Cl **156**   *SC* **156.8**   *P* **101**   *L* **31**   # 1

Maniloff, Eric   Ciena

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Equation 156-1 line 2 term (1-10^(Floor/10)) should be 10^(Floor/10)

SuggestedRemedy

Update equation to be consistent with
https://www.ieee802.org/3/cw/public/23_0925/maniloff_3cw_01_230925.pdf

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **156**   *SC* **156.8**   *P* **101**   *L* **31**   # 2

Maniloff, Eric   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Equation 156-1 uses the function "In(2)" with what appears to be a capital "i" rather than "log_e(2)". Annex 156A uses log_e in Eq 156A-1, this should be maintained for consistency.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace all terms in Eq 156-1 reading "In" with log_e

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **156A**   *SC* **156A.2**   *P* **122**   *L* **42**   # 6

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Table 156-1 uses a mix of "central frequency", "center frequency" and "target frequency demux frequency".
"target frequency demux frequency" seems ungrammatical?
D2.1 comments 285, optical parameters are inadequately defined.

SuggestedRemedy

Change them all to "center frequency" or "nominal center frequency" or "channel center frequency"as appropriate, to be consistent with 156.6.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change table title from "Table 156-1" to Table 156A-1". In Table 156A-1 change all instances to "central frequency" to "center frequency".

With editorial license.

Cl **156**   *SC* **156.9.1**   *P* **104**   *L* **21**   # 16

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Adjacent channel isolation

SuggestedRemedy

Adjacent channel spectral isolation

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "Adjacent channel isolation" to "Adjacent spectral channel isolation".

Cl **156**   *SC* **156.8**   *P* **101**   *L* **36**   # 18

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Double square brackets

SuggestedRemedy

Can be reduced to single.
Or, change 10log10{10^L/10[[...][...]]} to
10log10[10^L/10{ ... }{ ... }] or
L+10log10[{ ... }{ ... }]
alternating {} and [] for readability
or use angle brackets, but they are not common.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolve using the response to comment #1.

Cl **156**   *SC* **156.8**   *P* **101**   *L* **36**   # 19

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

In (a variable, in italics with a capital i)

SuggestedRemedy

In (a function, upright, with a lower case L). Twice

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolve using the response to comment #2.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **19**   Page 1 of 3
10/30/2023 4:21:05 PM

Cl **156**　　　*SC* **156.9.9**　　　　　*P* **107**　　　*L* **11**　　　　# 24

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*bucket*

It is hard to find this subclause because its name doesn't match Table 156-7 and Table 156-12 "EVMmax" or 156.10 "EVM conformance test setup and calculation"

SuggestedRemedy

Change the subclause title from "Error vector magnitude" to "Error vector magnitude (EVM)"

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **156**　　　*SC* **156.10.1.2**　　　　*P* **112**　　　*L* **28**　　　　# 26

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*bucket*

According to the style guide, causes and subclauses should be divided into further subclauses only when there is more than one
subclause. For example, Clause 1 should not have a 1.1 unless there is also a 1.2. There is no 156.10.2.

SuggestedRemedy

Promote 156.10.1.2 Offline digital signal processing to become 156.10.2 Offline digital signal processing and EVMmax calculation

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implement suggested remedy.

With editorial license.

Cl **155**　　　*SC* **155.2.5.6**　　　　*P* **51**　　　*L* **32**　　　　# 29

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*bucket*

This document uses "CRC32" 20 times and "CRC" 6 times, contrary to style guide 10.1.1 Homogeneity: The same term should be used throughout each standard or series of standards to designate a given concept. The use of an alternative term (synonym) for a concept already defined should be avoided. As far as possible, only one meaning should be attributed to each term used.

SuggestedRemedy

Change CRC to CRC32 (6 places)

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change any "CRC" to include the number of bits throughout the document.

With editorial license.

Cl **155**　　　*SC* **155.2.5.3**　　　　*P* **48**　　　*L* **27**　　　　# 30

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*bucket*

This document uses "multi-frame" 27 times and multiframe once. G.709.2 uses "multi-frame".

SuggestedRemedy

Change multiframe to multi-frame

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Ensure consistent use of "multi-frame" through the document.

With editorial license.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **30**

Page 2 of 3
10/30/2023 4:21:06 PM

Cl **155**   *SC* **155.3.3.2.2**   *P* **71**   *L* **29**   # 33

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

This document uses I-Q offset 17 times and IQ offset five times.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the 6 to match the 17

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Ensure consistent use of "I-Q offset" throughout the document.

With editorial license.

Cl **156**   *SC* **156.10.1.2.5**   *P* **112**   *L* **23**   # 34

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Offset

SuggestedRemedy

offset

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "Offset" to "offset".

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   Comment ID **34**   Page 3 of 3
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   10/30/2023 4:21:06 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID