

Proposed responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.4 SuperPON Task Force 11th Task Force review comments

Cl 1 SC 1.5 P20 L36 # 662
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Add the abbreviation "CD: Chromatic Dispersion"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.42 P29 L26 # 657
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 insert a space between "Super-PON" and "uncorrected"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.3.5.1.2 P21 L39 # 663
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 "200.5"
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with "subclause 200.5"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 Term "subclause" is not used - the link will be live in published version and lead to the right location.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.45a.2 P32 L4 # 658
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 replace "bal-anced" with "balanced"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.3.5.1.4 P21 L51 # 664
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 "200.5"
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with "subclause 200.5"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 Term "subclause" is not used - the link will be live in published version and lead to the right location.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.2.1 P36 L # 667
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 In all layering figures, 56-5b, 200-2, 200-7, 200-10, 200-13:
 - replace "MCRS" with RS;
 - remove "MULTI-CHANNEL"; and
 - on the ONU part, replace "OLT MAC Control" with "ONU MAC Control".
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.4 SuperPON Task Force 11th Task Force review comments

Cl 56 SC 56.1.3 P37 L40 # 669
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 This is the ONU line, replace "10/2.5GBASE-SP1-D" with "10/2.5GBASE-SP1-U"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.1 P40 L54 # 661
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 replace "single channel" with "single wavelength channel"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 56 SC 56.1.3 P38 L22 # 670
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 This is the ONU line, replace "10/2.5GBASE-SP1-D" with "10/2.5GBASE-SP1-U"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.4.5.3 P46 L26 # 671
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 "Signal Detect Threshold"
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with "Signal detect threshold"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.1 P40 L26 # 659
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 in figure 200-1, "m l pairs", make the "m" in italic
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.6.1 P48 L10 # 638
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 replace "CD" with "chromatic dispersion (CD)"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.1 P40 L42 # 660
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 replace "in order to get to" with "before getting to"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.6.2 P48 L42 # 672
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 "Damage Threshold"
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with "Damage threshold"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.4 SuperPON Task Force 11th Task Force review comments

Cl 200 SC 200.2.7.1 P49 L43 # 673
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Remove the editorial comment
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.14 P56 L3 # 675
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 replace "As defined in the" with "See"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.7.2 P50 L22 # 674
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 "Damage Threshold"
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with "Damage threshold"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.15 P56 L6 # 641
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 title: "Clear Link Passband"
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with "Clear link passband"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.8 P51 L9 # 639
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 the Minimum (residual) chromatic dispersion for the 2.5Gb/s speed should be -600, not -500, for consistency with table 200-7
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace "-500" with "-600"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.16 P56 L13 # 676
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 replace "As defined in the" with "See"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.8 P52 L24 # 640
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 remove "and" from the title
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.17 P56 L17 # 677
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 replace "As defined in the" with "See"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.4 SuperPON Task Force 11th Task Force review comments

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.18 P56 L21 # 678
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 replace "As defined in the" with "See"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.21 P56 L37 # 682
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 make the two paragraphs a single paragraph
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.19 P56 L25 # 679
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 replace "As defined in the" with "See"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.21 P56 L41 # 683
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 add "; and" after "value"; add "." after "time" in the following line
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.20 P56 L29 # 680
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 replace "As defined in the" with "See"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.12.6 P61 L21 # 684
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 The subclause reference should be 200.2.7.2; the table reference should be table 200-8
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.9.21 P56 L33 # 681
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 replace "As defined in the" with "See"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200 SC 200.2.12.8 P61 L36 # 686
 DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 In the title, "102.5GBASE-SP1-U" should be "10/2.5GBASE-SP1-U"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.4 SuperPON Task Force 11th Task Force review comments

CI 200 SC 200.2.12.8 P61 L44 # 685

DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D

The subclause reference should be 200.2.7.2; the table reference should be table 200-8; in the "Status" column, "SPG2.510U:M" should be "SPG102.5U:M"

SuggestedRemedy
as suggested

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 200 SC 200.3.2 P66 L38 # 642

Lam, Cedric Google

Comment Type E Comment Status D

replace "coefficient 0.25" with "coefficient of 0.25"

SuggestedRemedy
as suggested

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED REJECT.

Reads correct as is

CI 200 SC 200.4.1 P73 L10 # 665

DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D

"MCRS" issue. Given that Super-PON uses only one channel, every instance of "MCRS" in the document should be replaced by "RS", except the first instance in line 10 of page 73, subclause 200.4.1. That sentence should continue to read "The Super-PON Reconciliation Sublayer is the same as the Nx25G-EPON Multi-Channel Reconciliation Sublayer (MCRS) using only one xMII interface."

SuggestedRemedy

Except the indicated instance, replace all instances of "MCRS" in the document with "RS"

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED REJECT.

Even though a single channel is used, it is still an instance of MCRS.

CI 200 SC 200.4.1 P73 L28 # 666

DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D

Remove "Multi-Channel" from figure 200-9; replace "MCRS" with "RS"

SuggestedRemedy
as suggested

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED REJECT.

See comment #666

CI 200 SC 200.4.4.2 P74 L15 # 687

DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D

remove the sentence "Thus, for any given system, there is a one-to-one correspondence between the MCRS channel count and the number of XGMII instances supported."

SuggestedRemedy
as suggested

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED REJECT.

The sentence is correct as it is.

CI 200 SC 200.4.4.7 P76 L # 668

DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D

In figures 200-11 and 200-12, replace "MCRS" with "RS"

SuggestedRemedy
as suggested

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED REJECT.

See comment #666

Proposed responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.4 SuperPON Task Force 11th Task Force review comments

Cl 200 SC 200.5.3.9.2 P89 L4 # 689

DeSanti, Claudio

Dell Technologies

Comment Type T Comment Status D

Table 200-4 needs to be updated, because now it prioritizes 2.5G over 10G.

SuggestedRemedy

In the table, replace each instance of "10G" with "2.5G" and each instance of "2.5G" with "10G"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

The table does not prioritize anything - it is up to the OLT implementation to select which speed combination(s) to prioritize.

Cl 200A SC 200A.1 P97 L # 644

Lam, Cedric

Google

Comment Type T Comment Status D

In figure 200A-1, the band MUX should show two additional ports for the FSR set 2

SuggestedRemedy

An updated diagram will be submitted

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

No diagram available for review.

Cl 200A SC 200A.2.1 P99 L11 # 650

Lam, Cedric

Google

Comment Type T Comment Status D

in the last row of table 200A-2, specify "0" as the min operating temperature

SuggestedRemedy

as suggested

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

That is a rather strange temperature range definition, especially for outdoor device.

Cl 200A SC 200A.2.2 P99 L31 # 645

Lam, Cedric

Google

Comment Type E Comment Status D

In the first row of table 200A-3, add a footnote to operating wavelength range to state "C-band 1 (see table 200-4)"

SuggestedRemedy

as suggested

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 200A SC 200A.2.2 P99 L41 # 646

Lam, Cedric

Google

Comment Type T Comment Status D

in the last row of table 200A-3, specify "0" as the min operating temperature

SuggestedRemedy

as suggested

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

That is a rather strange temperature range definition, especially for outdoor device.

Cl 200A SC 200A.2.3 P100 L21 # 647

Lam, Cedric

Google

Comment Type T Comment Status D

in the last row of table 200A-4, specify "0" as the min operating temperature

SuggestedRemedy

as suggested

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

That is a rather strange temperature range definition, especially for outdoor device.

Proposed responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.4 SuperPON Task Force 11th Task Force review comments

CI 200A SC 200A.2.4 P100 L 38 # 648
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 In the first row of table 200A-5, add a footnote to operating wavelength range to state "L-band 1 (see table 200-4)"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 200A SC 200A.2.4 P100 L 51 # 649
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 in the last row of table 200A-5, specify "0" as the min operating temperature
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

That is a rather strange temperature range definition, especially for outdoor device.

CI 200A SC 200A.2.5 P101 L 30 # 643
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Make "protocol" plural
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.

There are two instances of the word. Which one needs to be made plural?

CI 200A SC 200A.3 P101 L 38 # 654
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 add the word "spanning" in front of "the width of each wavelength band"
 SuggestedRemedy
 as suggested
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 200A SC 200A.5.2 P103 L 16 # 651
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 In figure 200A-2 there are some spurious spaces
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace "- 2.5 dBm" with "-2.5 dBm" and "- 8 dBm" with "-8 dBm".
 Fix similar issues on line 14 ("- 5.5", "- 1.0", "- 4.0") and line 9 (" + 21" and "- 20.5").
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 200A SC 200A.5.2 P103 L 32 # 653
 Lam, Cedric Google
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 In figure 200A-3, there are some spurious spaces
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace "+ 25dB" with "+25 dB" and "- 20.5 dB" with "-20.5 dB".
 Fix similar issues on line 37 ("- 5.5", "- 1.0", "- 4.0") and line 39 ("- 16").
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed responses

IEEE P802.3cs D1.4 SuperPON Task Force 11th Task Force review comments

Cl **200A** *SC* **200A.5.2** *P* **103** *L* **40** # **652**

Lam, Cedric Google

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D**

In figure 200A-3, the value of the penalty was changed as part of the FrameMaker conversion

SuggestedRemedy

Put the proper value, replace "21.5 dB penalty" with "2.1 dB penalty"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **200A** *SC* **200A.5.4** *P* **105** *L* **33** # **655**

Lam, Cedric Google

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D**

Expand the acronyms "DML" and "EML"

SuggestedRemedy

replace "desire to enable both DML and EML solutions" with "desire to enable both Directly Modulated Laser (DML) and Externally Modulated Laser (EML) solutions"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **200B** *SC* **200B.2** *P* **107** *L* **44** # **656**

Lam, Cedric Google

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D**

Replace "need" with "needs"

SuggestedRemedy

as suggested

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **200C** *SC* **200C.1** *P* **111** *L* # **688**

DeSanti, Claudio Dell Technologies

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D**

Improve the quality of figures 200C-1 and 200C-2.

SuggestedRemedy

Better figures will be provided

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.

No figures were provided.