

IEEE P802.3cw D2.5 400 Gb/s over DWDM systems 5th Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 155 SC 155.2.5.3 P 48 L 27 # 30
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 This document uses "multi-frame" 27 times and multiframe once. G.709.2 uses "multi-frame".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change multiframe to multi-frame
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Ensure consistent use of "multi-frame" through the document.
 With editorial license.

Cl 155 SC 155.2.5.6 P 51 L 32 # 29
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 This document uses "CRC32" 20 times and "CRC" 6 times, contrary to style guide 10.1.1 Homogeneity: The same term should be used throughout each standard or series of standards to designate a given concept. The use of an alternative term (synonym) for a concept already defined should be avoided. As far as possible, only one meaning should be attributed to each term used.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change CRC to CRC32 (6 places)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change any "CRC" to include the number of bits throughout the document.
 With editorial license.

Cl 155 SC 155.3.3.2.2 P 71 L 29 # 33
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 This document uses I-Q offset 17 times and IQ offset five times.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the 6 to match the 17
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Ensure consistent use of "I-Q offset" throughout the document.
 With editorial license.

Cl 156 SC 156.8 P 101 L 31 # 2
 Maniloff, Eric Ciena
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Equation 156-1 uses the function "ln(2)" with what appears to be a capital "i" rather than "log_e(2)". Annex 156A uses log_e in Eq 156A-1, this should be maintained for consistency.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace all terms in Eq 156-1 reading "ln" with log_e
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 156 SC 156.8 P 101 L 31 # 1
 Maniloff, Eric Ciena
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket
 Equation 156-1 line 2 term (1-10^(Floor/10)) should be 10^(Floor/10)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update equation to be consistent with
https://www.ieee802.org/3/cw/public/23_0925/maniloff_3cw_01_230925.pdf
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3cw D2.5 400 Gb/s over DWDM systems 5th Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 156 SC 156.8 P 101 L 36 # 19
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 In (a variable, in italics with a capital i)
 SuggestedRemedy
 In (a function, upright, with a lower case L). Twice
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Resolve using the response to comment #2.

CI 156 SC 156.9.9 P 107 L 11 # 24
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 It is hard to find this subclause because its name doesn't match Table 156-7 and Table 156-12 "EVMmax" or 156.10 "EVM conformance test setup and calculation"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the subclause title from "Error vector magnitude" to "Error vector magnitude (EVM)"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 156 SC 156.8 P 101 L 36 # 18
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Double square brackets
 SuggestedRemedy
 Can be reduced to single.
 Or, change $10\log_{10}\{10^L/10[\dots][\dots]\}$ to $10\log_{10}[10^L/10\{\dots\}\{\dots\}]$ or $L+10\log_{10}\{\dots\}\{\dots\}$ alternating {} and [] for readability or use angle brackets, but they are not common.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Resolve using the response to comment #1.

CI 156 SC 156.10.1.2 P 112 L 28 # 26
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 According to the style guide, causes and subclauses should be divided into further subclauses only when there is more than one subclause. For example, Clause 1 should not have a 1.1 unless there is also a 1.2. There is no 156.10.2.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Promote 156.10.1.2 Offline digital signal processing to become 156.10.2 Offline digital signal processing and EVMmax calculation
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement suggested remedy.
 With editorial license.

CI 156 SC 156.9.1 P 104 L 21 # 16
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket
 Adjacent channel isolation
 SuggestedRemedy
 Adjacent channel spectral isolation
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change "Adjacent channel isolation" to "Adjacent spectral channel isolation".

CI 156 SC 156.10.1.2.5 P 112 L 23 # 34
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Offset
 SuggestedRemedy
 offset
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change "Offset" to "offset".

IEEE P802.3cw D2.5 400 Gb/s over DWDM systems 5th Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 156A SC 156A.2 P 122 L 42 # 6

Dawe, Piers Nvidia

Comment Type TR Comment Status D bucket

Table 156-1 uses a mix of "central frequency", "center frequency" and "target frequency demux frequency".

"target frequency demux frequency" seems ungrammatical?

D2.1 comments 285, optical parameters are inadequately defined.

SuggestedRemedy

Change them all to "center frequency" or "nominal center frequency" or "channel center frequency" as appropriate, to be consistent with 156.6.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change table title from "Table 156-1" to Table 156A-1". In Table 156A-1 change all instances to "central frequency" to "center frequency".

With editorial license.