

P802.3dj D2.2

Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief

Gary Nicholl, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor

Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor

Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the **Draft 2.2** comment resolution.
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- ❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks (logic, electrical, and optical).
 - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution procedure

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
 - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
 - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
 - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
 - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
 - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
 - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

All comment responses closed by the CRG are approved by the task force by a technical motion.

We are here...

Comment summary (so far):
427 received
11 withdrawn
182 in bucket #1 (3 pulled from bucket)
237 total comments to resolve

105 Common track (optical 38, PSU 59, other 8)
61 Electrical track
19 Logic track
49 Optical track

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
00	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1
116	0	0	1	0	0	6	7	0	7
119	4	0	5	0	0	4	13	0	13
120	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
169	1	0	0	0	0	3	4	0	4
172	1	0	2	0	0	1	4	0	4
174	1	0	0	1	0	2	4	0	4
174A	0	0	3	1	0	5	9	0	9
175	2	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	2
175A	1	0	1	0	0	0	2	0	2
176	2	0	4	0	0	0	6	0	6
176B	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
176C	2	0	2	0	0	9	12	1	13
176D	3	0	3	1	0	10	16	1	17
177	2	0	6	0	0	3	11	0	11
178	3	0	10	0	0	14	27	0	27
178A	0	0	0	0	0	2	2	0	2
178B	14	0	11	5	0	27	57	0	57
179	5	0	9	4	0	19	36	1	37
179A	0	0	0	3	0	1	4	0	4
179B	6	0	3	2	0	5	15	1	16
179C	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
180	9	0	10	4	0	54	74	3	77
180A	0	0	2	0	0	0	2	0	2
181	1	0	0	1	0	15	16	1	17
182	3	0	0	0	0	19	20	2	22
183	2	0	4	0	0	16	22	0	22
184	6	0	2	0	0	1	9	0	9
185	2	0	1	1	0	2	6	0	6
185A	0	0	3	0	0	0	3	0	3
186	7	0	2	1	0	11	21	0	21
186A	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
187	4	0	0	0	0	1	5	0	5
73	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
73A	0	0	1	0	0	1	2	0	2
Total	82	0	85	24	0	236	416	11	427

Comment resolution summary

Meeting Date	Business and Tracks
Day #1: 2025/11/10 Monday	Opening business Bucket #1 motion Common track comments PM1/PM2 (likely PM3)
Day #2: 2025/11/11 Tuesday	Common track comments AM1/AM2 Optical track PM1/PM2 (tentatively PM3) Electrical track PM1/PM2 (tentatively PM3) Logic track PM1/PM2 (tentatively PM3)
Day #3: 2025/11/12 Wednesday	Electrical track AM1/AM2/PM1/PM2 Optical track AM1/AM2/PM1/PM2
Day #4: 2025/11/13 Thursday	Liaison motions, etc. Common-track comments Any other remaining comments Closing business

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Block error ratio acronym	174A	18, brown_03
test methods	174A, 178+, 180-183	166
		(below after common-optical complete)
block error ratio	174A	307
Rx tests	179+	202, 203
test blocks	174A	312, brown_03
test methods	174A, 178+	188, 189
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Common-ILT Track {#}

Day #1/4

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
PSU: Rename PSU	178B	412
PSU: Polarity correction	178B, 180-183	180, brown_03
		(below after common-optical complete)
PSU: Definitions	178B	[414, 11, 318], brown_03 350, 413
PSU: Scope	178B	237
PSU: wording	MANY	[150, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39, 40, 42, 43, 44, 45, 46, 47, 49, 50, 51, 53, 56, 61, 62, 63, 64, 66, 67, 68, 69, 71, 153, 240, 242, brown_03]
PSU: LOCAL_PATTERN mode	178B	149
PSU: psu state diagrams	178B	[351, slavick_01], 222, 291, [315, wang_01], 340, 344
PSU: variables	178B	236, 292, 336, 19
PSU: timers	178B	221
PSU: ILT for coherent PMDs	184	219, ran_03
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Common-Optical Track {#}

Day #1/2

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Remove TX TQM test		nowell_3dj_adhoc_01a_251030, ghiasi_02, chayeb_02, rodes_01, cole_01
TDECQ DFE tap		136
Jitter		139, 160, 224, 256, 257, 258, 259
TDECQ_CER		137, 247, 248, 249, 250, 226
TFSEM	180-183	138
TDECQ mission mode	180-183	[265, 275, 267, 269, 270]
TDECQ, DFE behaviour	180-183	227
CER TDECQ	180-183	117, 118, chayeb_01
CER TDECQ limit	180-183	[261, 262, 263, 264, ghiasi_03]
Tx FRx, AUI jitter	180-183	[266, 268]
Tx FRx, ILT	180-183	[278, 279, 280, 281]
Tx FRx, receiver specs	180-183	82
jitter limit	180-183	207, calvin_01
jitter test pattern	180-183, 176, 177	4, 5
Jitter {3}	176D 179	[201 ran_02] [358 359], calvin_01
VEC (EECQ) {2}	176D	276 277 calvin_01
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical Track {#}

Day #2/3

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
ETCC	185A	120, 251, temprana_01
CD penalty LR4	180, 181, 182, 183	[<u>432</u> , 433, 434, 435, he_01]
OMA outer	180	211
overshoot	180, 181, 182, 183	223, [<u>252</u> , 253, 254, 255]
RINxxOMA	180	214
Rx Sensitivity	180, 181, 182, 183	[<u>98</u> , 100, 101, 102]
signaling rate	180	10
TX FRx test pattern	181, 182, 183	[<u>103</u> , 104, 105]
Tx FRx	180-183	99, 72, 226, 193, 191, 317, [<u>191</u> , 194, 229], issenhuth_01
Tx FRx, xxx	180-183	[225, 155], 228, 230, [271, 272, 273, 274], issenhuth_01
TDECQ	180	<u>8, 316, 116, 231</u>
CER TDECQ	180-183	[<u>114</u> , 6, 115], [<u>7</u> , 260, 112, 113], chaye_01
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. <u>Cyan highlight</u> : pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical Track {57}

Day #2/3

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Loss budget {4}	179 176D 179A	[232 heck_01] 204 [233 heck_02]
MTF requirements {2}	179B	[301 302 kocsis_01]
CA minimum loss {1}	179	303
Test fixtures {5}	179 179B	299 141 167 306
Partial host channel {1}	179	300
Test points {2}	179	397 [396 406 swenson_01]
SCMR_CH {2}	179	[111 304 ellison_01]
Rx tests {11}	178 179 176C 176D	[355 174] [179 176] [79 80] 110 173 175 178 108
RLdc {2}	179	142 177
Single-ended input tolerance {1}	176D	81
Tx signaling rate {1}	178	9
SNDR {1}	179	361
R_peak {3}	179 176D [178 176C?]	[200 143 healey_01] 360
MDI lane mapping {1}	179C	183
Modal ERL {15}	178 179 176C 176D 178A	<u>126</u> 123 124 125 127 128 129 130 131 132 133 134 135 121 122 {mellitz_3dj_adhoc_01a_251030}
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic Track {20}

Day #2/3

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
50 ppm vs. 100 ppm requirements	120	[<u>165</u> , 327, 170, 347, ofelt_01]
Stateless decoder	119	[<u>32</u> , 392, 93]
PMA block error counters	176	428
ER1 test vectors	186	152
Deskew state diagrams	184, 186	[<u>366</u> , 365], 374
ER1 state diagrams	186	379, 386, 390
Inner FEC MDIO registers	177	[<u>419</u> , 171, 198, 172]
Inner FEC Pad Scrambler	177	197
PCS state variables	175	362
Constant naming	184	354
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Bucket #1

Day #1

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D2p2/8023dj_D2p2_comments_proposed_id_bucket1.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1 (so far):

407, 408, 354

(count #)

Withdrawn

The following comments have been withdrawn (so far):

1, 2, 41, 48, 52, 55, 58, 65, 70, 213, 356

(count 11)