

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI **FM** SC **FM** P1 L23 # 112
 Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ

This draft is amending IEEE Std 802.3-2022 which has already been amended now by at least 9 published amendments, and at least one in WG ballot ahead of this draft. It is important to keep track of the other changes so that the new changes are properly correlated with clause numbers and other changes made. Since this amendment makes changes to clauses 30 & 45 in places near or at where other amendments have, this may create errors. Hence my marking this comment, which seems minor, as required.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "IEEE Std 802.3y-20xx" with the list of published amendments and those ahead of this amendment in the process. (Note - Include at least the published amendments (dd, cs, db, ck, de, cx, cz, cy, df, and Cor1 listed in the introduction), as well as 802.3da which is ahead of this amendment.
 Editor to review edits to existing clauses (30, 45, and 80) to determine whether any section numbering or editing instructions for location of changes are altered.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 See comment #24.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P1 L23 # 24
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ

The list of amendments is missing.
 Currently ratified amendments are listed in the proposed response.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "as amended by IEEE Std 802.3yy-20xx" to "as amended by IEEE Std 802.3dd-2022, IEEE Std 802.3cs-2022, IEEE Std 802.3db-2022, IEEE Std 802.3ck-2022, IEEE Std 802.3de-2022, IEEE Std 802.3cx-2023, IEEE Std 802.3cz-2023, IEEE Std 802.3cy-2023, IEEE Std 802.3df-2024, and IEEE Std 802.3-2022/Cor 1-2024".

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P1 L26 # 132
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ

Task Force review

SuggestedRemedy

Working Group ballot

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P1 L26 # 25
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket_EZ

Task Force review has completed.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Task Force review" to "Working Group Ballot".

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 See comment #132.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P8 L3 # 26
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ

The placeholders in the text box should be replaced.

SuggestedRemedy

Change from "IEEE Std 802.3xx-20xx, IEEE Draft Standard for Ethernet. Amendment: Amendment title (copy from PAR)." to "IEEE Std 802.3dk-20xx, IEEE Draft Standard for Ethernet—Amendment: Bidirectional 100 Gb/s Optical Access PHYs"

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl **FM** SC **FM** P8 L31 # 27
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ
 Placeholder should be replaced
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "IEEE Std 802.3xx-20xx" to "IEEE Std 802.3dk-20xx"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **00** SC **0** P0 L0 # 131
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ
 pdf metadata is at default
 SuggestedRemedy
 Populate with correct data
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 See comment #53.

Cl **00** SC **0** P0 L0 # 53
 Regev, Alon Keysight
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ
 PDF document properties contain incorrect data:
 Title is listed as "IEEE Draft P802.3xx"
 Author is listed as "IEEE P802.3xx Task Force"
 Subject is listed as "IEEE P802.3aj"
 Copyright notice is "Copyright © 201x IEEE. All rights reserved."
 SuggestedRemedy
 change Title from "IEEE Draft P802.3xx" to "IEEE Draft P802.3dk"
 change Author from "IEEE P802.3xx Task Force" to "IEEE P802.3dk Task Force"
 change Subject from "IEEE P802.3aj" to "IEEE P802.3dk"
 change copyright notice from "Copyright © 201x IEEE. All rights reserved." to "Copyright © 2025 IEEE. All rights reserved."
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **00** SC **0** P1 L13 # 222
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** bucket_EZ
 The Ammendment title is supposed to match the name in the PAR
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change: Amendment: Bidirectional 100 Gb/s Optical Access PHYs
 To: Amendment: Greater than 50 Gb/s Bidirectional Optical Access PHYs Task Force
 Also change this on the heading of each page.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **00** SC **0** P7 L31 # 20
 Lusted, Kent Synopsys
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ
 Fill in the balloter information in the introduction
 SuggestedRemedy
 Fill in the balloter information in the introduction
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **00** SC **0** P7 L50 # 6
 Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis (aff'l w/ CME Consulting and Cisco)
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ
 IEEE-SA Standards Board member names to be supplied at publication
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace, "Konstantinos Karachalios, Secretary"
 with, "FirstName SecondName, Secretary"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 00 SC 0 P8 L4 # 223
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 The box under "Introduction" needs to be updated with P802.3dk information.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change: Std 802.3-20xx
 To: Std 802.3dk-202x
 and Change: Amendment title (copy from PAR)
 To: Greater than 50 Gb/s Bidirectional Optical Access PHYs Task Force
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 See comment #26.

Cl 00 SC 0 P11 L2 # 7
 Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis (aff'l w/ CME Consulting and Cisco)
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 Consider adding placeholder information for P802.3da
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert,
 "IEEE Std 802.3da™-20xx
 Amendment X- This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2022 and adds Clause 188 through Clause 189. This amendment adds Physical Layer specifications and management parameters for enhancement of multidrop 10 Mb/s operation based on the 10BASE-T1S PHY specified in Clause 147 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022, and specifies optional provision of power over single balanced pair mixing segments. Additionally, this amendment includes additions and changes to Clause 148 to automatically allocate node IDs (Dynamic PLCA)."
 (Editor to ensure that TM is superscript)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P11 L54 # 258
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Missing table of contents
 SuggestedRemedy
 Create table of contents and insert after the introductory material and before Clause 30.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P12 L11 # 122
 Huber, Thomas Nokia
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 100GBASE-T is not included in 30.5.1.1.2 of 802.3-2022 or any of its amendments. Further, In the rest of 30.5.1.1.2, the PHYs are listed alphabetically by rate; as such, this set BRxx PHYs should be inserted before 100GBASE-CR
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the editing instruction to say "Insert the following types into the "APPROPRIATE SYNTAX" section of 30.5.1.1.2 after 50GBASE-SR:"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #135.

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P12 L12 # 105
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 100GBASE-T does not exist.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the editing instructions to be "Insert the following types into the "APPROPRIATE SYNTAX" section of 30.5.1.1.2 before 100GBASE-CR1 (as inserted by IEEE Std. 802.3ck-2022)."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #135.

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P12 L12 # 113
 Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 As a card-carrying BASE-T guy, I'm pretty sure we never got so audacious as to do 100GBASE-T. Where does this go? Most of these are alphanumeric, so I think the new MAUs are the first in the 100G section... (whereas "T" would be in an odd place, near the end, and the location of the new row in the fault description tables is grouped after the LR4/ER4 row... - that's why I'm not sure)
 SuggestedRemedy
 change 100GBASE-T to 50GBASE-SR
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #135.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P12 L12 # 135
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 Unlike most tables which are in order of MAC rate - reach - length, this is in alphanumeric order
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "30.5.1.1.2 after 100GBASE-T" to "30.5.1.1.2 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3ck-2022), after 50GBASE-SR and before 100GBASE-CR1"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P12 L16 # 136
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 So that the reviewers can confirm that the new material is inserted in the correct place
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please show one row before and one after the new material
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Editor's note:
 one row before is: 50GBASE-SR 50GBASE-R PCS/PMA over multimode fiber PMD as specified in Clause 138
 one row after is: 100GBASE-CR2 100GBASE-R PCS/PMA over 2 lane shielded copper balanced cable PMD as specified in Clause 136.

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P12 L20 # 58
 Regev, Alon Keysight
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 References to "Clause 168" should be links
 SuggestedRemedy
 on lines 20, 23, 26, 29, 32, and 35 make the references to "Clause 168" into links to "Clause 168"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 See comment #114.

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P12 L20 # 114
 Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 "Clause 168" references should be active cross-references (hyperlinks) - they are not.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "Clause 168" text at lines 20, 23, 26, 29, 32, and 35 with active cross references
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P12 L23 # 138
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Trailing blanks
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove. It looks like there are five in this page
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P12 L23 # 139
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 Three dots
 SuggestedRemedy
 Should not be underlined
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.7.4 P13 L10 # 224
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Includes an unchanged row when the editing instructions say it doesn't.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete unchanged row
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.7.4 P13 L12 # 29

Ran, Adeo Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket_EZ

Table 45-9 has been amended multiple times. The editorial instruction should state which version the amendment is based on.
 Similarly for other tables in existing clauses (45 and 80).
 I believe the current version of table 45-9 is in 802.3df-2024. Other tables may be in different amendments.
 (P802.3da is also in flight but I assume P802.3dk is planned to be completed first)

The label in the suggested remedy is based on the label in 802.3df.

SuggestedRemedy

In the editorial instruction before Table 45-9, change the text to:
 Insert a new row in Table 45-9 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3db-2022, IEEE Std 802.3ck-2022, and IEEE 802.3df-2024) after the row for "100GBASE-LR4, 100GBASE-ER4", as follows (some unchanged rows not shown):"
 Change other instructions in clause 45 and clause 80 as appropriate.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.7.4 P13 L20 # 140

Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

So that the reviewers can confirm that the new material is inserted in the correct place

SuggestedRemedy

Please show one row before and one after the new material

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 See comment #224.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.7.5 P13 L38 # 141

Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

So that the reviewers can confirm that the new material is inserted in the correct place

SuggestedRemedy

Please show one row before and one after the new material

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 See comment #225.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.7.5 P13 L40 # 225

Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

Includes an unchanged row when the editing instructions say it doesn't.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete unchanged row

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.8 P14 L5 # 143

Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

So that the reviewers can confirm that the new material is inserted in the correct place

SuggestedRemedy

Please show one row before and one after the new material

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 See comment #226.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.8.1 P13 L48 # 142

Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

Table 45-12 is part of 45.2.1.8 not 45.2.1.8.1

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "45.2.1.8.1 PMD transmit disable 14 (1.9.15)"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.8.1 P14 L7 # 226

Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

Includes an unchanged row when the editing instructions say it doesn't.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete unchanged row

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b P14 L13 # 123

Huber, Thomas

Nokia

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

The clause number for BiDi PMA/PMD extended ability 2 (register 1.35) is 45.2.1.33. The table number is 45-37.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the clause number from 45.2.1.27b to 45.2.1.33, change the editing instruction to say "Insert new rows in Table 45-37 above the row for "1.35.5" as shown (additional unchanged rows not shown):", and change the table number from 45-31b to 45-37.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #144.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b P14 L13 # 97

Slavick, Jeff

Broadcom

Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket_EZ

Std 802.3-2022 BiDi PMA/PMD extended ability 2 is clause 45.2.1.33 and Table 45-37.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix the Clause numbering to align with base standard and update editing instructions appropriately.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #144.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b P14 L13 # 144

Dawe, Piers

Nvidia

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

Wrong subclause number

SuggestedRemedy

Change 45.2.1.27b to 45.2.1.33 and move this and its subclauses after 45.2.1.28.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change 45.2.1.27b to 45.2.1.33 and move this and its subclauses after 45.2.1.33.6.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b P14 L13 # 227

Wienckowski, Natalie

IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 45.2.1.27b to 45.2.1.33 and reorder to put the clauses in the correct order.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
See comment #144.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b P14 L15 # 228

Wienckowski, Natalie

IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

The Table numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.

SuggestedRemedy

Change Table 45-31b to Table 45-37, also on line 19

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b P14 L39 # 145

Dawe, Piers

Nvidia

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

So that the reviewers can confirm that the new material is inserted in the correct place

SuggestedRemedy

Please show one row after the new material

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.
Follow the format of da, dj.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b P14 L44 # 98
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 The descriptions of the bits are done from highest number bit to lowest. So the new clauses that are adding higher numbered bits should be inserted "before" the existing sub-clauses describing bits 5:0.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change editing instruction to insert the new clauses "before 45.2.1.33.1" (after correcting to base standard clause numbers)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b.7 P14 L43 # 115
 Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 Insert editorial instructions are without underscores (those are for inserts on a "Change" instruction)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove underscores in 45.2.1.27b.7 through 45.2.1.27b.12 (including on paragraph text).
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b.7 P14 L43 # 229
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021. Also, the higher number bits are defined before the lower number bits so the new bit definitions go before the existing ones.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change: 45.2.1.27b.7-45.2.1.27b.12 after 45.2.1.27b.6
 To: 45.2.1.33.a-45.2.1.33.f before 45.2.1.33.1
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 See comment #144.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b.7 P14 L45 # 230
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 45.2.1.27b.7 to 45.2.1.33.a
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 See comment #144.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b.7 P14 L46 # 124
 Huber, Thomas Nokia
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 The new clauses related to the new bits in table 45-37 need to be inserted in 45.2.1.33 rather than in 45.2.1.27b. Since the current set of subclauses go from bit 5 to bit 0 (i.e., 45.2.1.33.1 concerns bit 5, 45.2.1.33.2 concerns bit 4, etc.), for consistency, the new subclauses be inserted before the existing subclauses rather than after them.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the editing instruction to say "Insert new subclauses 45.2.1.33.a to 45.2.1.33.f before 45.2.1.33.1". Change the subclause headings as follows:
 45.2.1.27b.7 --> 45.2.1.33.a
 45.2.1.27b.8 --> 45.2.1.33.b
 45.2.1.27b.9 --> 45.2.1.33.c
 45.2.1.27b.10 --> 45.2.1.33.d
 45.2.1.27b.11 --> 45.2.1.33.e
 45.2.1.27b.12 --> 45.2.1.33.f
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #144.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b.8 P15 L1 # 231
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 45.2.1.27b.8 to 45.2.1.33.b
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.27b.9 P15 L8 # 232
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 45.2.1.27b.9 to 45.2.1.33.c
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.27b.12 P15 L25 # 267
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 45.2.1.27b.12 to 45.2.1.33.f
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.27b.10 P15 L13 # 265
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 45.2.1.27b.10 to 45.2.1.33.d
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.28 P15 L51 # 150
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 There is no following row
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the row with three dots
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 Follow the format of da, dj.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.27b.11 P15 L19 # 266
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 45.2.1.27b.11 to 45.2.1.33.e
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.28 P15 L51 # 149
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 So that the reviewers can confirm that the new material is inserted in the correct place
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please show one sub-row after the new material
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 Follow the format of da, dj.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 80 SC 80.2.3 P16 L2 # 153
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Table 80-1, 40 Gb/s and 100 Gb/s PHYs and Table 80-5, Nomenclature and clause correlation (100GBASE-P optical) need additions
 SuggestedRemedy Per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 See related contents in Clause 157.

Cl 80 SC 80.2.5 P16 L2 # 155
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Table 80-8, Summary of Skew constraints and Table 80-9, Summary of Skew Variation constraints need additions
 SuggestedRemedy Per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Add Clause 168.3.2 to Table 80-8.
 Table 80-9 should remain unchanged because Skew variation has no meaning for single lane PHYs.

Cl 80 SC 80.2.5 P16 L2 # 154
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 80.2.3 (as modified by 3ck) and 80.2.5 need additions
 SuggestedRemedy Per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Add 100GBASE-BRx in Clause 80.2.3 and 80.2.5 as:
 80.2.3 Forward error correction (FEC) sublayers
 A forward error correction sublayer is optional for 40GBASE-KR4, 40GBASE-CR4, and 100GBASE-CR10 PHYs and mandatory for 100GBASE-CR2, 100GBASE-CR4, 100GBASE-KR2, 100GBASE-KR4, 100GBASE-KP4, 100GBASE-SR2, 100GBASE-SR4, 100GBASE-DR, 100GBASE-FR1, 100GBASE-LR1, 100GBASE-ZR, and 100GBASE-BRx PHYs.
 80.2.5 Physical Medium Dependent (PMD) sublayer
 The 40GBASE-R, 100GBASE-R, 100GBASE-P, and 100GBASE-Z PMDs and their corresponding media are specified in Clause 84 through Clause 89, Clause 92 through Clause 95, Clause 136 through Clause 138, Clause 140, Clause 154, and Clause 168.

Cl 80 SC 80.4 P16 L6 # 156
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 This table is ordered by MAC rate - reach - length, so these rows don't go at the end
 SuggestedRemedy Change "Insert three new rows at the end of Table 80-7" to "Insert three new rows in Table 80-7 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3db-2022) between 100GBASE-LR1 PMD and 100GBASE-ER4 PMD"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implemented suggested remedy with editorial license.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 80 SC 80.4 P16 L12 # 157
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 So that the reviewers can confirm that the new material is inserted in the correct place
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please show one row before and one after the new material
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 Follow the format of da, dj.

Cl 80 SC 80.4 P16 L13 # 101
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 The other optical PHYs in this table note that the delay time includes 2m of fiber.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add "Includes 2m of fiber." before the See 168.3.1
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 80 SC 80.4 P16 L13 # 158
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 To match the existing entries
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert "Includes 2 m of fiber." 3 times
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #101.

Cl 80 SC 80.4 P16 L17 # 159
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 This is a long table and this amendment makes it longer, so it should make the consequential change.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Split the table into two, one for 40G and one for 100G.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 802.3 editor will do.

Cl 135 SC 135.5.7 P16 L30 # 162
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket
 Should precoding be allowed as an option?
 SuggestedRemedy
 Consider including precoding (135.5.7) as an option. This could be controlled by the network operator according to experience.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 Clause 135 is not included in dk draft.

Cl 157 SC 1.3 P18 L1 # 220
 Effenberger, Frank Futurewei Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket
 Figure 157-1(a) is unfortunate in how it breaks over the pages, and then Table 157-2 gets broken up in a weird way.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Try to squeeze all four speeds onto a single figure.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #127.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 157 SC 157 P17 L1 # 126

Huber, Thomas Nokia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

This clause is missing editing instructions

SuggestedRemedy

Add an editing instruction at the top of the page:
 "Change clauses 157 and 157.1 as shown:"
 Add an editing instruction below clause 157.2: "Change clause 157.2.1 as shown"
 Delete tables 157-3 through 157-5, as they are not being modified.
 Add an editing instruction: "Insert Table 157-6 below Table 157-5."
 Add an editing instruction: "Change clauses 157.2.2 through 157.2.5 as shown:"
 Delete clauses 157.2.6 and 157.2.7 since they are not being modified.
 Add an editing instruction: "Change clauses 157.3, 157.4, and 157.6 as shown:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #102.

Cl 157 SC 157 P17 L1 # 116

Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

There is no editing instruction for this clause. As the entire clause seems to be included here, marked with 'change' editing marks (which is more than you need), it seems "Change title and text of Clause 157 as shown:" may be used - even though it is REALLY unusual.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert editing instruction prior to header, "Change title and text of Clause 157 as shown:"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #102.

Cl 157 SC 157 P17 L1 # 30

Ran, Adeo Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket_EZ

Missing editorial instruction for clause 157.
 It seems that this amendment includes the whole clause with changes. But instructions should be given for specific changes, per the IEEE SA style manual.

Especially, changes to tables and the addition of a new figure 157-1a should be separate instructions. Tables that are not changed at all (such as table 157-3 through table 157-5) should not appear in the draft.

Previous amendments can be used as references.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instructions to each subclause that is changed, as done in previous amendments.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #102.

Cl 157 SC 157.1 P17 L1 # 102

Slavick, Jeff Broadcom
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D bucket_EZ

There is no editing instruction for Clause 157 which is an existing base standard clause.

SuggestedRemedy

Reduce the amount of text, Figures and Tables to only be changes being made to Clause 157 and not the entire Clause. Inserting appropriate editing instructions for section that is being changed.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 157 SC 157.1.1 P17 L3 # 233
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Change the first and second paragraphs of 157.1.1 as follows:
 Delete third paragraph as it has no changes.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #102.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.2 P17 L23 # 234
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Change 157.1.2 as follows:
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #102.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.2 P17 L28 # 235
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 References to external points not properly indicated. Per the instructions in the FM draft template: Any cross references that refer to clauses, tables, equations, or figures not covered by this amendment are highlighted in green. This is done by applying a character tag of "External".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Correct all external references per instructions throughout the document.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.2 P17 L30 # 81
 Simms, William NVIDIA
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 missing 'and' before 80.1.3
 SuggestedRemedy
 add the 'and' to be consistent with the one removed in front of 50 Gb/s
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.2 P17 L30 # 31
 Ran, Adeo Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 Missing "and" before 80.1.3
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert "and"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.2 P17 L30 # 64
 Regev, Alon Keysight
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 "80.1.3" should be "and 80.1.3"
 SuggestedRemedy
 change "80.1.3" to "and 80.1.3"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 157 SC 157.1.2 P17 L30 # 86
 Mi, Guangcan Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 in "131.1.2 (for 50 Gb/s), 80.1.3 (for 100 Gb/s)", missing and
 SuggestedRemedy
 change to "131.1.2 (for 50 Gb/s), and 80.1.3 (for 100 Gb/s)"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.3 P17 L51 # 236
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction.
 The entire subclause shouldn't be included, only the changes should be included.

SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Change row "r" of Table 157-1 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):
 Delete text before the table and unchanged table rows.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.3 P18 L1 # 237
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing editorial instruction.
 The unchanged figure should not be included.

SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Change title of Figure 157-1 as follows:
 Delete the figure.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #127.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.3 P18 L1 # 127
 Huber, Thomas Nokia
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket
 The architecture is essentially the same for all rates. Rather than introducing figure 157-1a to introduce the 100G rate, it would be better to use a single figure that is more generic and covers the architecture of all rates.

SuggestedRemedy
 Take figure 157-1a as a starting point. Change "CGMII" to "XGMII, 25GMII, 50GMII, or CGMII". Change the PCS to "10GBASE-R, 25GBASE-R, 50GBASE-R, or 100GBASE-R PCS" (or maybe just "rGBASE-R PCS", referencing the nomenclature introduced in Table 157-1). Add note 1 to the FEC sublayer, saying "conditional for 10GBASE-BRx based on PHY type". At the bottom, list all the various PMDs, or use a generic "rGBASE-BRx" label. Replace the existing figure 157-1 with the figure described in this comment..Undo the modifications to the title of Figure 157-1. Delete new figure 157-1a.and the reference to it in 157.1.2 (which is not shown as a change in the draft).
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.3 P18 L35 # 238
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 The table should not be broken up with a Figure in the middle of it. Only the new rows should be shown.

SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Insert new rows at the end of Table 157-2 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):
 Delete the first 18 rows of the table which are not changed.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.3 P18 L35 # 239
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction.

SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Change the second paragraph of 157.1.3 as follows:
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 157 SC 157.1.3 P18 L42 # 4
 Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger Hochfrequenztechnik GmbH & Co. KG
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket
 Table 157-2 - Multi-Gigabit Ethernet BiDi PHYs is interrupted by Figure 157-1a - Architectural positioning of 100 Gb/s Ethernet BiDi PHYs.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Reorder from: "Figure 157-1 ... Table 157-2 ... Figure 157-1a ... Table 157-2 (continued)" to "Figure 157-1 ... Figure 157-1a ... Table 157-2"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #127.

CI 157 SC 157.1.3 P19 L1 # 240
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket
 Missing editorial instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Insert Figure 157-1a after Figure 157-1 as follows:
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #127.

CI 157 SC 157.1.4 P20 L37 # 241
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Change 157.1.4 as follows:
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

CI 157 SC 157.2 P21 L15 # 1
 D'Ambrosia, John Futurewei, U.S. Subsidiary of Huawei
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** bucket_EZ
 As currently written, Note A only applies to the one cell where it is denoted, when in actuality it applies to all of the various cells in the clause columns
 Also applies to Table 157-4, 157-5, and 157-6
 SuggestedRemedy
 Move the current location of Note A in table to next to "Clause."
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 157 SC 157.2.1 P20 L45 # 242
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Change title 157.2.1 as follows:
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

CI 157 SC 157.2.1 P20 L48 # 243
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Change the last sentence of the first paragraph of 157.2.1 as follows:
 Move all text to before the tables. Delete the unchanged sentences as they have no changes.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 157 SC 157.2.1 P21 L1 # 244
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Delete unchanged content.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete Table 157-3, Table 157-4, Table 157-5.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 157 SC 157.2.1 P21 L15 # 5
 Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger Hochfrequenztechnik GmbH & Co. KG
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Table 157-3 has ist footnote index on the Mandatory "M" in line 2, column 3. All other tables have this footnote index on line 2 column 2.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the footnote index position to the Line: "10GBASE-BR10-D" , column "EEE"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #1.

CI 157 SC 157.2.1 P22 L26 # 245
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Insert Table 157-6 after Table 157-5 as follows:
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

CI 157 SC 157.2.1 P22 L32 # 59
 Regev, Alon Keysight
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 The clause numbers in the column headers should be links to the clauses
 SuggestedRemedy
 change the column labels "81", "82", "91", "83", "83A", 83B", "83D", "83E", "135", "135D", "135E", "135F", and "135G" into links
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 This will be done by 802.3 editor.

CI 157 SC 157.2.2 P23 L5 # 246
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Change 157.2.2 as follows:
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

CI 157 SC 157.2.3 P23 L12 # 247
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Change 157.2.3 as follows:
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 157 SC 157.2.4 P23 L19 # 248
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Change the second and third paragraphs of 157.2.4 as follows:
 Delete the first paragraph as it doesn't have any changes.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.2.7 P23 L43 # 251
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Unchanged subclause
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete 157.2.7
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #102.

Cl 157 SC 157.2.4 P23 L20 # 164
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 medium independent
 SuggestedRemedy
 medium-independent
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 157 SC 157.3 P23 L51 # 252
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Insert paragraph at the end of 157.3 as follows:
 Delete unchanged paragraphs.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.2.5 P23 L34 # 249
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket
 Missing editorial instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Change 157.2.5 as follows:
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.3 P24 L7 # 33
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status X Bucket_EZ
 Missing period at the end of the last paragraph.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add a period.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 157 SC 157.2.6 P23 L39 # 250
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Unchanged subclause
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete 157.2.6
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #102.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 157 SC 157.3 P24 L7 # 106
 Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 80.3 should be an External cross reference or else bring it in to the draft (do changes need to be made? - the existing 80.3 does NOT reference that it applies to 100GBASE-BRx PHYs)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Mark 80.3 as External (green) or bring it into the draft with appropriate changes to refernece application to 100GBASE-BRx PHYs.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 See comment #60.

Cl 157 SC 157.3 P24 L7 # 60
 Regev, Alon Keysight
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 "80.3" should be a link
 SuggestedRemedy
 change "80.3" to a link to "80.3"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 This will be done by 802.3 editor.

Cl 157 SC 157.3 P24 L23 # 61
 Regev, Alon Keysight
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 "80.4" should be a link
 SuggestedRemedy
 change "80.4" to a link to "80.4"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 See comment #121.

Cl 157 SC 157.4 P24 L10 # 253
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Insert paragraph at the end of 157.4 as follows:
 Delete unchanged paragraphs.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.4 P24 L22 # 165
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket
 I think that the normative delay specs are in 168.3, and what is in 80.4 is sort of a restatement for clarity.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "in 80.4" to "in 168.3 (and see 80.4)"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Clause 80.4 and 168.3 specifications are the same.

Cl 157 SC 157.4 P24 L23 # 121
 Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 80.4 should be an active cross reference.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace 80.4 with an active cross reference
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 This will be done by 802.3 editor.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 157 SC 157.4 P24 L24 # 166
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Skew and Skew Variation is missing
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add text to refer to 168.3.2, and refer to 80.5
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 Skew doesn't apply to single lane PHYs.

CI 157 SC 157.5 P24 L39 # 254
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Unchanged subclause
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete 157.5
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #102.

CI 157 SC 157.6 P24 L47 # 255
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Change the first paragraph of 157.6 as follows:
 Delete the second paragraph as it doesn't have any changes.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

CI 157 SC 157.6 P24 L49 # 256
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 broken link
 SuggestedRemedy
 fix the Clause 45 link as it is in the document. Correct links not in the document as already requested.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 157 SC 157.6 P24 L50 # 167
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Clause 114, Clause 158 through Clause 160 Clause 168, and related annexes demonstrates
 SuggestedRemedy
 Clause 114, Clause 158 Xthrough Clause 160X , Clause 159, Clause 160, or _Clause 168, _ and related annexes demonstrates [inserting a comma]
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change the description as:
 Clause 45, Clause 49, Clause 73, Clause 74, Clause 106 through Clause 112, Clause 114, Clause 158 through Clause 160, Clause 168, and related annexes.

CI 157 SC 157.6 P24 L50 # 128
 Huber, Thomas Nokia
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket
 The change to replace clause 160 with 168 is not correct; clauses 161 to 167 are unrelated to bidirectional PHYs.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Undo the replacement of 160 with 168, and add Clause 168 to the list, so it reads "... Clause 114, Clause 158 through Clause 160, Clause 168, and related annexes..."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #167.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 157 SC 157.6 P24 L51 # 103
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** bucket
 Clauses 161-167 are related to things other than the BiDi PMDs
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the strikethrough of Clause 160 and insert a , between Clause 160 and Clause 168
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #167.

Cl 158 SC 158.2 P28 L12 # 63
 Regev, Alon Keysight
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ
 "80.3" should be a link
 SuggestedRemedy
 change "80.3" to a link to "80.3"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168 P26 L0 # 257
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial instruction: Insert Clause 168.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 168 SC 168 P26 L1 # 35
 Ran, Adeo Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ
 Missing editorial instruction for clause 168.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add an editorial instruction: "Insert new clause 168".
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 168 SC 168 P26 L1 # 117
 Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ
 Again, no editing instruction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert editing instruction prior to header, "Insert Clause 168 after Clause 167."
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 168 SC 168.1 P26 L6 # 120
 Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ
 While the editor's notes on where things came from are helpful, they need eventually to be removed. They've probably served their purpose now, through d2.0, and may be deleted, but if you want to keep them around, they should be deleted prior to SA ballot.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Either: change editor's notes to say "Editor's note (to be removed prior to SA Ballot:" or delete Editor's notes on origin for subclauses.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 The editor's notes will be removed.

Cl 168 SC 168.1 P26 L7 # 100
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ
 Remove all the Editors notes stating what the section was leveraged from. This note has no life span and should not be included in the publication.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove all the Editors notes stating which clause was used to create the current clause (10 occurrences).
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #120.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 168 SC 168.1 P26 L7 # 259
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 There should not be editor's notes in D2.0 or later.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete note indicating which subclause this is based on. Delete similar notes in 168.2, 168.3, 168.4, 168.5, 168.7, 168.8, 168.9, 168.10, and 168.12.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #120.

Cl 168 SC 168.1 P26 L7 # 62
 Regev, Alon Keysight
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 remove editor's notes prior to publication
 SuggestedRemedy
 remove editor's notes prior to publication
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #120.

Cl 168 SC 168.1 P26 L19 # 260
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 broken link
 SuggestedRemedy
 fix the Clause 45 link as it is in the document.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.1 P27 L19 # 2
 D'Ambrosia, John Futurewei, U.S. Subsidiary of Huawei
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 The bottom of the "Physical Layer" is incorrect - it includes the MDI and should be drawn to the top of the "Medium"
 SuggestedRemedy
 27
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Maintenance required for Figure 140-1 in Clause 140.

Cl 168 SC 168.1 P27 L28 # 172
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Layout
 SuggestedRemedy
 Left justify
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 168 SC 168.1 P27 L36 # 173
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Blank line?
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove?
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 168 SC 168.3.2 P28 L52 # 107

Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ

Active cross references to sections 80.5, Figure 80-9, 83.5.3.4, all point nowhere, they are not in the draft.
 I will not comment more on cross references - however, there are numerous ones missed and they need to be checked.

SuggestedRemedy

Mark cross references as external. Editor to check the draft for external cross references globally and fix.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license and discretion.

Cl 168 SC 168.4 P29 L26 # 82

Simms, William NVIDIA
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

strage break in body text and insertion of Tables

SuggestedRemedy

Leave text at line 23 and picking up at line 49 unbroken and move tables to appropriate location

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 168 SC 168.4 P29 L27 # 261

Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

tables should not be in the middle of a paragraph

SuggestedRemedy

Move Tables 168-2 and 168-3 after the paragraph text.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.5.1 P30 L38 # 216

Dudek, Mike Marvell
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ

poor English.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the "be" in "are not typically be accessible"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Maintenance required for Clause 160.

Cl 168 SC 168.5.1 P30 L39 # 174

Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ

This says "TP1 and TP4 ... (these test points are not typically be accessible in an implemented system)" but this is outdated. Clause 167 (100G/lane VR and SR says "might not be accessible". Linear optical modules are feasible at 100G/lane now, at least for DR.
 Grammar: "are not typically be"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "are not typically be" to "might not be"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #216.

Cl 168 SC 168.5.4 P31 L23 # 175

Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket_EZ

inter-sublayer service interface primitives defined in 131.3.

SuggestedRemedy

inter-sublayer service interface primitives defined in 80.3.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 168 SC 168.5.4 P31 L31 # 177
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 This "base text" does not agree with the published 160.5 and similar sections in other clauses such as 140 and 167. "Must" is deprecated.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "an unavoidable consequence" to "a consequence". Change "must" to "need to". Make any other changes to align with the published 802.3 as appropriate.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.5.9 P32 L21 # 129
 Huber, Thomas Nokia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 The first sentence of this clause is a comma splice.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace the comma with a semicolon, split into two separate sentences for the U and D PMDs, or write it as "The PMD_receive_fault function is mandatory in the 100GBASE-BRx-U PMD and optional in the 100GBASE-BRx-D PMD."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change it to:
 The 100GBASE-BRx-U PMD shall include the PMD_receive_fault function. In the 100GBASE-BRx-D PMD, the PMD_receive_fault function is optional.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.1 P33 L15 # 89
 Mi, Guangcan Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 the labe of wavelength is currently written as 100GBASE-BRx-D center wavelengths (range) or 100GBASE-BRx-U center wavelengths (range). This doesn't seem right. The upstream and down stream would only have one wavelength each. The wavelength can not be precisely controlled, thus a range is specified allowing the center wavelength to drift or shift. It is however a single wavelength, therefore the plural form here is not appropriate.
 SuggestedRemedy
 change wavelengths to wavelength in both cases of upstream and downstream.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement suggested remedy to Table 168-6 and Table 168-7.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.1 P33 L19 # 178
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 For improved readability, where the parameter limits seem likely to remain the same for all 3 (6) PMDs...
 SuggestedRemedy
 As for the first four rows, merge and straddle the triple entries for Side-mode suppression ratio (SMSR), (min) Transmitter transition time (max) RINxOMA (max) Transmitter reflectance (max)

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.1 P33 L39 # 179
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Use the emerging standard order for these parameters (see Clause 151)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Move Average launch power of OFF transmitter (max) to after Transmitter transition time (max)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.1 P33 L46 # 180
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 It's probably not worth testing some transmitters for TDECQ and RIN with 15 dB return loss and others with 15.6 dB. The cost in paperwork may outweigh any difference in yield.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Consider changing 15.6 to 15 here and in Table 168-11 (simplifying and being conservative). Then RINxOMA can become RIN15OMA. If it is thought worthwhile, the discrete reflectances for 100GBASE-BR10 in Table 168-14 and the channel optical return loss in Table 168-12 could be made slightly worse, to spend that 0.6 dB.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 Small difference exists in other clauses, such as clause 140.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 168 SC 168.6.1 P33 L50 # 41
 Ran, Adeo Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Footnote b of Table 167-7 refers to clause 139, but this clause is for a 50 Gb/s PMD and is irrelevant. The relevant clause may be 140 instead (assuming it is consistent; if not, further changes need to be made).
 Also, external references should be indicated by "forest green" text color.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Clause 139" to "Clause 140" and format as external reference (forest green).
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.1 P33 L50 # 72
 Johnson, John Broadcom
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 It's unnecessary to compare with Cl. 139 in footnote (b).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete "Even though the representation of the OMAouter requirement is different from that in Clause 139, they are consistent." from footnote (b).
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #41.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.1 P33 L51 # 181
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type T Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 A comparison with Clause 139 (50GBASE-FR LR ER) doesn't seem relevant; saying this is consistent doesn't seem correct.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete the sentence "Even though the representation of the OMAouter requirement is different from that in Clause 139, they are consistent."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #41.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.1 P34 L1 # 182
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 In equations, functions and abbreviations of words should be upright not italic
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change max to upright, three times
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Follow the style manual.
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.3 P35 L11 # 110
 Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse
 Comment Type T Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 The unit for a power budget can't be dB - power has units - dBm, for example.... dB is only good for ratios.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Either rename "Power budget" so it is clear it is a ratio, or change units to reflect a unit of power (e.g., dBm)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 Power budget (dB)=channel insertion loss (dB) + allocation for penalties (dB)

Cl 168 SC 168.7.1 P36 L7 # 65
 Regev, Alon Keysight
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 "sidn" should be "side"
 SuggestedRemedy
 change "sidn-mode" to "side-mode"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 168 SC 168.7.1 P36 L7 # 184
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket_EZ
 Sidn
 SuggestedRemedy
 Side
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.1 P36 L7 # 45
 Ran, Adeo Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket_EZ
 Typo in "Sidn"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "Side"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.4 P37 L2 # 185
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket_EZ
 Blank line(s)?
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove. Set the figure to float.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.5.3 P38 L50 # 46
 Ran, Adeo Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** bucket_EZ
 Reference to 121.8.5.3 is not a functional link. It should be formatted as an external reference.
 Other similar external references appear in 168.7.13.1, 168.7.13.2, 168.7.13.3, 168.7.7 (3 references), 168.7.11, 168.8.1, and maybe other places.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Format all external references in forest green text color.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.5.4 P39 L3 # 47
 Ran, Adeo Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** bucket_EZ
 "5 tap, T spaced" should be "5-tap, T-spaced".
 (see for example 167.8.6.1 in 802.3db)
 I am aware that the same text exists in many previous clauses, but an error should not be carried over to a new clause.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.5.4 P39 L3 # 83
 Simms, William NVIDIA
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **X** bucket_EZ
 strange break in text between line 3 and 17 with figure n the middle.
 SuggestedRemedy
 move figure to after the completed text
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPTED IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 168 SC 168.7.5.4 P39 L27 # 262
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 figures should not be in the middle of a paragraph
 SuggestedRemedy
 Move Figure 168-5 after the paragraph text.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.10 P40 L36 # 190
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 There is only one limit for this in the table
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change limits to limit
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.6 P39 L27 # 92
 Mi, Guangcan Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 "The TECQ of each lane is measured using the
 methods specified for TDECQ in 168.7.5, except that the test fiber is not used."
 There is only one lane in BRx PMDs in each direction.
 SuggestedRemedy
 delete " of each lane"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.13.1 P42 L35 # 263
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Figure 168-7 is part of 168.7.13.1, not 168.7.13.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Move Figure 168-7 after the first paragraph of 168.7.13.1.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.7 P39 L33 # 189
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 There is only one limit for this in the table
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change limits to limit
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.13.1 P43 L2 # 200
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 100
 MHz
 SuggestedRemedy
 Use non-breaking space
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #79.

Cl 168 SC 168.8.1 P44 L3 # 203
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Links to be made by staff
 SuggestedRemedy
 Should be forest green. Also in 168.12.4.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 168 SC 168.8.2 P44 L17 # 204
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Most sections like this have a footnote:
 A host system that fails to meet the manufacturer's requirements and/or usage restrictions may emit laser radiation in excess of the safety limits of one or more safety standards. In such a case, the host manufacturer is required to obtain its own laser safety certification.
 SuggestedRemedy
 If this footnote is required, add it
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 168 SC 168.9 P45 L17 # 85
 Simms, William NVIDIA
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket_EZ
 another break in text for table
 SuggestedRemedy
 move table after text
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.9 P45 L19 # 264
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 tables should not be in the middle of a paragraph
 SuggestedRemedy
 Move Table 168-12 after the paragraph text.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.9 P45 L36 # 206
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket
 This gives the dispersion ranges for the upstream direction only
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add two more rows for the dispersion ranges for the downstream direction.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 The dispersion covers both directions.
 (This is simplification.)

Cl 168 SC 168.9 P45 L44 # 207
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Other clauses have changed to the IEC definition
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "ANSI/TIA/EIA-526-7/method A-1" to "the IEC 61280-4-2 one-cord reference method"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.10 P46 L1 # 208
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Table 168-12 contains numbers not definitions
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "defined in" to "given in" or "of"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change "defined in" to "given in".

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 168 SC 168.10 P46 L9 # 209
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 ...), or type G.657.A1 or type G.657.A2 (bend insensitive) fibers or the requirements in ...
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert comma, as in 151.11.1:
 ...), or type G.657.A1 or type G.657.A2 (bend insensitive) fibers, or the requirements in ...
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.10 P46 L26 # 210
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 may not support operation 10 km for 100GBASE-BR10, 20 km for 100GBASE-BR20 or 40 km for 100GBASE-BR40.
 SuggestedRemedy
 may not support operation *at* 10 km for 100GBASE-BR10, 20 km for 100GBASE-BR20 or 40 km for 100GBASE-BR40.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.12.1 P48 L14 # 213
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Links to be made by staff
 SuggestedRemedy
 Should be forest green. Also at like 47
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.12.1 P48 L28 # 214
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Blank sub-row?
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove. Also in 168.12.3, twice
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.12.3 P49 L13 # 215
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 The ONU silent start applies to the U PHYs but not the D PHYs
 SuggestedRemedy
 Create major options for U and D. Status of F12 ONU silent start becomes U:M
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.12.3 P49 L15 # 104
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 INS is used as a conditional in 168.12.4.8 so it needs a *
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add a * before INS in the item column in 168.12.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl Content SC Contents P12 L0 # 133
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket_EZ
 Contents is missing
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add Contents
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 See comment #258.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl **Introdu** *SC* **Introduction** *P8* *L4* # 56
 Regev, Alon Keysight
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*
 "802.3xx" should be "802.3dk"
SuggestedRemedy
 "802.3xx" should be "802.3dk"
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **Introdu** *SC* **Introduction** *P8* *L31* # 55
 Regev, Alon Keysight
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*
 "802.3xx" should be "802.3dk"
SuggestedRemedy
 "802.3xx" should be "802.3dk"
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 See comment #27.

Cl **Particip** *SC* **Participants** *P7* *L4* # 54
 Regev, Alon Keysight
Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*
 "P802.3xx" should be "P802.3dk"
SuggestedRemedy
 change "P802.3xx" to "P802.3dk"
Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.