

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.3 SuperPON Task Force 10th Task Force review comments

CI 00 SC 0 P L # 627
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Clause 56 updates are missing
 SuggestedRemedy
 A document will be submitted
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 No contribution available at this time

CI 00 SC 0 P L # 617
 Du, Liang Amazon
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Add Annex C to describe how to measure transient wavelength excursion.
 SuggestedRemedy
 A document will be submitted
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 No contribution available at this time

CI 00 SC 0 P L # 626
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Clause 45 updates are missing
 SuggestedRemedy
 A document will be submitted
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 No contribution available at this time

CI 00 SC 0 P L # 628
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Clause 67 updates are missing
 SuggestedRemedy
 A document will be submitted
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 No contribution available at this time

CI 00 SC 0 P L # 625
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Clause 30 updates are missing
 SuggestedRemedy
 A document will be submitted
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 No contribution available at this time

CI 00 SC 0 P3 L # 619
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Missing Abstract
 SuggestedRemedy
 This amendment to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 extends the operation of Ethernet passive optical networks (EPONs) to Super-PON optical subscriber access networks. Super-PON supports an increased optical reach of up to 50 km and an expanded customer coverage of up to 1024 subscribers over a point-to-multipoint passive optical distribution network (ODN) through wavelength division multiplexing (WDM). The defining element of a Super-PON optical distribution network (ODN) is the presence of a passive wavelength router that determines the channels supported by the ODN. This standard specifies the Super-PON Reconciliation Sublayer (RS), Physical Coding Sublayer (PCS), Physical Media Attachment (PMA) sublayer, and Physical Medium Dependent (PMD) sublayer at a MAC data rate of 10 Gb/s in the downstream direction and of 10 Gb/s or 2.5 Gb/s in the upstream direction.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.3 SuperPON Task Force 10th Task Force review comments

Cl 00 SC 0 P3 L # 620
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Missing Keywords
 SuggestedRemedy
 Super-PON, IEEE 802.3™, IEEE 802.3cs™, Optical Distribution Network (ODN), Multipoint MAC Control (MPMC), Reconciliation Sublayer (RS), Physical Coding Sublayer (PCS), Physical Media Attachment (PMA), Physical Medium Dependent (PMD), PON, Point-to-Multipoint (P2MP)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P34 L # 583
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Move figure 200-5 to the same page of figure 200-4
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Figures will float in the draft and it is counterproductive to spend time "fixing" them each revision. Final location will be set when the draft is published.

Cl 1 SC 1.5 P18 L33 # 621
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 <<TBD>>
 SuggestedRemedy
 DCM: Dispersion Compensation Module
 FSR: Free Spectral Range
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.4.5.3 P25 L23 # 632
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Table 23 needs updates
 SuggestedRemedy
 See PICS document
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 There is no "Table 23". Location points to Table 200-3, which has nothing to do with PICS

Cl 200 SC 200.2.4.5.3 P25 L28 # 609
 Du, Liang Amazon
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Receiver sensitivity is not in referenced table
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace text "Receive sensitivity (max)" in row 2, column 2 (middle cell) with "minimum mean input power"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.6.1 P27 L21 # 637
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Remove paragraph below table 200-5 ("See ITU-T..")
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.3 SuperPON Task Force 10th Task Force review comments

Cl 200 SC 200.2.6.1 P27 L21 # 633
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Remove paragraph below table 200-5 ("See ITU-T..")
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.7.1 P28 L21 # 635
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Remove paragraph below table 200-7 ("See ITU-T..")
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.6.2 P28 L1 # 634
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Remove paragraph below table 200-6 ("See ITU-T..")
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.7.2 P29 L27 # 636
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Remove paragraph below table 200-8 ("See ITU-T..")
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.7 P28 L31 # 606
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 In table 200-7, the values for the maximum transmitter (residual) dispersion OSNR pnalty are ambiguous
 SuggestedRemedy
 Move the words (in the parameter column) "-600 to +50 ps/nm residual CD" to be note b; add "b" to the value "2.0" in the 10GBASE-SP1-Ux column.
 Move the words (in the parameter column) "-600 to +1020 ps/nm residual CD" to be note c; add "c" to the value "1.0" in the 10/2.5GBASE-SP1-Ux column.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.8 P30 L2 # 622
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Missing introduction
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add "A Super-PON optical path shall comply with the parameters shown in Table 200-9 and 200-10."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

The proposed change would imply these parameters are informative. They are not.
 The current table structure is not ambiguous and follows structure used in other specifications.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.8 P30 L3 # 623
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Remove "10 Gb/s" from the caption of table 200-9
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.3 SuperPON Task Force 10th Task Force review comments

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.8 P L # 616

Du, Liang Amazon
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Change "receive sensitivity" to "receiver sensitivity"
 SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change is in caption of 200.2.9.9?

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.12 P32 L30 # 629

DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Remove "<="

SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.12.1 P32 L37 # 581

Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Add "(as in Figure 200-5) after "at TP2 of the ONU PMD"
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.12.1 P32 L44 # 582

Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Add "(as in Figure 200-5) after "at TP2 of the ONU PMD"
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.12.2 P32 L48 # 584

Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 remove blank line
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.12.2 P33 L29 # 611

Du, Liang Amazon
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Editor's note needs to be removed
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace text with:

Laser on/off time measurement must account for any impairment due to the black link. This can be approxiamted using 2 60-GHz Gaussian filters alligned to the nominal channel frequency.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Laser on/off time measurement >>needs to<< account for any impairment due to the black link. This >>may<< be approxiamted using 2 60-GHz Gaussian filters alligned to the nominal channel frequency.

It is still not clear what "this" references, though

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.3 SuperPON Task Force 10th Task Force review comments

CI 200 SC 200.2.9.12.2 P33 L29 # 607
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Editor's note. That should be the transient state measurement of the black link. It has nothing to do with the PMD.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the note.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 200 SC 200.2.9.13 P33 L39 # 608
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Editor's note. Again, the impairment of the black link is a characteristics of the black link and should be decoupled from the PMD rx measurement.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the note.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 200 SC 200.2.9.12.2 P33 L32 # 585
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 remove blank line after the editor's note
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 200 SC 200.2.9.13 P33 L43 # 612
 Du, Liang Amazon
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Editor's note needs to be removed
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace text with:
 Receiver settling time measurement must account for any impairment due to the black link. This can be approxiamted using 2 60-GHz Gaussian filters alligned to the nominal channel frequency.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

CI 200 SC 200.2.9.13 P33 L37 # 586
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Incorrect reference
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "200.2.9.12.2" with "200.2.9.13.2"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Receiver settling time measurement >>needs to<< account for any impairment due to the black link. This >>may<< be approxiamted using 2 60-GHz Gaussian filters alligned to the nominal channel frequency.
 It is still not clear what "this" references, though

CI 200 SC 200.2.9.13.1 P33 L44 # 587
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Add "(as in Figure 200-6)" after "at TP7"
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.3 SuperPON Task Force 10th Task Force review comments

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.13.1 P33 L45 # 590
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Add "for Ton" after "at 200.29.12.1"
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.13.1 P33 L46 # 589
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Add "(as in Figure 200-6)" after "at TP8"
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.13.1 P33 L48 # 588
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Add "(as in Figure 200-6)" after "at TP7"
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.13.2 P35 L4 # 613
 Du, Liang Amazon
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Update figure. Figure needs to have optical filters in the path between the MDI to present Super-PON ODN
 SuggestedRemedy
 An updated figure will be provided
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.

No such figure has been provided

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.13.2 P35 L37 # 614
 Du, Liang Amazon
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Remove TBD
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace TBD with "Table 200-7 Turn-on time (max)"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Replace TBD with "Table 200-7."
 Make the link live

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.13.2 P35 L37 # 591
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 <<TBD>>
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace with "Table 200-7"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.3 SuperPON Task Force 10th Task Force review comments

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.21 P36 L31 # 610
 Du, Liang Amazon
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Add text from document in submission
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update draft
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 No proposed text available at this time

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.23 P36 L40 # 618
 Du, Liang Amazon
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Add new def for Clear link passband. Consider placing it after Ripple definition.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert:
 Clear Link Passband
 The frequency/wavelength range that the signal is expected to stay within. The maximum ripple parameter is measured only for frequencies/wavelengths within the clear link passband.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 Unclear where the text is supposed to be located. Specific new subclause number, please.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.11.1 P37 L33 # 631
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Rewrite sentence "The fiber optic cabling can be assembled as the operator desires"
 SuggestedRemedy
 The way to assemble the fiber optical cabling is not defined by this standard.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.11.2 P37 L37 # 630
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 Remove subclause 200.2.11.2, it does not apply
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.12 P38 L # 624
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 The PICS for 200.2 is missing
 SuggestedRemedy
 A document will be submitted
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 No document available for preview at this time.

Cl 200 SC 200.3.1 P39 L22 # 592
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 missing space
 SuggestedRemedy
 "The Nx25G-EPON"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.3 SuperPON Task Force 10th Task Force review comments

Cl **200** SC **200.3.4.4.2** P**44** L**10** # **593**
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 incorrect reference
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "200.7.13" with "200.2.9.12"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **200A** SC **200A.2.1** P**71** L**5** # **597**
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 In table 200A-2, spell out the meaning of CBP as its first occurrence
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "CBP" with "Channel passband (CBP)"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **200** SC **200.3.4.4.2** P**44** L**11** # **594**
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 incorrect reference
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "200.7.14" with "200.2.9.13"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **200A** SC **200A.2.3** P**72** L**1** # **599**
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type **T** Comment Status **D**
 a thin-film filter (TFF) with three stages
 SuggestedRemedy
 Should be three filters in two stages
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **200** SC **200.4.4.3** P**50** L**1** # **595**
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 title: "Symmetric and Data Rates"
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with "Symmetric and asymmetric data rates"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **200A** SC **200A.2.3** P**72** L**24** # **598**
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 Remove blank line
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **200A** SC **200A.1** P**69** L**13** # **596**
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 DCM is missing from the list of components
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace "amplifiers, and band MUX" with "amplifiers, DCM, and band MUX"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **200A** SC **200A.3** P**73** L**34** # **600**
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 Remove "(CAWG)" from the title
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.3 SuperPON Task Force 10th Task Force review comments

Cl **200A** SC **200A.3** P**73** L**36** # **601**
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 Expand AWG
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "cyclical AWG" with "Cyclical Arrayed Waveguide Grating (CAWG)"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **200A** SC **200A.5.4** P**77** L**50** # **604**
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 "-600 ps/nm" should be on a single line
 SuggestedRemedy
 As suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **200A** SC **200A.5.1** P**74** L**50** # **602**
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type **T** Comment Status **D**
 Add a sentence to clarify negatively chirped OLT lasers are assumed.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 No specific text proposed

Cl **200B** SC **200B.2** P**79** L**45** # **605**
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 "Ageing"
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with "aging"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **200A** SC **200A.5.2** P**75** L**18** # **603**
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 Update the captions of figures 200A-2 and 200A-3
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "budge" with "budget"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **Figure** SC **Fig. 200-1** P**19** L # **615**
 Du, Liang Amazon
 Comment Type **T** Comment Status **D**
 Do we really need to specify a range for A and B? (currently A<40km, and B<20km).
 Where does this come from?
 SuggestedRemedy
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 No specific remedy proposed