

IEEE 802.3db D1.1 100G, 200G, 400G Short Reach Fiber Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P **13** L **54** # **54**  
 Dudek, Mike Marvell  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** Bucket  
 The written page numbers are not matching the pdf page numbers. These comments are based on the pdf page number.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix the discrepancy.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Correct the inconsistencies in the page numbers.

Cl **78** SC **78.1.4** P **13** L **13** # **18**  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** Bucket  
 The editing instruction states "unchanged rows not shown" , however unchanged rows are shown in Table 78-1.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "(unchanged rows not shown)" to "(some unchanged rows not shown)".  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **80** SC **80.1.3** P **15** L **10** # **19**  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** Bucket  
 There is a space between "and" and "in" that should be strike through.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Strike through space between "and" and "in" on line 10  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **80** SC **80.1.3** P **15** L **11** # **20**  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** Bucket  
 Use a non-breaking hyphen for "100GBASE-SR1"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use a non-breaking hyphen for "100GBASE-SR1". Check , and fix as necessary, throughout the rest of the document.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Use non-breaking hyphen for 100GBASE-SR1 as well as other PMD names throughout the document.

Cl **80** SC **80.1.4** P **15** L **18** # **21**  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** Bucket  
 The editing instruction states "(unchanged rows not shown)" , however unchanged rows are shown in Table 80-1.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "(unchanged rows not shown)" to "(some unchanged rows not shown)".  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **80** SC **80.4** P **16** L **51** # **23**  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** Bucket  
 The editing instruction states "(unchanged rows not shown)" , however unchanged rows are shown in Table 80-5.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "(unchanged rows not shown)" to "(some unchanged rows not shown)".  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3db D1.1 100G, 200G, 400G Short Reach Fiber Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 91 SC 91.5.2.7 P18 L10 # 24  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Bucket  
 Missing space in editing instruction between "2018' and "and".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Insert missing space between "2018' and "and".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 91 SC 91.5.2.7 P18 L13 # 25  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Bucket  
 The space following "100GBASE-SR1," should also be underlined as it also needs to be inserted.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Underline the space following "100GBASE-SR1,"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Check elsewhere in the document for this same error.

Cl 91 SC 91.5.3.3 P18 L24 # 26  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Bucket  
 The space following "100GBASE-SR1," should also be underlined as it also needs to be inserted.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Underline the space following "100GBASE-SR1,"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Check elsewhere in the document for this same error.

Cl 91 SC 91.5.3.3 P18 L31 # 27  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Bucket  
 The space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1," should also be underlined as it also needs to be inserted.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Underline the space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1,"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Check elsewhere in the document for this same error.

Cl 91 SC 91.5.3.3 P18 L38 # 28  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Bucket  
 The space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1," should also be underlined as it also needs to be inserted.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Underline the space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1,"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Check elsewhere in the document for this same error.

Cl 91 SC 91.5.3.3.1 P18 L46 # 29  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Bucket  
 The space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1," should also be underlined as it also needs to be inserted.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Underline the space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1,"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Check elsewhere in the document for this same error.

IEEE 802.3db D1.1 100G, 200G, 400G Short Reach Fiber Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 91 SC 91.6.2a P18 L9 # 30  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Bucket  
 The space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1," should also be underlined as it also needs to be inserted.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Underline the space following "100GBASE-VR1," and the space following "100GBASE-SR1," . Check and correct similar instances throughout the rest of the document.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Check elsewhere in the document for this same error.

Cl 116 SC 116.1.3 P23 L41 # 31  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Bucket  
 The editing instruction states "(unchanged rows not shown)" , however unchanged rows are shown in Table 116-2.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "(unchanged rows not shown)" to "(some unchanged rows not shown)".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 116 SC 116.1.4 P25 L36 # 34  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Bucket  
 The wrong row in the table is underlined.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Underline the row for 400GBASE-SR4 and remove the underlining on the row for 400GBASE-SR4.2.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 167 SC 167.1 P31 L14 # 37  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Bucket  
 "100GBASE-R PCS" wraps onto two lines in Figure 167.1. Same for "200GBASE-R" and "400GBASE-R"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Update diagram to fit "100GBASE-R PCS", "200GBASE-R PCS" and "400GBASE-R PCS" on a single line. For an example, see 802.3cd-2018, Figure 138-1.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Update the diagram to fit those words on a single line.

Cl 167 SC 167.1 P40 L25 # 51  
 Dudek, Mike Marvell  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D Bucket  
 The 100G RX and CGMII are in clause 81 not 80 (as is shown correctly in table 80-5)  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change 80 to 81 two places.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Change 80 to 81 in Table 167-1 in two places

Cl 167 SC 167.1 P40 L51 # 52  
 Dudek, Mike Marvell  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket  
 unfortunate line break in the middle of a word  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 put "behave" on one line.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3db D1.1 100G, 200G, 400G Short Reach Fiber Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 167 SC 167.5.4 P36 L21 # 68  
 Ghiasi, Ali Ghiasi Quantum/Marvell  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D Bucket  
 The Greater-less than and less than match symbols show up nu and Omega with Preview but its fine if viewed with Acrobat DC  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Please correct so document is platform independent  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Use the symbols from the symbol page.

Cl 167 SC 167.5.4 P36 L23 # 38  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Bucket  
 "Table 167-7" in Table 167-5 should be a cross-reference  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "Table 167-7" in Table 167-5 to a cross-reference.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Similar to comment #40. Change "Table 167-7" to "Table 167-8" and make the text a cross-reference.

Cl 167 SC 167.5.4 P47 L23 # 53  
 Dudek, Mike Marvell  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket  
 The Average receive power each lane min is in Table 167-8 not Table 167-7 and should be a hot link.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to 167-8 and make it a hot link.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Similar to comment #38. Change "Table 167-7" to "Table 167-8" and make the text a cross-reference.

Cl 167 SC 167.5.7 P48 L7 # 55  
 Dudek, Mike Marvell  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket  
 Table 167-7 should be a hot link  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 fix it. Also on line 19  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Make text "Table 167-7" on line 7 and line 19 a cross-reference.  
 Also from Piers:  
 "Table 167-7" will be changed to a hot link in sections 167.8.3 and 167.8.4.

Cl 167 SC 167.7.1 P39 L7 # 41  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Bucket  
 The order of the parameters in Table 167-7 is not consistent with the order used in 802.3cu (see 802.3cu-2021 Table 151-7 as an example) or the parameters listed in Table 167-11 and in sub-clause 167.8. There was a long discssion in 802.3cu on this topic, so probably best to correct it now (rather than waiting until working group ballot).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Reoder the parameters in Table 167-7 to be consistent with the order used in 802.3cu (see 802.3cu-2021 Table 151-7 as an example), and the order used in sub-clause 167.8 and Table 167-11.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 This will be implemented with editorial license noting that the parameters for MMF and SMF links are not identical.

Cl 167 SC 167.7.1 P39 L26 # 42  
 Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D Bucket  
 Overshoot/Undershoot is a maximum.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "Overshoot/undershoot" to "Overshoot/undershoot (max)"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3db D1.1 100G, 200G, 400G Short Reach Fiber Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 167 SC 167.7.1 P39 L41 # 69  
 Ghiasi, Ali Ghiasi Quantum/Marvell  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D Bucket  
 Encircled flux Greater-less than and less than match symbols show up nu and Omega with Preview but its fine if viewed with Acrobat DC  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Please correct so document is platform independent  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 167 SC 167.8.5 P43 L27 # 8  
 Le Cheminant, Greg Keysight Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket  
 The concept of using two filters for the TDECQ measurement could be better understood and clearer to implement by describing the function of each filter  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Update the existing text for the first as follows: (Line 27).....The first filter represents the system receiver and has a 3 dB bandwidth of approximately 26.5625 GHz.....(Line 29) The second filter represents the dispersion of the fiber and has a 3 dB bandwidth of approximately TBD GHz .....(Line 34) The first filter represents the system receiver and has a 3 dB bandwidth of approximately 26.5625 GHz .....(line 37) The second filter represents the dispersion of the fiber and has a 3 dB bandwidth of approximately 18 GHz with  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 167 SC 167.8.5 P54 L15 # 58  
 Dudek, Mike Marvell  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket  
 The test patterns to be used for the test are in table 167-11 not 167-10  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change the reference to table 167-11  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 167 SC 167.8.5 P54 L25 # 61  
 Dudek, Mike Marvell  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D Bucket  
 The combination of the O/e convertor and oscilloscope doesn't consist of two filters.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace "the combination of the O/E converter and the oscilloscope used to measure the optical waveform consists of two cascaded filters" with "the frequency response of the combination of the O/E converter and the oscilloscope used to measure the optical waveform is that of two cascaded filters". Also on line 34. Also on page 55 line 28 if a separate comment I've made is not accepted.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Implement with editorial license.  
 Line 26 and 34 will read  
 "... the frequency response of the combination of the O/E converter and the oscilloscope used to measure the optical waveform is that of two cascaded filters."

Cl 167 SC 167.8.6 P44 L28 # 9  
 Le Cheminant, Greg Keysight Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket  
 If the comment submitted for 167.8.5 is implemented, 167.8.6 can be simplified using the proposed text change  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 replace the main paragraph of 167.8.6 with: The TECQ of each lane is measured using the methods specified for TDECQ in 167.8.5 except the second filter representing the dispersion of the fiber is not used.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 The text will be changed to read  
 "The TECQ of each lane is measured using the methods specified for TDECQ in 167.8.5 except that the second filter representing the dispersion of the fiber is not used."

IEEE 802.3db D1.1 100G, 200G, 400G Short Reach Fiber Task Force 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 167 SC 167.8.6 P55 L28 # 59

Dudek, Mike Marvell  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket

It would be possible to make this section significantly clearer for the implementer

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace "The TECQ of each lane is measured using the methods specified for TDECQ in 167.8.5 except the combination of the O/E converter and the oscilloscope used to measure the optical waveform has a 3 dB bandwidth of approximately 26.5625 GHz with a fourth-order Bessel-Thomson response to at least 1.3 x 53.125 GHz. At frequencies above 1.3 x 53.125 GHz, the response should not exceed □24 dB. Compensation may be made for any deviation from an ideal fourth-order Bessel-Thomson" with either "The TECQ of each lane is measured using the methods specified for TDECQ in 167.8.5 except that instead of using the two cascaded filters just the first is used." or "The TECQ of each lane is measured using the methods specified for TDECQ in 167.8.5 except that the second filter is omitted of the two cascaded filters"

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See response to comment #9.

Cl 167 SC 167.8.13 P46 L28 # 49

Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D Bucket

The first paragraph makes references to "121.8.10.1", "121.8.10.3" and "121.8.5.2" in 802.3-2018. These references do not exist in this specification. Perhaps the correct references should be "121.8.9.1", "121.8.9.3" and "121.8.9.2" in keeping with 802.3cd-2018, sub-clause 138.8.10 ?

*SuggestedRemedy*

- Change "121.8.10.1" to "121.8.9.1"
- Change "121.8.10.3" to "121.8.9.3"
- Change "121.8.5.2" to "121.8.9.2"

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 167 SC 167.8.13 P46 L46 # 50

Nicholl, Gary Cisco  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D Bucket

Need to add another exception to the list to make it clear that the values of over/under-shoot and transmitter power excursion of the stressed receiver conformance test signal are within the limits specified in Table 167-7.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add an additional exception to the list to state that the the values of over/under-shoot and transmitter power excursion of the stressed receiver conformance test signal are within the limits specified in Table 167-7. See 802.3cu-2021, sub-clause 151.8.13 as an example.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

The exception to be added in section 167.8.13 will read

"The values of overshoot/undershoot and transmitter power excursion of the stressed receiver conformance signal are within the limits specified in Table 167-7."

Cl 167 SC 167.10 P59 L33 # 62

Dudek, Mike Marvell  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Bucket

Should be 200GBASE-VR2 on line 33 and 400GBASE-VR4 on line 34

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change them.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "200BASE-VR" to "200GBASE-VR2" on line 32 and "400GBASE-VR" to "400GBASE-VR4" on line 34.

Cl 167 SC 167.10.2.2.1 P50 L11 # 73

Ghiasi, Ali Ghiasi Quantum/Marvell  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D Bucket

The Greater-less than and less than match symbols show up nu and Omega with Preview but its fine if viewed with Acrobat DC

*SuggestedRemedy*

Please correct so document is platform independent

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use the symbols from the symbol page.