Cl **FM**	*SC* **FM**	*P* **13**	*L* **54**	# 54

Dudek, Mike   Marvell

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The written page numbers are not matching the pdf page numbers. These comments are based on the pdf page number.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix the discrepancy.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Correct the inconsistencies in the page numbers.

Cl **78**	*SC* **78.1.4**	*P* **13**	*L* **13**	# 18

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The editing instruction states "unchanged rows not shown" , however unchanged rows are shown in Table 78-1.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "(unchanged rows not shown)" to "(some unchanged rows not shown)".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **80**	*SC* **80.1.3**	*P* **15**	*L* **10**	# 19

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

There is a space between "and" and "in" that should be strike through.

SuggestedRemedy

Strike through space between "and" and "in" on line 10

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **80**	*SC* **80.1.3**	*P* **15**	*L* **11**	# 20

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

Use a non-breaking hyphen for "100GBASE-SR1"

SuggestedRemedy

Use a non-breaking hyphen for "100GBASE-SR1". Check , and fix as necessary, throughout the rest of the document.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Use non-breaking hyphen for 100GBASE-SR1 as well as other PMD names throughout the document.

Cl **80**	*SC* **80.1.4**	*P* **15**	*L* **18**	# 21

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The editing instruction states "(unchanged rows not shown)" , however unchanged rows are shown in Table 80-1.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "(unchanged rows not shown)" to "(some unchanged rows not shown)".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **80**	*SC* **80.4**	*P* **16**	*L* **51**	# 23

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The editing instruction states "(unchanged rows not shown)" , however unchanged rows are shown in Table 80-5.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "(unchanged rows not shown)" to "(some unchanged rows not shown)".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **80**
SC **80.4**

Page 1 of 6
8/11/2021 4:43:04 PM

Cl **91**   *SC* **91.5.2.7**   *P* **18**   *L* **10**   # 24

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

Missing space in editing instruction between "2018' and "and".

SuggestedRemedy

Insert missing space between "2018' and "and".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **91**   *SC* **91.5.2.7**   *P* **18**   *L* **13**   # 25

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The space following "100GBASE-SR1," should also be underlined as it also needs to be inserted.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline the space following "100GBASE-SR1,"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Check elsewhere in the document for this same error.

Cl **91**   *SC* **91.5.3.3**   *P* **18**   *L* **24**   # 26

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The space following "100GBASE-SR1," should also be underlined as it also needs to be inserted.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline the space following "100GBASE-SR1,"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Check elsewhere in the document for this same error.

Cl **91**   *SC* **91.5.3.3**   *P* **18**   *L* **31**   # 27

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1," should also be underlined as it also needs to be inserted.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline the space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1,"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Check elsewhere in the document for this same error.

Cl **91**   *SC* **91.5.3.3**   *P* **18**   *L* **38**   # 28

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1," should also be underlined as it also needs to be inserted.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline the space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1,"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Check elsewhere in the document for this same error.

Cl **91**   *SC* **91.5.3.3.1**   *P* **18**   *L* **46**   # 29

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1," should also be underlined as it also needs to be inserted.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline the space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1,"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Check elsewhere in the document for this same error.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **91**   Page 2 of 6
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **91.5.3.3.1**   8/11/2021 4:43:04 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **91**　　*SC* **91.6.2a**　　*P* **18**　　*L* **9**　　# **30**

Nicholl, Gary　　　　　　　　　Cisco

Comment Type **ER**　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Bucket*

The space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1," should also be underlined as it also needs to be inserted.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline the space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1," . Check and correct similar instances throughout the rest of the document.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Check elsewhere in the document for this same error.

Cl **116**　　*SC* **116.1.3**　　*P* **23**　　*L* **41**　　# **31**

Nicholl, Gary　　　　　　　　　Cisco

Comment Type **ER**　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Bucket*

The editing instruction states "(unchanged rows not shown)" , however unchanged rows are shown in Table 116-2.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "(unchanged rows not shown)" to "(some unchanged rows not shown)".

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **116**　　*SC* **116.1.4**　　*P* **25**　　*L* **36**　　# **34**

Nicholl, Gary　　　　　　　　　Cisco

Comment Type **ER**　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Bucket*

The wrong row in the table is udnerlined.

SuggestedRemedy

Underline the row for 400GBASE-SR4 and remove the underlining on the row for 400GBASE-SR4.2.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **167**　　*SC* **167.1**　　*P* **31**　　*L* **14**　　# **37**

Nicholl, Gary　　　　　　　　　Cisco

Comment Type **ER**　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Bucket*

"100GBASE-R PCS" wraps onto two lines in Figure 167.1. Same for "200GBASE-R" and "400GBSAE-R"

SuggestedRemedy

Update diagram to fit "100GBASE-R PCS", "200GBASE-R PCS" and "400GBASE-R PCS" on a single line, For an example, see 802.3cd-2018, Figure 138-1.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Update the diagram to fit those words on a single line.

Cl **167**　　*SC* **167.1**　　*P* **40**　　*L* **25**　　# **51**

Dudek, Mike　　　　　　　　　Marvell

Comment Type **TR**　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Bucket*

The 100G RX and CGMII are in clause 81 not 80 (as is shown correctly in table 80-5)

SuggestedRemedy

Change 80 to 81 two places.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change 80 to 81 in Table 167-1 in two places

Cl **167**　　*SC* **167.1**　　*P* **40**　　*L* **51**　　# **52**

Dudek, Mike　　　　　　　　　Marvell

Comment Type **E**　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Bucket*

unfortunate line break in the middle of a word

SuggestedRemedy

put "behave" on one line.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **167**
SC **167.1**

Page 3 of 6
8/11/2021 4:43:04 PM

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.5.4**   *P* **36**   *L* **21**   # 68

Ghiasi, Ali   Ghiasi Quantum/Marvell

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The Greater-less than and less than match symbols show up nu and Omega with Preview but its fine if viewed with Acrobat DC

SuggestedRemedy

Please correct so document is platform independent

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Use the symbols from the symbol page.

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.5.4**   *P* **36**   *L* **23**   # 38

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

"Table 167-7" in Table 167-5 should be a cross-reference

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Table 167-7" in Table 167-5 to a cross-reference.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Similar to comment #40. Change "Table 167-7" to "Table 167-8" and make the text a cross-reference.

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.5.4**   *P* **47**   *L* **23**   # 53

Dudek, Mike   Marvell

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The Average receive power each lane min is in Table 167-8 not Table 167-7 and should be a hot link.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to 167-8 and make it a hot link.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Similar to comment #38. Change "Table 167-7" to "Table 167-8" and make the text a cross-reference.

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.5.7**   *P* **48**   *L* **7**   # 55

Dudek, Mike   Marvell

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

Table 167-7 should be a hot link

SuggestedRemedy

fix it. Also on line 19

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Make text "Table 167-7" on line 7 and line 19 a cross-reference.

Also from Piers:
"Table 167-7" will be changed to a hot link
in sections 167.8.3 and 167.8.4.

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.7.1**   *P* **39**   *L* **7**   # 41

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The order of the parameters in Table 167-7 is not consistent with the order used in 802.3cu (see 802.3cu-2021 Table 151-7 as an example) or the parmeters listed in Table 167-11 and in sub-clause 167.8. There was a long discssion in 802.3cu on this topic, so probably best to correct it now (rather than waiting until working group ballot).

SuggestedRemedy

Reoder the parameters in Table 167-7 to be consistent with the order used in 802.3cu (see 802.3cu-2021 Table 151-7 as an example), and the order used in sub-clause 167.8 and Table 167-11.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
This will be implemented with editorial license noting that the parameters for MMF and SMF links are not identical.

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.7.1**   *P* **39**   *L* **26**   # 42

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

Overshoot/Undershoot is a maximum.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Overshoot/undershoot" to "Overshoot/undershoot (max)"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **167**
SC **167.7.1**

Page 4 of 6
8/11/2021 4:43:04 PM

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.7.1**   *P* **39**   *L* **41**   # 69

Ghiasi, Ali   Ghiasi Quantum/Marvell

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

Encircled flux Greater-less than and less than match symbols show up nu and Omega with Preview but its fine if viewed with Acrobat DC

SuggestedRemedy

Please correct so document is platform independent

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.8.5**   *P* **43**   *L* **27**   # 8

Le Cheminant, Greg   Keysight Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The concept of using two filters for the TDECQ measurement could be better understood and clearer to implement by describing the function of each filter

SuggestedRemedy

Update the existing text for the first as follows: (Line 27)..........The first filter represents the system receiver and has a 3 dB bandwidth of approximately 26.5625 GHz............(Line 29) The second filter represents the dispersion of the fiber and has a 3 dB bandwidth of approximately TBD GHz ....(Line 34) The first filter represents the system receiver and has a 3 dB bandwidth of approximately 26.5625 GHz ......(line 37) The second filter represents the dispersion of the fiber and has a 3 dB bandwidth of approximately 18 GHz with

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.8.5**   *P* **54**   *L* **15**   # 58

Dudek, Mike   Marvell

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The test patterns to be used for the test are in table 167-11 not 167-10

SuggestedRemedy

Change the reference to table 167-11

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.8.5**   *P* **54**   *L* **25**   # 61

Dudek, Mike   Marvell

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The comination of the O/e convertor and oscilloscope doesn't consist of two filters.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "the combination of the O/E converter and the oscilloscope used to measure the optical waveform consists of two cascaded filters" with
"the frequency response of the combination of the O/E converter and the oscilloscope used to measure the optical waveform is that of two cascaded filters".   Also on line 34. Also on page 55 line 28 if a separate comment I've made is not accepted.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement with editorial license.

Line 26 and 34 will read
"… the frequency response of the combination of the O/E converter and the oscilloscope used to measure the optical waveform is that of two cascaded filters."

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.8.6**   *P* **44**   *L* **28**   # 9

Le Cheminant, Greg   Keysight Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

If the comment submitted for 167.8.5 is implemented, 167.8.6 can be simplified using the proposed text change

SuggestedRemedy

replace the main paragraph of 167.8.6 with: The TECQ of each lane is measured using the methods specified for TDECQ in 167.8.5 except the second filter representing the dispersion of the fiber is not used.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The text will be changed to read

"The TECQ of each lane is measured using the methods specified for TDECQ in 167.8.5 except that the second filter representing the dispersion of the fiber is not used."

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **167**
SC **167.8.6**

Page 5 of 6
8/11/2021 4:43:04 PM

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.8.6**   *P* **55**   *L* **28**   *#* 59

Dudek, Mike   Marvell

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

It would be possible to make this section significantly clearer for the implementer

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "The TECQ of each lane is measured using the methods specified for TDECQ in 167.8.5 except the combination of the O/E converter and the oscilloscope used to measure the optical waveform has a 3 dB bandwidth of approximately 26.5625 GHz with a fourth-order Bessel-Thomson response to at least 1.3 × 53.125 GHz. At frequencies above 1.3 × 53.125 GHz, the response should not exceed □24 dB. Compensation may be made for any deviation from an ideal fourth-order Bessel-Thomson" with either
"The TECQ of each lane is measured using the methods specified for TDECQ in 167.8.5 except that instead of using the two cascaded filters just the first is used." or
"The TECQ of each lane is measured using the methods specified for TDECQ in 167.8.5 except that the second filter is omitted of the two cascaded filters"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See response to comment #9.

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.8.13**   *P* **46**   *L* **28**   *#* 49

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The first paragraph makes references to "121.8.10.1", "121.8.10.3" and "121.8.5.2" in 802.3-2018. These references do not exisit in this specification. Perhaps the correct references should be "121.8.9.1", "121.8.9.3" and "121.8.9.2" in keeping with 802.3cd-2018, sub-clause 138.8.10 ?

SuggestedRemedy

Change "121.8.10.1" to "121.8.9.1"

Change "121.8.10.3" to "121.8.9.3"

Change "121.8.5.2" to "121.8.9.2"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.8.13**   *P* **46**   *L* **46**   *#* 50

Nicholl, Gary   Cisco

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

Need to add another exception to the list to make it clear that the values of over/under-shoot and transmitter power excursion of the stressed receiver conformance test signal are within the limits specified in Table 167-7.

SuggestedRemedy

Add an additional exception to the list to state that the the values of over/under-shoot and transmitter power excursion of the stressed receiver conformance test signal are within the limits specified in Table 167-7. See 802.3cu-2021, sub-clause 151.8.13 as an example.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

The exception to be added in section 167.8.13 will read

"The values of overshoot/undershoot and transmitter power excursion of the stressed receiver conformance signal are within the limits specified in Table 167-7."

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.10**   *P* **59**   *L* **33**   *#* 62

Dudek, Mike   Marvell

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

Should be 200GBASE-VR2 on line 33 and 400GBASE-VR4 on line 34

SuggestedRemedy

Change them.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "200BASE-VR" to "200GBASE-VR2" on line 32 and "400GBASE-VR" to "400GBASE-VR4" on line 34.

Cl **167**   *SC* **167.10.2.2.1**   *P* **50**   *L* **11**   *#* 73

Ghiasi, Ali   Ghiasi Quantum/Marvell

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Bucket*

The Greater-less than and less than match symbols show up nu and Omega with Preview but its fine if viewed with Acrobat DC

SuggestedRemedy

Please correct so document is platform independent

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Use the symbols from the symbol page.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **167**   Page 6 of 6
SC **167.10.2.2.1**   8/11/2021 4:43:04 PM