

# **P802.3dj D2.0**

## **Comment Resolution Agenda**

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief

Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor

Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor

Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

# Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 2.0 comment resolution.
  - This version of the agenda is focused on the agenda for Day #3 through Day #5
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- ❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks (logic, electrical, and optical).
  - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

# Comment resolution

## Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
  - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
  - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
  - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
  - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
  - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
  - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”  
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

Source: [https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24\\_05/brown\\_3dj\\_01\\_2405.pdf](https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf)

# We are here...

745 comments received  
 16 comments withdrawn  
 298 comments resolved in bucket #1  
 145 comments resolved on the floor  
 459 comment resolved total  
 286 total comments to resolve  
 69 common-track comments to resolve  
 108 electrical-track comments to resolve  
 56 logic-track comments to resolve  
 53 optical-track comments to resolve

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
00	0	0	1	0	0	1	1	1	2
1	2	0	2	2	0	2	0	8	8
116	5	0	6	2	0	6	6	13	19
119	2	0	2	2	0	3	7	2	9
120	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
120F	1	0	0	0	0	1	0	2	2
169	8	0	7	1	0	3	5	14	19
170	0	0	1	0	0	1	2	0	2
171	2	0	1	0	0	2	1	4	5
172	3	0	1	0	0	2	2	4	6
173	1	0	4	0	0	0	2	3	5
174	1	0	5	0	0	3	3	6	9
174A	1	0	4	9	0	13	6	21	27
175	2	0	3	1	0	10	10	6	16
176	3	0	3	1	0	10	8	9	17
176B	6	0	6	0	0	1	1	12	13
176C	1	0	5	0	0	18	19	5	24
176D	1	0	7	2	0	27	31	6	37
177	10	0	4	3	0	17	10	24	34
177A	0	0	0	0	0	3	3	0	3
178	7	0	14	12	0	34	41	26	67
178A	0	0	0	0	0	14	14	0	14
178B	37	0	19	0	0	24	14	66	80
179	2	0	9	8	0	50	53	16	69
179A	0	0	3	0	0	5	5	3	8
179B	4	0	2	2	0	17	18	7	25
179C	0	0	2	0	0	2	3	1	4
180	2	0	9	0	0	22	24	9	33
180A	1	0	1	1	0	0	2	1	3
181	3	0	2	0	0	12	12	5	17
182	0	0	3	0	0	13	13	3	16
183	3	0	1	1	0	8	9	4	13
184	6	0	5	0	0	2	2	11	13
185	0	0	0	1	0	11	11	1	12
185A	2	0	6	0	0	1	5	4	9
186	11	0	10	4	0	7	8	24	32
186A	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
187	1	0	3	1	0	6	9	2	11
30	2	0	2	0	0	4	0	8	8
45	11	0	6	10	0	3	3	27	30
69	0	0	0	0	0	6	0	6	6
73	5	0	2	0	0	3	3	7	10
73A	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
FM	3	0	0	1	0	1	0	5	5
Total	149	0	162	64	0	370	367	378	745

# Comment resolution sequence

Meeting Date	Business and Tracks
Day #1: 2025/7/9 (electronic session)	opening business for electronic session common (no commenter presentations)
Day #2: 2025/7/10 (electronic session)	common (no commenter presentations) post report with comments closed so far after close of meeting
Day #3: 2025/7/14 (electronic session)	bucket #1 motion common track
Day #4: 2025/7/15 (electronic session)	electrical track
Day #5: 2025/7/16 (electronic session)	common + electrical track closing business for electronic session post report with comments closed so far after close of meeting
Day #6: 2025/7/23 (plenary session)	opening business for plenary session presentations and related discussion no comment resolution
Day #7: 2025/7/28 (plenary session)	bucket #2 motion (contingent) agenda TBD (common track, single meeting)
Day #8: 2025/7/29 (plenary session)	agenda TBD (electrical/optical/logic tracks, parallel meetings)
Day #9: 2025/7/30 (plenary session)	agenda TBD (electrical/optical/logic tracks, parallel meetings)
Day #10: 2025/7/31 (plenary session)	agenda TBD (common track, single meeting) closing business for plenary session

# Common #1

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
MDI references (E)	179C	<del>483</del>
PLI delay	169	<del>341W</del>
PMD instantiations	174	<del>693</del>
Data/training mode (O/E)	179-183 116, 169, 174	[ <del>191</del> , <del>190</del> , <del>192</del> , <del>193</del> , <del>195</del> , <del>196</del> , <del>198</del> , <del>brown_03</del> ] [ <del>163</del> , <del>166</del> , <del>177</del> ]
Precoding (O/E)	176C/D, 179 180 - 183	[ <del>534</del> , <del>532</del> , <del>533</del> ] [ <del>530</del> , <del>531</del> ]
MII FLR	171	<del>685</del>
Error ratio figure and paths	174A	<del>590</del> , [292, 106], <del>brown_03</del>
block error ratio interpretation	174A	<del>137</del> , <del>401</del> , <del>409</del>
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Common #2

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
ILT jargon	<del>116, 169</del>	<del>[732, 681]</del>
ILT description types	<del>116, 169, 174</del>	<del>[53, 164, 167, 297, 733]</del>
ILT extender	<del>178B</del>	<del>421</del>
ILT adjacent SI	<del>178B</del>	<del>123, 448 brown_03a</del>
ILT terminology	<del>178B</del>	<del>[226, 118], 228</del>
ILT frames	<del>178B</del>	<del>111</del>
ILT function	<del>178B</del>	<del>375</del>
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Common #3

# Day #3/#5

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
ILT local_pattern PAM4 (O/E)	178B, 178, 183	415, [416, 417], ran_02
ILT enable	178B	[126, 124, 234], 294
ILT retimer	178B	376
ILT state diagrams	178B	[130, 627, 628], [459, 626, bruckman_04], 632
ILT types	178B	[634, 450, 229]
AN host types	73A	42, lusted_02
Topics below are deferred.		
ILT layout	178B	225
ILT PHY tables	116, 169, 174	[232, 233, 234] (need straw poll and details, likely defer to Plenary)
ILT scope	178B	52, [222, 412] [220, 374, 424, 553], 290, [116, 415], 498-brown_03a 484
block error ratio instruction	174A	405
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1 Magenta highlight: likely addressing using bucket #2		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation



# Common #4

# Day #5

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
FLR allocation for 800GBASE-ER1	174A	585, nicholl_02
ILT coherent (O)	178B, 185, 187, 169	397, mi_01 [418, 400, 547, 548, 549, mi_01, ran_03], [419, 550, 551, 552, ran_03], 546
Coefficient table *new*	180 - 183	321
ILT timers	178B	[460, slavick_01]
Will continue with remaining comments on Electrical #1 (next slide) if we get to here on Day #5.		
<p>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</p> <p>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1</p> <p>Magenta highlight: likely addressing using bucket #2</p>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Electrical Track #1 (95)

# Day #4/#5

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Reference impedance (40)	178, 179, 176C, 176D	[ <del>59, 60, 61, 62, 63, 64, 65, 66, 236, 237, 238, 239, 514, 595, 596, 597, 598, 599, 606, 607, 608, 609, 611, 612, 613, 614, 615, 616, 617, 618, 620, 621, 622, 623, 624</del> ] 235-610 ran_01 swenson_01, <del>653</del> ] 515
GOM quantization noise (19)	178, 179, 176C, 176D, 178A	[ <del>243</del> 244, 245, 246, 247, 248, 249, 250, 251, 252, 253, 254, 255, 256, 257, 258, 259, 260, 261 comment_243_attachment ran_01]
Negative $\Delta$ GOM (1)	178A	262
SNDR (9)	178, 179, 176D	[ <del>481</del> 351 736 737 355 356 414 542 ran_01] 357
Channel ILdd (6)	178, 176C, 179	[ <del>535</del> 536 537 482] [ <del>138</del> 529]
AC common mode (5)	178C, 178D	359 [ <del>354</del> 504 <del>506</del> 507 ran_01]
CR host classes / host channel (5)	179	[ <del>370</del> 372 373 ran_01] 720 735
AC coupling (3)	178, 176C, 176D	[ <del>543</del> 323] 447
BER_added (2)	178C, 178D	39 <del>41</del>
Amplitude tolerance (2)	179, 176D	[ <del>410</del> 667 ran_01]
ILdc/ILcd (2)	176C, 179B	503 516 ran_01
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1 Magenta highlight: likely addressing using bucket #2		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, ## = editorial slides, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Electrical Track #2 (47)

Days #4 to #10

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
CR test fixtures (8)	179A, 179B	[ <u>289</u> 513 594 601] [ <u>512</u> 600] 658 660
ERL Tfx (2)	179, 176D	[139 361 ran_01]
KR channel / link diagram (6)	178	319 [ <u>92</u> 302 303 304 640 ran_01]
KR test fixture diagram (1)	178	306 [ran_01]
Mated test fixtures ILdd (5)	179B	[44 45 <u>46</u> ] 43 136
RLdc and RLcd (5)	178, 179, 176C, 176D	[492 <u>493</u> 494 dudek_01] [368 <u>365</u> ]
FOM_ILD and ICN (3)	179B	[604 605 kocsis_01] 47
COM (2)	178, 176D	655 480
SCMR (3)	178, 179	<u>48</u> [ <u>49</u> 50]
DC common mode (1)	179	446
ERL (3)	179, 176D	371 360
Tx equalizer (2)	178, 176D	706 463
Host connector (3)	176D, 179A	413 654 502
C2M ILT (1)	176D	324
ITOL / JTOL (3)	178, 179	745 496 497
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. <u>Cyan highlight</u> : pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, ## = editorial slides, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Common #3

## Day #6 to #10

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
AN timeout and ILT timers	119, 172, 175, 73, 45	[441, 442, 443, 444, 445] [420, 466 slavick_02]
ILT timers	178B	[269, wang_xx]
Block error ratio vs BER (O)	180-183, 174A, 176D	395, 396, 394, 593, 411, 721, 404, mi_03, he_m_01
TDECQ (O)	180-183	1, el-chayeb_01, cole_01
TDECQ (O)	180-183	[384, 381, 382, 383, 393], 592, ghiasi_04
TDECQ taps (O)	180-183	[392, 343, 345, 347, 349, 430, 508, ghiasi_03]
legacy 50 ppm	176B	263, nicholl_01
Bucket #1 pulls (not sorted)		729, 162, 731, 671, 673, 679, 57, 682, 692, 58, 105, 407, 227, 54, 119, 325, 55, 129
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Electrical Track #3 (11)

Days #6 & #10

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
MDI (2)	179C	519 438
package class (1)	176C	[362 ran_03]
R_peak (1)	176D	[412 mi_02]
Presets and Tx max swing (2)	179	666 668
AN max voltage (1)	73	455
RLM (1)	179	526
SNR_ISI (1)	178	495
Frequency masks (5)		[363 364 369 366 367 ghiasi_xx]
VEC (2)	176D	352 353
Comments pulled from bucket #1		301, 348,, 378, 643, 707, 708, 709, 710, 712, 713, 714, 715, 646, 647, 648, 649, 717, 718, 719, 734, 738, 739, 741, 742, 743, 141, 505, 656, 511
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, ## = editorial slides, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Optical Track

## Day #8 & #9

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Coherent parameters	185, 187	387, 390, 388, [385, 386, 389, 399, maniloff_01]
Slew rate	185	398
Receiver sensitivity	185	2
ETCC	185A	386, 385, 11, 12, 13, 14, [625, kota_01]
IMDD parameters	180-183	[16, 15, 17, 18, 342, 19, 20, 22, 23, 24, 21, 344, 25, 27, 26, 29, 30, 31, 32, 28, 346, 33, 35, 34, 288, 287, 286, johnson_01, ghiasi_02]
CeQ	180-183	[491, 490, 488, 489]
Fiber specs	180-183	285
Annex title	180A	[51, 520]
ILT optical tuning (O)	178B	377, ghiasi_01
Comments pulled from bucket #1		329, 330, 96, 104, 523
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Logic track #1

## Day #8 & #9

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
FEC bin counters	119, 177, 45, 184	68, [561, 282, 283], 570, nicholl_01
PCS stateless encoder/decoder	175, 119, 172	[669, 432, 433, 331, 339, 584, 431, 676, 670, nicholl_01]
AM Padding	175	454
PCS delay constraint	175	589, nicholl_01
Test patterns	177	189
Test vectors	177A 186A	[453, 294, he_x_01], 110 334
ER1 loopback	186	208 (need one editorial slide)
ER1 pad bits	186	[98, 214], 97
ER1 error monitoring	186	[451, 452], 326
ER1 OH	186	218
Comments pulled from bucket #1		582, 296, 683, 684, 686, 689, 690, 69, 72, 298, 694, 9, 75, 76, 77, 79, 179, 695, 696, 88, 569, 699, 701, 702, 703, 704, 200
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author\_nn] = related presentation

# Buckets

## Day #3

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:

[https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D2p0/8023dj\\_D2p0\\_comments\\_proposed\\_id\\_bucket1.pdf](https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D2p0/8023dj_D2p0_comments_proposed_id_bucket1.pdf)

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1 (so far):

9, 48, 54, 55, 57, 58, 69, 72, 75, 76, 77, 79, 88, 96, 104, 105, 119, 129\*, 141, 162, 179, 200, 227, 296, 298, 301, 321, 325, 329, 330, 348, 363, 364, 366, 367, 369\*, 378, 380, 407, 505, 511, 523, 569, 582, 590, 643, 646, 647, 648, 649, 656, 671, 673, 679, 682, 683, 684, 686, 689, 690, 692, 694, 695, 696, 699, 701, 702, 703, 704, 707, 708, 709, 710, 712, 713, 714, 715, 717, 718, 719, 729, 731, 734, 738, 739, 741, 742, 743

Bucket #2:

The following comments are likely to be addressed in bucket #2:

225, 405, 553, 437, 438



# Withdrawn

The following comments have been withdrawn:

588, 38, 522, 524, 422, 435, 341, 129, 391, 409, 619, 369, 425, 426, 427, 428