because this capitalization could be changed in IEEE Std 802.3-202x publication, this comment should be referred to the IEEE Std 802.3cs publication editor. (It is unlikely that the new revision will be published prior to submission of this Amendment to RevCom.)

SuggestedRemedy

In publication preparation, assure capitalization of "(register 1.29 is consistent with IEEE Std 802.3-202x. Similar for page 28, line 1 "(register 1.1003)"; page 29, line 35 "(register 3.0)" (not the base text in P802.3/D3.2); page 29, line 40 "(register 3.7)" (not the base text in P802.3/D3.2); page 31, line 4 "(register 3.9)" (not the base text in P802.3/D3.2); page 31, line 42 "(register 3.76, 3.77)" (not the base text in P802.3/D3.2); page 31, line 50 "(register 3.78, 3.79)" (not the base text in P802.3/D3.2); and page 32, line 33 "(register 3.80)" (not the base text in P802.3/D3.2).

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.3.42**   *P* **32**   *L* **15**   # R3-15

DeSanti, Claudio   Dell

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*

Comment R2-20 has been resolved correctly, this editor's note can be removed.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the editor's note.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56**   *P* **36**   *L* **60**   # R3-13

Brown, Matthew   Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*

There are two pages with page number 36 printed at the bottom. Thus for pages after the actual page 36 there is a one page difference between the actual page number and the page number printed at the bottom of the page.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix the page numbering.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **164**   *SC* **164.1**   *P* **41**   *L* **23**   # R3-6

Brown, Matthew   Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **R**

Font size and font type are inconsistent throughout diagarm. The style guide recommends Arial font type and 9 pt font size.

SuggestedRemedy

Set all text to Arial 9 pt.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

REJECT.

Font size increase would make the figure not fit into the page size or require horizontal placement

---

Cl **164**   *SC* **164.2.4.2**   *P* **46**   *L* **16**   # R3-7

Brown, Matthew   Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **R**

Font size is inconsistent throughout diagarm. The style guide recommends 9 pt font size.

SuggestedRemedy

Set all text to Arial 9 pt.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

REJECT.

Font size increase would make the figure not fit into the page size or require horizontal placement

---

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line   *Cl* **164**   *SC* **164.2.4.2**   Page 2 of 3   5/19/2022 12:28:59 PM

Cl **164**   *SC* **164.3.2**   *P* **67**   *L* **37**   # R3-8

Brown, Matthew   Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*

Note should be followed by em dash not regular dash.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Note<regular dash>" to "Note<em dash>"

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **164**   *SC* **164.4.4.7**   *P* **77**   *L* **22**   # R3-9

Brown, Matthew   Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **R**

Font size and font type are not inconsistent with style guide. The style guide recommends Arial font type and 9 pt font size. The font type appears to be Calibri.

SuggestedRemedy

Set all text to Arial 9 pt.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

REJECT.

Figure was adapted from the published IEEE Std 802.3ca with Tx/Rx speed changes only.

Cl **164A**   *SC* **164A.5.3**   *P* **104**   *L* **15**   # R3-10

Brown, Matthew   Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**   *bucket*

Graph messy and difficult to read with x-axis labels in the middle of the graph.

SuggestedRemedy

Move the x-axis to the lowest y-axis value (-10) so that the x-axis labels are below the graph.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **164A**   *SC* **164A.5.3**   *P* **105**   *L* **15**   # R3-11

Brown, Matthew   Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Graph messy and difficult to read with x-axis and y-axis labels in the middle of the graph.

SuggestedRemedy

Move the x-axis to the lowest y-axis value (-2) so that the x-axis labels are below the graph. Move the y-axis to the leftmost x-axis value (-1200) so that the y-axis labels are to the left of the graph.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **164A**   Page 3 of 3
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *SC* **164A.5.3**   5/19/2022 12:28:59 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line