

IEEE P802.3cu D2.2 100 Gb/s per wavelength on SMF 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI **FM** SC **FM** P1 L10 # 9
 Grow, Bob RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 We now have 9 approved amendments and P802.3cr is in SA ballot. I believe this amendment could now be safely numbered as Amendment 11.
SuggestedRemedy
 Conditional on Mr. Law assigning P802.3cr Amendment 10 and assigning this project Amendment 11, change "Amendment" to "Amendment 11:". If done, similarly change page 17, line 3.
 Proposed Response Response Status **Z**
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P1 L30 # 12
 Grow, Bob RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **T** Comment Status **D**
 Because this draft references Annex J2 (151.9.1), IEEE Std 802.3cr needs to precede this project in amendment number because it adds the Annex.
SuggestedRemedy
 Add "and IEEE Std 802.3cr-20xx" to end of list and remove the preceding "and".
 Proposed Response Response Status **Z**
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P1 L30 # 11
 Grow, Bob RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 It is customary to not include the full year until a document is published.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "2020" to "20xx".
 Proposed Response Response Status **Z**
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P1 L30 # 10
 Grow, Bob RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 This list omits IEEE Std 802.3ch-20xx, which is an approved draft and is also included in the introduction list of amendments.
SuggestedRemedy
 Insert IEEE Std 802.3ch-20xx prior to IEEE Std 802.3ca. If amendment numbers 10 and 11 are assigned as suggested in coment on line 10, also edit to add IEEE Std 802.3cr as the last amendment in the list.
 Proposed Response Response Status **Z**
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P1 L31 # 1
 Grow, Bob RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 PHY is not the acronym for Physical Layer, it is the acronym for Physical Layer Device.
SuggestedRemedy
 Delete "(PHY)".
 Proposed Response Response Status **Z**
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P3 L1 # 2
 Grow, Bob RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 PHY is not the acronym for Physical Layer, it is the acronym for Physical Layer Device.
SuggestedRemedy
 Delete "(PHY)".
 Proposed Response Response Status **Z**
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

IEEE P802.3cu D2.2 100 Gb/s per wavelength on SMF 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P12 L22 # 3
 Grow, Bob RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 This amendment has a number.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert "Amendment 8 --".
 Proposed Response Response Status **Z**
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P12 L26 # 4
 Grow, Bob RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 Until published, the reference year should be incomplete.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "2020" to "20xx".
 Proposed Response Response Status **Z**
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P12 L28 # 5
 Grow, Bob RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 This amendment has a number.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert "Amendment 9 --".
 Proposed Response Response Status **Z**
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P12 L36 # 6
 Grow, Bob RMG Consulting
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 Because this draft references Annex J2 (151.9.1), IEEE Std 802.3cr needs to precede this project in amendment number because it adds the Annex.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add: IEEE Std 802.3crTM-20xx IEEE Std 802.3crTM-20xx
 Amendment 10 -- This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and adds Annex J. This amendment replaces references to the IEC 60950 series of standards (including IEC 60950-1 "Information technology equipment—Safety—Part 1: General requirements") with appropriate references to the IEC 62368 "Audio/video, information and communication technology equipment" series and makes appropriate changes to the standard corresponding to the new references This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2018 and adds Annex J. This amendment replaces references to the IEC 60950 series of standards (including IEC 60950-1 "Information technology equipment—Safety—Part 1: General requirements") with appropriate references to the IEC 62368 "Audio/video, information and communication technology equipment" series and makes appropriate changes to the standard corresponding to the new references.
 Proposed Response Response Status **Z**
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl **00** SC **0** P12 L20 # 30
 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**
 802.3ch has published.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace, "802.3ch-20xx" with, "802.3cg-2020" and insert "Amendment 8—" before "This amendment..." on line 22
 Proposed Response Response Status **Z**
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

IEEE P802.3cu D2.2 100 Gb/s per wavelength on SMF 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 00 SC 0 P12 L28 # 31
 Maguire, Valerie The Siemon Company
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Missing some template text.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert "Amendment 9—" before "This amendment...".
 Proposed Response Response Status Z
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P19 L12 # 13
 Ran, Adeo Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 According to the style manual (18.2.2):
 "Change shall be used when text or tables are being modified; therefore, strikethrough (for deletions) and underscore (for insertions) should be indicated"
 and
 "Insert shall be used to add new text, equations, tables, or figures in the standard".
 Here an existing subclause is being modified, not a new one inserted.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the instructions to "change" (3 times) and underline the new text.
 Proposed Response Response Status Z
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 78 SC 78.7.4 P24 L7 # 14
 Ran, Adeo Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 According to the style manual (18.2.2):
 "Change shall be used when text or tables are being modified; therefore, strikethrough (for deletions) and underscore (for insertions) should be indicated"
 and
 "Insert shall be used to add new text, equations, tables, or figures in the standard".
 Here an existing table is being modified, not a new one inserted.
 Also in the following places, page/subclause/Line:
 25 80.1.4 14
 26 80.4 42
 32 116.1.3 18
 33 116.4 38
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the instruction to "change" and underline the new text. Apply in all listed places.
 Proposed Response Response Status Z
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

IEEE P802.3cu D2.2 100 Gb/s per wavelength on SMF 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 140 SC 140.1 P38 L1 # 15

Ran, Adeo Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status D

According to the style manual (18.2.2):

"Change shall be used when text or tables are being modified; therefore, strikethrough (for deletions) and underscore (for insertions) should be indicated" and
 "Insert shall be used to add new text, equations, tables, or figures in the standard".

Here a figure is being replaced and its title is changed (the "change" instruction can't be applied to a figure).

SuggestedRemedy

Change the instruction to "replace" the figure and "change" the title. Remove the underlines in the figure.

Proposed Response Response Status Z
 PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 140 SC 140.6.1 P42 L32 # 16

Ran, Adeo Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status D

Where are the new table and text inserted?

SuggestedRemedy

Add to the instruction "after Table 140-6" or wherever it is intended.

Proposed Response Response Status Z
 PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 140 SC 140.6.2 P43 L38 # 17

Ran, Adeo Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status D

Where are the new figure and text inserted?

In the next page, Table 140-7 is changed but there is no corresponding editorial instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the instruction to "change" and include context to identify the location of the new text. Add "insert" instruction for the figure.

Proposed Response Response Status Z
 PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 140 SC 140.6.3 P46 L43 # 18

Ran, Adeo Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status D

Where are the new figures and text inserted?

SuggestedRemedy

Add to the instruction "after Table 140-8" or wherever it is intended.

Add the numbers of the new figures, 140-2c and 140-2d.

Proposed Response Response Status Z
 PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 140 SC 140.7.9 P51 L26 # 19

Ran, Adeo Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status D

Is Figure 140-5 a new figure, a replacement, or no change to existing figure 140-5?

SuggestedRemedy

If no change, separate the editorial instruction to two changes, before and after the figure.

Proposed Response Response Status Z
 PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

IEEE P802.3cu D2.2 100 Gb/s per wavelength on SMF 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 140 SC 140.8.1 P52 L38 # 7

Grow, Bob RMG Consulting

Comment Type T Comment Status D

This subclause has no text. If this as a placeholder, it will not work. The current text of P802.3cr references Annex J2 which is being added by P802.3cr and therefore couldn't be referenced by P802.3cu unless P802.3cr is an earlier amendment. Also, P802.3cr is ahead of P802.3cu in balloting.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the heading.

Proposed Response Response Status Z

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 151 SC 151.9.1 P85 L42 # 8

Grow, Bob RMG Consulting

Comment Type E Comment Status D

This text differs from P802.3cr, 150.9.1.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace sentence with; "All equipment subject to this clause shall conform to J.2."

Proposed Response Response Status Z

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.