

Approved IEEE 802.3cx Improved PTP Timestamping Accuracy (ITSA) Task Force Meeting Minutes

November 10, 2021, Virtual Meeting

- Minutes prepared by Steve Gorshe

Agenda and General Information Presentation by Steve Gorshe, ITSA Task Force Chair

- Steve Gorshe, meeting and task force chair, begins presenting the [Agenda and General Information](#) slides
- Since this was a virtual meeting, the attendees were not asked to introduce themselves with their affiliations. Instead, the Chair asked them to identify their affiliation in their WebEx user names or in the chat window.
- **Agenda** – Chair presents the agenda for the meeting and asked if anyone had comments, additions or objections for the meeting agenda per slide 2 of the following presentation: [Agenda and General Information](#). Chair asked if there would be any objections to going the end of the meeting time with the D2.0 comment resolution and continuing long enough past that time to review and approve the draft liaisons. There were no objections to this modification, so the modified agenda was adopted by acclamation. Chair noted that if it was not possible to resolve all the comments, a P802.3cx interim would be scheduled for either the last week of November or first week of December in order to complete the comment resolutions and proceed to recirculation ballot with draft D2.1 such that the ballot can close before the January IEEE 802.3 interim meeting. Chair further explained that approving the liaisons at the current meeting would allow requesting WG approval with the liaisons to be sent with D2.1 attached once it is ready.
- **Task Force Decorum** - Chair reviewed slide and noted that there should be no recording or photography without permission. Chair asked if anyone was attending from the press including those who would run a public blog on this meeting – none responded.
- **Goals for Meeting** – Chair presented the goals with no comment from attendees
- **Big Ticket Items** – Chair presented the Big-Ticket items aligned to goals with no comments from attendees
- **Reflector and Web** – Chair presented the Task Force reflector and web information. All in attendance were invited to subscribe for Task Force communications and updates.
- **Task Force Private Area** – Chair reminded members of the Task Force Private Area, presented the URL to that private area and presented both the Username and Password to gain access to the URL. Chair also noted that the general IEEE 802.3 Username and Password can be used to access the URL.
- **Ground Rules** – Chair review the meeting ground rules based on IEEE 802.3 Rules.
- **Attendance** – Attendees were reminded of the IEEE 802.3 attendance procedures and asked to follow the link to those procedure for further information. IMAT tool was used for this meeting, and the Chair noted that since this is part of an IEEE 802 plenary session, no password is required for this meeting.
- **Non-payment of meeting registration fees** – Chair noted that meeting registration fees are required in order to participate in any session during an IEEE 802 plenary, including IEEE 802.3

Task Force meetings. This can also apply to subsequent interim meetings. See slide 10 of the agenda deck [Agenda and General Information](#) for a detailed explanation.

- **IEEE Structure and Important Bylaws & Rules** – Chair reviewed the IEEE SA structure including a review of how 802.3 WG and the Task Force is located within the structure. The important bylaws and rules were pointed out for all to refer as needed or of interest.
- **IEEE 's Patent Policy and IEEE WG Meeting Guidelines (Slides 13-17 or IEEE SA Slides 0-4)** – All 5 IEEE SA slides were presented with the Chair highlighting that
 1. IEEE's patent policy is described in Clause 6 of the IEEE SA Standards Board Bylaws where they can be referred to and that the IEEE SA Standards Board Patent Committee Administrator may be contacted with further questions
 2. Early identification of patent claims which may be essential for the use of standards under development is strongly encouraged
 3. There may be Essential Patent Claims of which IEEE is not aware. Additionally, neither IEEE, the WG, nor the WG Chair can ensure the accuracy or completeness of any assurance or whether any such assurance is, in fact, of a Patent Claim that is essential for the use of the standard under development.
 4. Participants have a duty to inform the IEEE of the identity of each holder of any potential Essential Patent Claims of which they are personally aware if the claims are owned or controlled by the participant or the entity the participant is from, employed by, or otherwise represents
- The Chair provided an opportunity for participants to identify patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) of which the participant is personally aware and that may be essential for the use of this standard.
 - No such claims were brought to the Chair's attention.
- **IEEE Copyright Policy (slides 18-20)** – The chair also reminded attendees of the IEEE copyright policy.
- **Participation in IEEE 802 Meetings (slides 21-23)** – Chair reviewed the slides
- **Overview of IEEE 802.3 Standard Process (5 slides)** – Chair reviewed the standards process slides. Chair highlighted that the ITSA group had completed the Study Group Phase and moved into the Task Force Review Phase on slide 2 of 5 of the Process slides.
- **Liaisons and Communications** – Chair noted that there are no incoming liaisons for this meeting. As previously announced, it is proposed to send a liaison to both ITU-T Q13/15 and IEEE 1588 from the November IEEE 802.3 meeting, including the draft D2.1 of P802.3cx. Chair noted that if unresolved comments remain at the end of this P802.3cx meeting, the IEEE 802.3 Working Group will be asked to approve the liaisons, but wait to send them until draft D2.1 is available.
- **Action Items** – There were none to review for this meeting.
- **Task Force Approved Project Documents** – Task Force project documents remain unchanged and links to the documents were provided.
- **Task Force Objectives** – Chair restated the adopted Task Force objectives.
- **Task Force Timelines (slides 33)** – Chair reviewed the timelines
- **Agenda (Slide 34)** – Chair presents the agenda for the day

- **Presentations** – In addition to this presentation ([Agenda and General Information](#)), there is one item the agenda (Chief Editor comments on draft D1.2) to be reviewed. Chair introduced the agenda item and asked the Chief Editor to provide an overview of the latest draft.

Chief Editor comments on draft D2.0, Marek Hajduczenia (Editor), Charter Communications

- The editor categorized the 143 comments that were received during the IEEE 802.3 Working Group ballot with draft D2.0.
- The editor created a “bucket list” for editorial comments where the response was clear. There were no objections to leaving these items in the bucket list, and no requests to remove an item from the bucket list for discussion during the meeting.
- It was agreed that clause 90 should be shown as being modified, using change tracking, rather than being replaced as indicated in D2.0.
- It was agreed that the abstract would be written in terms of the changes made by P802.3cx, without specific reference to ITU-T Rec. G.8273.2.
- It was noted in multiple comments that there are potential problems with the term “message timestamp point.” (#174, #239, #243 and #247) Resolution of these comments was deferred in order to allow building consensus off-line for a potential change.
- Conclusions regarding comments #135 and #177 related to TX_num_unit_change and RX_num_unit_change were also deferred to allow potential off-line consensus building for resolutions.
- The comments resolved at this meeting were posted after the meeting https://www.ieee802.org/3/cx/public/nov21/802d3cx_D2_0_proposed_partial.pdf and the next interim to continue comment resolution is scheduled for November 24.

OUTGOING LIAISONS

- Draft liaison to ITU-T Q13 of SG15 gorshe_3cx_01_1121 was presented and discussed. There were no comments on this draft liaison.
- Draft liaison to IEEE 1588 gorshe_3cx_02a_1121 was presented and discussed. The discussion resulted in multiple edits, leading to gorshe_3cx_02b_1121.

Motion #1: To approve the draft liaison from IEEE 802.3 to ITU-T SG15 Q13 on the P802.3cx status contained in [gorshe_3cx_01_1121](#), with draft D2.1 attached

- Requires >75% (Technical)
- Moved by: Pete Anslow Seconded by: Tom Huber
- PASSES with no objections received

Motion #2: To approve the draft liaison from IEEE 802.3 to IEEE 1588 on the P802.3cx status contained in [gorshe_3cx_02b_1121](#), with draft D2.1 attached

- Requires >75% (Technical)
- Moved by: Pete Anslow Seconded by: Bob Grow
- PASSES with no objections received

- **Previous Meeting Minutes** - Meeting minutes held on September 22, 2021 (virtual call) are here:
[https://www.ieee802.org/3/cx/public/sept21/Unconfirmed Meeting Minutes ITSA 802d3cx 0921.pdf](https://www.ieee802.org/3/cx/public/sept21/Unconfirmed_Meeting_Minutes_ITSA_802d3cx_0921.pdf)

Chair asked if any attendee had any comment regarding the September 22, 2021 Meeting Minutes. None were received

Motion #3: Approve the meeting minutes of September 22, 2021:

[https://www.ieee802.org/3/cx/public/sept21/Unconfirmed Meeting Minutes ITSA 802d3cx 0921.pdf](https://www.ieee802.org/3/cx/public/sept21/Unconfirmed_Meeting_Minutes_ITSA_802d3cx_0921.pdf)

- Requires >50% (Procedural)
- Moved by: Bill Powell Seconded by: Tom Huber
- PASSES with no objections received

Approved meeting minutes from September 22, 2021 are officially here:

- [https://www.ieee802.org/3/cx/public/sept21/Approved Meeting Minutes ITSA 802d3cx 0921.pdf](https://www.ieee802.org/3/cx/public/sept21/Approved_Meeting_Minutes_ITSA_802d3cx_0921.pdf)

FUTURE MEETINGS

- A follow-up meeting will be scheduled later this month, at a date to be announced, for the purpose of resolving unresolved D2.0 ballot comments.
- The next IEEE 802.3 interim meeting is scheduled to be in January 2022, and it will be virtual.

New Business

- There was no new business

Adjourn

- TF Chair announced that the meeting having completed the agenda, the meeting was adjourned.

Attendance

IEEE 802.3cx Improving PTP Timestamping Accuracy TF IEEE 802.3cx Virtual Plenary meeting, November 10, 2021				Nov. 10th						
By choosing to attend and sign in to this meeting, you acknowledge and agree that your personal data will be documented for IEEE standards development purposes to comply with policies and procedures, legal and accreditation requirements, and evaluation of patent claims by patent offices. See Front Page for additional information.										
Last Name	First Name	Employer	Affiliations	Wed.						
Anslow	Pete	Ciena	Ciena	x						
Armstrong	Greg	Renesas	Renesas	x						
Bhatt	Vipul	II-VI	II-VI	x						
Bordogna	Mark	Intel	Intel	x						
Brillhart	Theo	Fluke	Fluke	x						
Brooks	Paul	VIAVI	VIAVI	x						
Brown	Matt	Huawei	Huawei	x						
Bruckman	Leon	Huawei	Huawei	x						
Carty	Clark	Cisco	Cisco	x						
Chang	Jacky	HPE	HPE	x						
De Andrea	John	II-VI/Finisar	II-VI/Finisar	x						
de Koos	Andras	Microchip	Microchip	x						
Donthu	Suresh	Corning	Corning	x						
Dube	Kae	UNH-IOL	UNH-IOL	x						
Estes	Dave	Spirent	Spirent	x						
Feyh	German	Broadcom	Broadcom	x						
Gao	Sharon	Huawei	Huawei	x						
Gorshe	Steve	Microchip	Microchip	x						
Grow	Robert	RMG Consulting	RMG Consulting, KDPOF	x						
Gustlin	Mark	Cisco	Cisco	x						
Hajduczenia	Marek	Charter	Charter	x						
He	Xiang	Huawei	Huawei	x						
Huber	Tom	Nokia	Nokia	x						
Huh	Woojung	Microchip	Microchip	x						

Ishibe	Kazuhiko	Anritsu	Anritsu	x						
Isono	Hideki	Fujitsu	Fujitsu	x						
Kabra	Lokesh	Synopsis	Synopsis	x						
Kamino	John	OFS Optics	OFS Optics	x						
Kim	Yong	Tenstorrent	Tenstorrent	x						
Kiningham	Alan	i-pex	i-pex	x						
Kiselevsky	Itzik	Broadcom	Broadcom	x						
Law	David	HPE	HPE	x						
Little	Terry	Foxconn	Foxconn	x						
Lusted	Kent	Intel	Intel	x						
Lv	Jingfei	Huawei	Huawei	x						
Maki	Jeffery	Juniper Networks	Juniper	x						
Maniloff	Eric	Ciena	Ciena	x						
Marris	Arthur	Cisco	Cisco	x						
McKeown	Shane	Calnex	Calnex	x						
Meltser	Roman	NVIDIA	NVIDIA	x						
Muller	Shimon	Axalume	Axalume	x						
Nering	Ray	Cisco	Cisco	x						
Nicholl	Gary	Cisco	Cisco	x						
Nicholl	Shawn	Xilinx	Xilinx	x						
Ofelt	David	Juniper Networks	Juniper	x						
Opsasnick	Eugene	Broadcom	Broadcom	x						
Park	Charles	Juniper	Juniper	x						
Parkholm	Ulf	Ericsson	Ericsson	x						
Powell	Bill	Independent	Independent	x						
Rabinovich	Rick	Keysight	Keysight	x						
Rahn	Jeff	Meta	Meta	x						
Rechtman	Zvi	NVIDIA	NVIDIA	x						
Regev	Alon	Keysight	Keysight	x						
Ren	Hao	Huawei	Huawei	x						
Simms	Bill	NVIDIA	NVIDIA	x						

Slavick	Jeff	Broadcom	Broadcom	x						
Souvignier	Tom	Broadcom	Broadcom	x						
Trowbridge	Steve	Nokia	Nokia	x						
Tse	Richard	Microchip	Microchip	x						
Weaver	James	Arista	Arista	x						
Wienckowski	Natalie	GM	GM	x						
Wong	Denny	Xilinx	Xilinx	x						
Zhang	Tingting	Huawei	Huawei	x						