

Approved responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.4 SuperPON Task Force 11th Task Force review comments

Cl 1 SC 1.5 P20 L36 # 662
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 Add the abbreviation "CD: Chromatic Dispersion"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.42 P29 L26 # 657
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 insert a space between "Super-PON" and "uncorrected"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.3.5.1.2 P21 L39 # 663
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 "200.5"
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with "subclause 200.5"
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 Term "subclause" is not used - the link will be live in published version and lead to the right location.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.45a.2 P32 L4 # 658
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 replace "bal-anced" with "balanced"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.3.5.1.4 P21 L51 # 664
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 "200.5"
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with "subclause 200.5"
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 Term "subclause" is not used - the link will be live in published version and lead to the right location.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.2.1 P36 L # 667
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 In all layering figures, 56-5b, 200-2, 200-7, 200-10, 200-13:
 - replace "MCRS" with RS;
 - remove "MULTI-CHANNEL"; and
 - on the ONU part, replace "OLT MAC Control" with "ONU MAC Control".
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.4 SuperPON Task Force 11th Task Force review comments

Cl 56 SC 56.1.3 P37 L40 # 669
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 This is the ONU line, replace "10/2.5GBASE-SP1-D" with "10/2.5GBASE-SP1-U"
 SuggestedRemedy as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.1 P40 L54 # 661
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 replace "single channel" with "single wavelength channel"
 SuggestedRemedy as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.3 P38 L22 # 670
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 This is the ONU line, replace "10/2.5GBASE-SP1-D" with "10/2.5GBASE-SP1-U"
 SuggestedRemedy as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.4.5.3 P46 L26 # 671
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 "Signal Detect Threshold"
 SuggestedRemedy replace with "Signal detect threshold"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.1 P40 L26 # 659
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 in figure 200-1, "m l pairs", make the "m" in italic
 SuggestedRemedy as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.6.1 P48 L10 # 638
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 replace "CD" with "chromatic dispersion (CD)"
 SuggestedRemedy as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.1 P40 L42 # 660
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 replace "in order to get to" with "before getting to"
 SuggestedRemedy as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.6.2 P48 L42 # 672
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 "Damage Threshold"
 SuggestedRemedy replace with "Damage threshold"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.4 SuperPON Task Force 11th Task Force review comments

Cl 200 SC 200.2.7.1 P49 L43 # 673
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 Remove the editorial comment
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.14 P56 L3 # 675
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 replace "As defined in the" with "See"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.7.2 P50 L22 # 674
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 "Damage Threshold"
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with "Damage threshold"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.15 P56 L6 # 641
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 title: "Clear Link Passband"
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with "Clear link passband"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.8 P51 L9 # 639
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type T Comment Status A
 the Minimum (residual) chromatic dispersion for the 2.5Gb/s speed should be -600, not -500, for consistency with table 200-7
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace "-500" with "-600"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.16 P56 L13 # 676
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 replace "As defined in the" with "See"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.8 P52 L24 # 640
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 remove "and" from the title
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.17 P56 L17 # 677
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 replace "As defined in the" with "See"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.4 SuperPON Task Force 11th Task Force review comments

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.18 P56 L21 # 678
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 replace "As defined in the" with "See"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.21 P56 L37 # 682
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 make the two paragraphs a single paragraph
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.19 P56 L25 # 679
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 replace "As defined in the" with "See"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.21 P56 L41 # 683
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 add "; and" after "value"; add "." after "time" in the following line
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.20 P56 L29 # 680
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 replace "As defined in the" with "See"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.12.6 P61 L21 # 684
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 The subclause reference should be 200.2.7.2; the table reference should be table 200-8
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.21 P56 L33 # 681
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 replace "As defined in the" with "See"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.12.8 P61 L36 # 686
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 In the title, "102.5GBASE-SP1-U" should be "10/2.5GBASE-SP1-U"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.4 SuperPON Task Force 11th Task Force review comments

CI 200 SC 200.2.12.8 P61 L44 # 685
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 The subclause reference should be 200.2.7.2; the table reference should be table 200-8; in the "Status" column, "SPG2.510U:M" should be "SPG102.5U:M"
 SuggestedRemedy as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 200 SC 200.4.1 P73 L28 # 666
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 Remove "Multi-Channel" from figure 200-9; replace "MCRS" with "RS", change the caption to be "Relationship of Super-PON RS to the OSI reference model"
 SuggestedRemedy as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 200 SC 200.3.2 P66 L38 # 642
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 replace "coefficient 0.25" with "coefficient of 0.25"
 SuggestedRemedy as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 Reads correct as is

CI 200 SC 200.4.4.2 P74 L15 # 687
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 remove the sentence "Thus, for any given system, there is a one-to-one correspondence between the MCRS channel count and the number of XGMII instances supported."
 SuggestedRemedy as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 The sentence is correct but references "MCRS channel count" which is confusing here

CI 200 SC 200.4.1 P73 L10 # 665
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 "MCRS" issue. Given that Super-PON uses only one channel, every instance of "MCRS" in the document should be replaced by "RS", except the first instance in line 10 of page 73, subclause 200.4.1. That sentence should continue to read "The Super-PON Reconciliation Sublayer is the same as the Nx25G-EPON Multi-Channel Reconciliation Sublayer (MCRS) using only one xMII interface."
 SuggestedRemedy Except the indicated instance, replace all instances of "MCRS" in the document with "RS"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 Even though a single channel is used, it is still an instance of MCRS.
 Yes, it is a single instance of the 802.3ca MCRS, but here we are defining the P802.3cs RS. This change makes the document consistent.

CI 200 SC 200.4.4.7 P76 L # 668
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 In figures 200-11 and 200-12, replace "MCRS" with "RS"
 SuggestedRemedy as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.4 SuperPON Task Force 11th Task Force review comments

CI 200A SC 200A.2.4 P100 L38 # 648
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 In the first row of table 200A-5, add a footnote to operating wavelength range to state "L-band 1 (see table 200-4)"
 SuggestedRemedy as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 200A SC 200A.2.4 P100 L51 # 649
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type T Comment Status A
 in the last row of table 200A-5, specify "0" as the min operating temperature
 SuggestedRemedy as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 See comment #650

CI 200A SC 200A.2.5 P101 L30 # 643
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 Make "protocol" plural
 SuggestedRemedy as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 There are two instances of the word. Which one needs to be made plural? Both.

CI 200A SC 200A.3 P101 L38 # 654
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 add the word "spanning" in front of "the width of each wavelength band"
 SuggestedRemedy as suggested
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 200A SC 200A.5.2 P103 L16 # 651
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 In figure 200A-2 there are some spurious spaces
 SuggestedRemedy replace "- 2.5 dBm" with "-2.5 dBm" and "- 8 dBm" with "-8 dBm".
 Fix similar issues on line 14 ("- 5.5", "- 1.0", "- 4.0") and line 9 ("+ 21" and "- 20.5").
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 200A SC 200A.5.2 P103 L32 # 653
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 In figure 200A-3, there are some spurious spaces
 SuggestedRemedy replace "+ 25dB" with "+25 dB" and "- 20.5 dB" with "-20.5 dB".
 Fix similar issues on line 37 ("- 5.5", "- 1.0", "- 4.0") and line 39 ("- 16").
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.4 SuperPON Task Force 11th Task Force review comments

CI 200A SC 200A.5.2 P103 L40 # 652

Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A

In figure 200A-3, the value of the penalty was changed as part of the FrameMaker conversion

SuggestedRemedy

Put the proper value, replace "21.5 dB penalty" with "2.1 dB penalty"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 200A SC 200A.5.4 P105 L33 # 655

Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A

Expand the acronyms "DML" and "EML"

SuggestedRemedy

replace "desire to enable both DML and EML solutions" with "desire to enable both Directly Modulated Laser (DML) and Electroabsorption Modulated Laser (EML) solutions"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 200B SC 200B.2 P107 L44 # 656

Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status A

Replace "need" with "needs"

SuggestedRemedy

as suggested

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 200C SC 200C.1 P111 L # 688

DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status A

Improve the quality of figures 200C-1 and 200C-2.

SuggestedRemedy

Better figures will be provided

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

See 20210225-Du_3cs_01.pdf and 20210225-Du_3cs_02.pdf.