Cl **157**　　　*SC* **157.2**　　　　*P* **21**　　　*L* **15**　　　# 1

D'Ambrosia, John　　　　　　　　Futurewei, U.S. Subsidiary of Huawei

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

As currently written, Note A only applies to the one cell where it is denoted, when in actuality it applies to all of the various cells in the clause columns
Also applies to Table 157-4, 157-5, and 157-6

SuggestedRemedy

Move the current location of Note A in table to next to "Clause."

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　　*SC* **168.1**　　　　*P* **27**　　　*L* **19**　　　# 2

D'Ambrosia, John　　　　　　　　Futurewei, U.S. Subsidiary of Huawei

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

The bottom of the "Physical Layer" is incorrect - it includes the MDI and should be drawn to the top of the "Medium"

SuggestedRemedy

27

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Maintenance required for Figure 140-1 in Clause 140.

Cl **157**　　　*SC* **157.1.3**　　　　*P* **18**　　　*L* **42**　　　# 4

Schreiner, Stephan　　　　　　　　Rosenberger Hochfrequenztechnik GmbH & Co. KG

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　　*bucket*

Table 157-2 - Multi-Gigabit Ethernet BiDi PHYs is interrupted by Figure 157-1a - Architectural positioning of 100 Gb/s Ethernet BiDi PHYs.

SuggestedRemedy

Reorder from: "Figure 157-1 … Table 157-2 … Figure 157-1a … Table 157-2 (continued)" to "Figure 157-1 … Figure 157-1a … Table 157-2"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #127.

Cl **157**　　　*SC* **157.2.1**　　　　*P* **21**　　　*L* **15**　　　# 5

Schreiner, Stephan　　　　　　　　Rosenberger Hochfrequenztechnik GmbH & Co. KG

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Table 157-3 has ist footnote index on the Mandatory "M" in line 2, column 3. All other tables have this footnote index on line 2 column 2.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the footnote index position to the Line: "10GBASE-BR10-D" , column "EEE"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #1.

Cl **00**　　　*SC* **0**　　　　*P* **7**　　　*L* **50**　　　# 6

Maguire, Valerie　　　　　　　　Copperopolis (aff'l w/ CME Consulting and Cisco)

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

IEEE-SA Standards Board member names to be supplied at publication

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "Konstantinos Karachalios, Secretary"

with, "FirstName SecondName, Secretary"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **00**　　　*SC* **0**　　　　*P* **11**　　　*L* **2**　　　# 7

Maguire, Valerie　　　　　　　　Copperopolis (aff'l w/ CME Consulting and Cisco)

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Consider adding placeholder information for P802.3da

SuggestedRemedy

Insert,
"IEEE Std 802.3da™-20xx
Amendment X- This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2022 and adds Clause 188 through Clause 189. This amendment adds Physical Layer specifications and management parameters for enhancement of multidrop 10 Mb/s operation based on the 10BASE-T1S PHY specified in Clause 147 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022, and specifies optional provision of power over single balanced
pair mixing segments. Additionally, this amendment includes additions and changes to Clause 148 to automatically allocate node IDs (Dynamic PLCA)."
(Editor to ensure that TM is superscript)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **7**　　　Page 1 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:02

Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　　　*P* **7**　　　*L* **31**　　　# 20

Lusted, Kent　　　　　　　　　　Synopsys

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Fill in the balloter information in the introduction

SuggestedRemedy

Fill in the balloter information in the introduction

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　*P* **1**　　　*L* **23**　　　# 24

Ran, Adee　　　　　　　　　　Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

The list of amendments is missing.
Currently ratified amendments are listed in the proposed response.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "as amended by IEEE Std 802.3yy-20xx"
to
"as amended by IEEE Std 802.3dd-2022, IEEE Std 802.3cs-2022, IEEE Std 802.3db-2022, IEEE Std 802.3ck-2022, IEEE Std 802.3de-2022, IEEE Std 802.3cx-2023, IEEE Std 802.3cz-2023, IEEE Std 802.3cy-2023, IEEE Std 802.3df-2024, and IEEE Std 802.3-2022/Cor 1-2024".

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　*P* **1**　　　*L* **26**　　　# 25

Ran, Adee　　　　　　　　　　Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Task Force review has completed.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Task Force review" to "Working Group Ballot".

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
See comment #132.

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　*P* **8**　　　*L* **3**　　　# 26

Ran, Adee　　　　　　　　　　Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

The placeholders in the text box should be replaced.

SuggestedRemedy

Change from
"IEEE Std 802.3xx-20xx, IEEE Draft Standard for Ethernet. Amendment: Amendment title (copy from PAR)."
to
"IEEE Std 802.3dk-20xx, IEEE Draft Standard for Ethernet—Amendment: Bidirectional 100 Gb/s Optical Access PHYs"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　　　*P* **8**　　　*L* **31**　　　# 27

Ran, Adee　　　　　　　　　　Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Placeholder should be replaced

SuggestedRemedy

Change "IEEE Std 802.3xx-20xx" to "IEEE Std 802.3dk-20xx"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **27**

Page 2 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.7.4**　　　　*P* **13**　　　*L* **12**　　　# 29

Ran, Adee　　　　　　　　　Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**X**　　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Table 45-9 has been amended multiple times. The editorial instruction should state which version the amendment is based on.
Similarly for other tables in existing clauses (45 and 80).
I believe the current version of table 45-9 is in 802.3df-2024. Other tables may be in different amendments.
(P802.3da is also in flight but I assume P802.3dk is planned to be completed first)

The label in the suggested remedy is based on the label in 802.3df.

SuggestedRemedy

In the editorial instruction before Table 45-9, change the text to:
Insert a new row in Table 45–9 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3db-2022, IEEE Std 802.3ck-2022, and IEEE 802.3df-2024) after the row for "100GBASE-LR4, 100GBASE-ER4", as follows (some unchanged rows not shown):"
Change other instructions in clause 45 and clause 80 as appropriate.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157**　　　　　*P* **17**　　　*L* **1**　　　# 30

Ran, Adee　　　　　　　　　Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**X**　　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Missing editorial instruction for clause 157.
It seems that this amendment includes the whole clause with changes. But instructions should be given for specific changes, per the IEEE SA style manual.

Especially, changes to tables and the addition of a new figure 157-1a should be separate instructions. Tables that are not changed at all (such as table 157-3 through table 157-5) should not appear in the draft.

Previous amendments can be used as references.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instructions to each subclause that is changed, as done in previous amendments.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #102.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.1.2**　　　*P* **17**　　　*L* **30**　　　# 31

Ran, Adee　　　　　　　　　Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**X**　　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Missing "and" before 80.1.3

SuggestedRemedy

Insert "and"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.3**　　　　*P* **24**　　　*L* **7**　　　# 33

Ran, Adee　　　　　　　　　Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**X**　　　　　　*Bucket_EZ*

Missing period at the end of the last paragraph.

SuggestedRemedy

Add a period.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168**　　　　　*P* **26**　　　*L* **1**　　　# 35

Ran, Adee　　　　　　　　　Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**X**　　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Missing editorial instruction for clause 168.

SuggestedRemedy

Add an editorial instruction: "Insert new clause 168".

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **35**

Page 3 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **168**   *SC* **168.6.1**   *P* **33**   *L* **50**   # **41**

Ran, Adee   Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

Footnote b of Table 167-7 refers to clause 139, but this clause is for a 50 Gb/s PMD and is irrelevant. The relevant clause may be 140 instead (assuming it is consistent; if not, further changes need to be made).

Also, external references should be indicated by "forest green" text color.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Clause 139" to "Clause 140" and format as external reference (forest green).

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**   *SC* **168.7.1**   *P* **36**   *L* **7**   # **45**

Ran, Adee   Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

Typo in "Sidn"

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "Side"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**   *SC* **168.7.5.3**   *P* **38**   *L* **50**   # **46**

Ran, Adee   Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

Reference to 121.8.5.3 is not a functional link. It should be formatted as an external reference.

Other similar external references appear in 168.7.13.1, 168.7.13.2, 168.7.13.3, 168.7.7 (3 references), 168.7.11, 168.8.1, and maybe other places.

SuggestedRemedy

Format all external references in forest green text color.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**   *SC* **168.7.5.4**   *P* **39**   *L* **3**   # **47**

Ran, Adee   Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

"5 tap, T spaced" should be "5-tap, T-spaced".
(see for example 167.8.6.1 in 802.3db)

I am aware that the same text exists in many previous clauses, but an error should not be carried over to a new clause.

SuggestedRemedy

Change per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **0**   *L* **0**   # **53**

Regev, Alon   Keysight

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *bucket_EZ*

PDF document properties contain incorrect data:
Tile is listed as "IEEE Draft P802.3xx"
Author is listed as "IEEE P802.3xx Task Force"
Subject is listed as "IEEE P802.3aj"
Copyright notice is "Copyright © 201x IEEE. All rights reserved."

SuggestedRemedy

change Title fron "IEEE Draft P802.3xx" to "IEEE Draft P802.3dk"
change Author fron "IEEE P802.3xx Task Force" to "IEEE P802.3dk Task Force"
change Subject from "IEEE P802.3aj" to ""IEEE P802.3dk"
change copyright notice from "Copyright © 201x IEEE. All rights reserved." to "Copyright © 2025 IEEE. All rights reserved."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **Particip**   *SC* **Participants**   *P* **7**   *L* **4**   # **54**

Regev, Alon   Keysight

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *bucket_EZ*

"P802.3xx" should be "P802.3dk"

SuggestedRemedy

change "P802.3xx" to "P802.3dk"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **54**   Page 4 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **Introdu** *SC* **Introduction** *P* **8** *L* **31** # 55

Regev, Alon Keysight

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

"802.3xx" should be "802.3dk"

SuggestedRemedy

"802.3xx" should be "802.3dk"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
See comment #27.

Cl **Introdu** *SC* **Introduction** *P* **8** *L* **4** # 56

Regev, Alon Keysight

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

"802.3xx" should be "802.3dk"

SuggestedRemedy

"802.3xx" should be "802.3dk"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.5.1.1.2** *P* **12** *L* **20** # 58

Regev, Alon Keysight

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

References to "Clause 168" should be links

SuggestedRemedy

on lines 20, 23, 26, 29, 32, and 35 make the references to "Clause 168" into links to "Clause 168"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
See comment #114.

Cl **157** *SC* **157.2.1** *P* **22** *L* **32** # 59

Regev, Alon Keysight

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

The clause numbers in the column headers should be links to the clauses

SuggestedRemedy

change the column labels "81", "82", "91", "83", "83A", 83B", "83D", "83E", "135", "135D", "135E", "135F", and "135G" into links

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
This will be done by 802.3 editor.

Cl **157** *SC* **157.3** *P* **24** *L* **7** # 60

Regev, Alon Keysight

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

"80.3" should be a link

SuggestedRemedy

change "80.3" to a link to "80.3"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
This will be done by 802.3 editor.

Cl **157** *SC* **157.3** *P* **24** *L* **23** # 61

Regev, Alon Keysight

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

"80.4" should be a link

SuggestedRemedy

change "80.4" to a link to "80.4"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
See comment #121.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **61**

Page 5 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **168**	*SC* **168.1**	*P* **26**	*L* **7**	# 62

Regev, Alon — Keysight

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *bucket_EZ*

remove editor's notes prior to publication

SuggestedRemedy

remove editor's notes prior to publication

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #120.

Cl **158**	*SC* **158.2**	*P* **28**	*L* **12**	# 63

Regev, Alon — Keysight

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *bucket_EZ*

"80.3" should be a link

SuggestedRemedy

change "80.3" to a link to "80.3"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **157**	*SC* **157.1.2**	*P* **17**	*L* **30**	# 64

Regev, Alon — Keysight

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *bucket_EZ*

"80.1.3" shoul be "and 80.1.3"

SuggestedRemedy

change "80.1.3" to "and 80.1.3"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**	*SC* **168.7.1**	*P* **36**	*L* **7**	# 65

Regev, Alon — Keysight

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *bucket_EZ*

"sidn" should be "side"

SuggestedRemedy

change "sidn-mode" to "side-mode"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**	*SC* **168.6.1**	*P* **33**	*L* **50**	# 72

Johnson, John — Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

It's unnecessary to compare with Cl. 139 in footnote (b).

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "Even though the representation of the OMAouter requirement is different from that in Clause 139, they are consistent." from footnote (b).

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #41.

Cl **157**	*SC* **157.1.2**	*P* **17**	*L* **30**	# 81

Simms, William — NVIDIA

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *bucket_EZ*

missing 'and' before 80.1.3

SuggestedRemedy

add the 'and' to be consistent with the one removed in front of 50 Gb/s

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**	*SC* **168.4**	*P* **29**	*L* **26**	# 82

Simms, William — NVIDIA

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

strage break in body text and insertion of Tables

SuggestedRemedy

Leave text at line 23 and picking up at line 49 unbroken and move tables to appropriate location

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **82**

Page 6 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.7.5.4**　　　　*P* **39**　　*L* **3**　　# 83

Simms, William　　　　　　　　　NVIDIA

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

strange break in text between line 3 and 17 with figure n the mddle.

SuggestedRemedy

move figure to after the completed text

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPTED IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.9**　　　　*P* **45**　　*L* **17**　　# 85

Simms, William　　　　　　　　　NVIDIA

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

another break in text for table

SuggestedRemedy

move table after text

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.1.2**　　　　*P* **17**　　*L* **30**　　# 86

Mi, Guangcan　　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

in "131.1.2 (for 50 Gb/s), 80.1.3 (for
100 Gb/s)",   missing and

SuggestedRemedy

change to "131.1.2 (for 50 Gb/s), and 80.1.3 (for
100 Gb/s)"

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.6.1**　　　　*P* **33**　　*L* **15**　　# 89

Mi, Guangcan　　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

the labe of wavelength is currently written as 100GBASE-BRx-D center wavelengths (range)
or 100GBASE-BRx-U center wavelengths (range). This doesn't seem right. The upstream
and down stream would only have one wavelength each. The wavelength can not be
precisely controlled, thus a range is specified allowing the center wavelength to drift or shift.
It is however a single wavelength, therefore the plural form here is not appropriate.

SuggestedRemedy

change wavelengths to wavelength in both cases of upstream and downstream.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy to Table 168-6 and Table 168-7.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.7.6**　　　　*P* **39**　　*L* **27**　　# 92

Mi, Guangcan　　　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

"The TECQ of each lane is measured using the
methods specified for TDECQ in 168.7.5, except that the test fiber is not used."

There is only one lane in BRx PMDs in each direction.

SuggestedRemedy

delete " of each lane"

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.27b**　　　　*P* **14**　　*L* **13**　　# 97

Slavick, Jeff　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Std 802.3-2022 BiDi PMA/PMD extended ability 2 is clause 45.2.1.33 and Table 45-37.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix the Clause numbering to align with base standard and update editing instructions
appropriately.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #144.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **97**

Page 7 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1.27b**　　　*P* **14**　　　*L* **44**　　　# 98

Slavick, Jeff　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **ER**　　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

The descriptions of the bits are done from highest number bit to lowest. So the new clauses that are adding higher numbered bits should be inserted "before" the existing sub-clases describing bits 5:0.

SuggestedRemedy

Change editing instruction to insert the new clauses "before 45.2.1.33.1" (after correcting to base standard clause numbers)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **168**　　　*SC* **168.1**　　　*P* **26**　　　*L* **7**　　　# 100

Slavick, Jeff　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Remove all the Editors notes stating what the section was leveraged from.   This note has no life span and should not be included in the publication.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove all the Editors notes stating which clause was used to create the current clause (10 occurences).

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #120.

Cl **80**　　　*SC* **80.4**　　　*P* **16**　　　*L* **13**　　　# 101

Slavick, Jeff　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

The other optical PHYs in this table note that the delay time includes 2m of fiber.

SuggestedRemedy

Add "Includes 2m of fiber." before the See 168.3.1

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **157**　　　*SC* **157.1**　　　*P* **17**　　　*L* **1**　　　# 102

Slavick, Jeff　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

There is no editing instruction for Clause 157 which is an existing base standard clause.

SuggestedRemedy

Reduce the amount of text, Figures and Tables to only be changes being made to Clause 157 and not the entire Clause. Inserting appropriate editing instructions for section that is being changed.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**　　　*SC* **157.6**　　　*P* **24**　　　*L* **51**　　　# 103

Slavick, Jeff　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*bucket*

Clauses 161-167 are related to things other than the BiDi PMDs

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the strikethough of Clause 160 and insert a , between Clause 160 and Clause 168

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #167.

Cl **168**　　　*SC* **168.12.3**　　　*P* **49**　　　*L* **15**　　　# 104

Slavick, Jeff　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **TR**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

INS is used as a conditonal in 168.12.4.8 so it needs a *

SuggestedRemedy

Add a * before INS in the item column in 168.12.3

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **104**

Page 8 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **30**　　*SC* **30.5.1.1.2**　　*P* **12**　　*L* **12**　　# 105

Slavick, Jeff　　　　　　　Broadcom

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　*bucket_EZ*

100GBASE-T does not exist.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editing instructions to be "Insert the following types into the "APPROPRIATE SYNTAX" section of 30.5.1.1.2 before 100GBASE-CR1 (as inserted by IEEE Std. 802.3ck-2022):"

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #135.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.3**　　*P* **24**　　*L* **7**　　# 106

Zimmerman, George　　　　ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　*bucket_EZ*

80.3 should be an External cross reference or else bring it in to the draft (do changes need to be made? - the existing 80.3 does NOT reference that it applies to 100GBASE-BRx PHYs ….)

SuggestedRemedy

Mark 80.3 as External (green) or bring it into the draft with appropriate changes to refernece application to 100GBASE-BRx PHYs.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
See comment #60.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.3.2**　　*P* **28**　　*L* **52**　　# 107

Zimmerman, George　　　　ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　*bucket_EZ*

Active cross references to sections 80.5, Figure 80-9, 83.5.3.4, all point nowhere, they are not in the draft.
I will not comment more on cross references - however, there are numerous ones missed and they need to be checked.

SuggestedRemedy

Mark cross references as external. Editor to check the draft for external cross references globally and fix.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license and discretion.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.6.3**　　*P* **35**　　*L* **11**　　# 110

Zimmerman, George　　　　ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse

Comment Type **T**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　*bucket_EZ*

The unit for a power budget can't be dB - power has units - dBm, for example…. dB is only good for ratios.

SuggestedRemedy

Either rename "Power budget" so it is clear it is a ratio, or change units to reflect a unit of power (e.g., dBm)

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
Power budget (dB)=channel insertion loss (dB) + allocation for penalties (dB)

Cl **FM**　　*SC* **FM**　　*P* **1**　　*L* **23**　　# 112

Zimmerman, George　　　　ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　*bucket_EZ*

This draft is amending IEEE Std 802.3-2022 which has already been amended now by at least 9 published amendments, and at least one in WG ballot ahead of this draft. It is important to keep track of the other changes so that the new changes are properly correlated with clause numbers and other changes made. Since this amendment makes changes to clauses 30 & 45 in places near or at where other amendments have, this may create errors. Hence my marking this comment, which seems minor, as required.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "IEEE Std 802.3y-20xx" with the list of published amendements and those ahead of this amendment in the process. (Note - Include at least the published amendments (dd, cs, db, ck, de, cx, cz, cy, df , and Cor1 listed in the introduction), as well as 802.3da which is ahead of this amendment.
Editor to review edits to existing clauses (30, 45, and 80) to determine whether any section numbering or editing instructions for location of changes are altered.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
See comment #24.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **112**

Page 9 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **30** *SC* **30.5.1.1.2** *P* **12** *L* **12** # 113

Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

As a card-carrying BASE-T guy, I'm pretty sure we never got so audacious as to do 100GBASE-T. Where does this go? Most of these are alphanumeric, so I think the new MAUs are the first in the 100G section… (whereas "T" would be in an odd place, near the end, and the location of the new row in the fault description tables is grouped after the LR4/ER4 row... - that's why I'm not sure)

SuggestedRemedy

change 100GBASE-T to 50GBASE-SR

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #135.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.5.1.1.2** *P* **12** *L* **20** # 114

Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

"Clause 168" references should be active cross-references (hyperlinks) - they are not.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "Clause 168" text at lines 20, 23, 26, 29, 32, and 35 with active cross references

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.27b.7** *P* **14** *L* **43** # 115

Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

Insert editorial instructions are without underscores (those are for inserts on a "Change" instruction)

SuggestedRemedy

Remove underscores in 45.2.1.27b.7 through 45.2.1.27b.12 (including on paragraph text).

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **157** *SC* **157** *P* **17** *L* **1** # 116

Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *bucket_EZ*

There is no editing instruction for this clause. As the entire clause seems to be included here, marked with 'change' editing marks (which is more than you need), it seems "Change title and text of Clause 157 as shown:" may be used - even though it is REALLY unusual.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert editing instruction prior to header, "Change title and text of Clause 157 as shown:"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #102.

Cl **168** *SC* **168** *P* **26** *L* **1** # 117

Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

Again, no editing instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert editing instruction prior to header, "Insert Clause 168 after Clause 167."

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **168** *SC* **168.1** *P* **26** *L* **6** # 120

Zimmerman, George ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

While the editor's notes on where things came from are helpful, they need eventually to be removed. They've probably served their purpose now, through d2.0, and may be deleted, but if you want to keep them around, they should be deleted prior to SA ballot.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: change editor's notes to say "Editor's note (to be removed prior to SA Ballot:" or delete Editor's notes on origin for subclauses.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
The editor's notes will be removed.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **120**

Page 10 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.4**　　　　*P* **24**　　*L* **23**　　# 121

Zimmerman, George　　　　ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

80.4 should be an active cross reference.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace 80.4 with an active cross reference

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
This will be done by 802.3 editor.

Cl **30**　　*SC* **30.5.1.1.2**　　　*P* **12**　　*L* **11**　　# 122

Huber, Thomas　　　　　Nokia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

100GBASE-T is not included in 30.5.1.1.2 of 802.3-2022 or any of its amendments. Further, In the rest of 30.5.1.1.2, the PHYs are listed alphabetically by rate; as such, this set BRxx PHYs should be inserted before 100GBASE-CR

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editing instruction to say "Insert the following types into the "APPROPRIATE SYNTAX" section of 30.5.1.1.2 after 50GBASE-SR:"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #135.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.27b**　　　*P* **14**　　*L* **13**　　# 123

Huber, Thomas　　　　　Nokia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

The clause number for BiDi PMA/PMD extended ability 2 (register 1.35) is 45.2.1.33. The table number is 45-37.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the clause number from 45.2.1.27b to 45.2.1.33, change the editing instruction to say "Insert new rows in Table 45-37 above the row for "1.35.5" as shown (additional unchanged rows not shown):", and change the table number from 45-31b to 45-37.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #144.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.27b.7**　　*P* **14**　　*L* **46**　　# 124

Huber, Thomas　　　　　Nokia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

The new clauses related to the new bits in table 45-37 need to be inserted in 45.2.1.33 rather than in 45.2.1.27b. Since the current set of subclauses go from bit 5 to bit 0 (i.e., 45.2.1.33.1 concerns bit 5, 45.2.1.33.2 concerns bit 4, etc.), for consistency, the new subclauses be inserted before the existing subclauses rather than after them.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editing instruction to say "Insert new subclauses 45.2.1.33.a to 45.2.1.33.f before 45.2.1.33.1". Change the subclause headings as follows:
45.2.1.27b.7 --> 45.2.1.33.a
45.2.1.27b.8 --> 45.2.1.33.b
45.2.1.27b.9 --> 45.2.1.33.c
45.2.1.27b.10 --> 45.2.1.33.d
45.2.1.27b.11 --> 45.2.1.33.e
45.2.1.27b.12 --> 45.2.1.33.f

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #144.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157**　　　　*P* **17**　　*L* **1**　　# 126

Huber, Thomas　　　　　Nokia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

This clause is missing editing instructions

SuggestedRemedy

Add an editing instruction at the top of the page:
"Change clauses 157 and 157.1 as shown:"
Add an editing instruction below clause 157.2: "Change clause 157.2.1 as shown"
Delete tables 157-3 through 157-5, as they are not being modified.
Add an editing instruction: "Insert Table 157-6 below Table 157-5."
Add an editing instruction: "Change clauses 157.2.2 through 157.2.5 as shown:"
Delete clauses 157.2.6 and 157.2.7 since they are not being modified.
Add an editing instruction: "Change clauses 157.3, 157.4, and 157.6 as shown:"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #102.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **126**　　　Page 11 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **157**   *SC* **157.1.3**   *P* **18**   *L* **1**   # 127

Huber, Thomas   Nokia

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   bucket

The architecture is essentially the same for all rates. Rather than introducing figure 157-1a to introduce the 100G rate, it would be better to use a single figure that is more generic and covers the architecture of all rates.

SuggestedRemedy

Take figure 157-1a as a starting point. Change "CGMII" to "XGMII, 25GMII, 50GMII, or CGMII". Change the PCS to "10GBASE-R, 25GBASE-R, 50GBASE-R, or 100GBASE-R PCS" (or maybe just "rGBASE-R PCS", referencing the nomenclature introduced in Table 157-1). Add note 1 to the FEC sublayer, saying "conditional for 10GBASE-BRx based on PHY type". At the bottom, list all the various PMDs, or use a generic "rGBASE-BRx" label. Replace the existing figure 157-1 with the figure described in this comment..Undo the modifications to the title of Figure 157-1. Delete new figure 157-1a.and the reference to it in 157.1.2 (which is not shown as a change in the draft).

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**   *SC* **157.6**   *P* **24**   *L* **50**   # 128

Huber, Thomas   Nokia

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   bucket

The change to replace clause 160 with 168 is not correct; clauses 161 to 167 are unrelated to bidirectional PHYs.

SuggestedRemedy

Undo the replacement of 160 with 168, and add Clause 168 to the list, so it reads "… Clause 114, Clause 158 through Clause 160, Clause 168, and related annexes…"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #167.

Cl **168**   *SC* **168.5.9**   *P* **32**   *L* **21**   # 129

Huber, Thomas   Nokia

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   bucket_EZ

The first sentence of this clause is a comma splice.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace the comma with a semicolon, split into two separate sentences for the U and D PMDs, or write it as "The PMD_receive_fault function is mandatory in the 100GBASE-BRx-U PMD and optional in the 100GBASE-BRx-D PMD.".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change it to:
The 100GBASE-BRx-U PMD shall include the PMD_receive_fault function. In the 100GBASE-BRx-D PMD, the PMD_receive_fault function is optional.

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **0**   *L* **0**   # 131

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   bucket_EZ

pdf metadata is at default

SuggestedRemedy

Populate with correct data

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
See comment #53.

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **1**   *L* **26**   # 132

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   bucket_EZ

Task Force review

SuggestedRemedy

Working Group ballot

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **132**

Page 12 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **Content**   *SC* **Contents**   *P* **12**   *L* **0**   # 133

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *bucket_EZ*

Contents is missing

SuggestedRemedy

Add Contents

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
See comment #258.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.5.1.1.2**   *P* **12**   *L* **12**   # 135

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**   *bucket_EZ*

Unlike most tables which are in order of MAC rate - reach - length, this is in alphanumeric order

SuggestedRemedy

Change "30.5.1.1.2 after 100GBASE-T" to "30.5.1.1.2 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3ck-2022), after 50GBASE-SR and before 100GBASE-CR1"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.5.1.1.2**   *P* **12**   *L* **16**   # 136

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**   *bucket_EZ*

So that the reviewers can confirm that the new material is inserted in the correct place

SuggestedRemedy

Please show one row before and one after the new material

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Editor's note:
one row before is: 50GBASE-SR 50GBASE-R PCS/PMA over multimode fiber PMD as specified in Clause 138
one row after is: 100GBASE-CR2 100GBASE-R PCS/PMA over 2 lane shielded copper balanced cable PMD as specified in Clause 136.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.5.1.1.2**   *P* **12**   *L* **23**   # 138

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *bucket_EZ*

Trailing blanks

SuggestedRemedy

Remove. It looks like there are five in this page

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.5.1.1.2**   *P* **12**   *L* **23**   # 139

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**   *bucket_EZ*

Three dots

SuggestedRemedy

Should not be underlined

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.7.4**   *P* **13**   *L* **20**   # 140

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *bucket_EZ*

So that the reviewers can confirm that the new material is inserted in the correct place

SuggestedRemedy

Please show one row before and one after the new material

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
See comment #224.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **140**

Page 13 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.7.5**　　　*P* **13**　　　*L* **38**　　# 141

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

So that the reviewers can confirm that the new material is inserted in the correct place

SuggestedRemedy

Please show one row before and one after the new material

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
See comment #225.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.8.1**　　　*P* **13**　　　*L* **48**　　# 142

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Table 45-12 is part of 45.2.1.8 not 45.2.1.8.1

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "45.2.1.8.1 PMD transmit disable 14 (1.9.15)"

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.8**　　　*P* **14**　　　*L* **5**　　# 143

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

So that the reviewers can confirm that the new material is inserted in the correct place

SuggestedRemedy

Please show one row before and one after the new material

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
See comment #226.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.27b**　　　*P* **14**　　　*L* **13**　　# 144

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Wrong subclause number

SuggestedRemedy

Change 45.2.1.27b to 45.2.1.33 and move this and its subclauses after 45.2.1.28.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change 45.2.1.27b to 45.2.1.33 and move this and its subclauses after 45.2.1.33.6.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.27b**　　　*P* **14**　　　*L* **39**　　# 145

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

So that the reviewers can confirm that the new material is inserted in the correct place

SuggestedRemedy

Please show one row after the new material

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
Follow the format of da, dj.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.28**　　　*P* **15**　　　*L* **51**　　# 149

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

So that the reviewers can confirm that the new material is inserted in the correct place

SuggestedRemedy

Please show one sub-row after the new material

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
Follow the format of da, dj.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **149**

Page 14 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.28**   *P* **15**   *L* **51**   # 150

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

There is no following row

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the row with three dots

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
Follow the format of da, dj.

Cl **80**   *SC* **80.2.3**   *P* **16**   *L* **2**   # 153

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Table 80-1, 40 Gb/s and 100 Gb/s PHYs
and
Table 80-5, Nomenclature and clause correlation (100GBASE-P optical)
need additions

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
See related contents in Clause 157.

Cl **80**   *SC* **80.2.5**   *P* **16**   *L* **2**   # 154

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

80.2.3 (as modified by 3ck) and 80.2.5 need additions

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Add 100GBASE-BRx in Clause 80.2.3 and 80.2.5 as:
80.2.3 Forward error correction (FEC) sublayers
A forward error correction sublayer is optional for 40GBASE-KR4, 40GBASE-CR4, and 100GBASE-CR10
PHYs and mandatory for 100GBASE-CR2, 100GBASE-CR4, 100GBASE-KR2, 100GBASE-KR4,
100GBASE-KP4, 100GBASE-SR2, 100GBASE-SR4, 100GBASE-DR, 100GBASE-FR1,
100GBASE-LR1, 100GBASE-ZR, and 100GBASE-BRx PHYs.

80.2.5 Physical Medium Dependent (PMD) sublayer
The 40GBASE-R, 100GBASE-R, 100GBASE-P, and 100GBASE-Z PMDs and their corresponding media
are specified in Clause 84 through Clause 89, Clause 92 through Clause 95, Clause 136 through Clause 138,
Clause 140, Clause 154, and Clause 168.

Cl **80**   *SC* **80.2.5**   *P* **16**   *L* **2**   # 155

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Table 80-8, Summary of Skew constraints
and
Table 80-9, Summary of Skew Variation constraints
need additions

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Add Clause 168.3.2 to Table 80-8.
Table 80-9 should remain unchanged because Skew variation has no meaning for single lane PHYs.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **155**   Page 15 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **80**   *SC* **80.4**   *P* **16**   *L* **6**   # 156

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

This table is ordered by MAC rate - reach - length, so these rows don't go at the end

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Insert three new rows at the end of Table 80-7" to "Insert three new rows in Table 80-7 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3db-2022) between 100GBASE-LR1 PMD and 100GBASE-ER4 PMD"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implemented suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **80**   *SC* **80.4**   *P* **16**   *L* **12**   # 157

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

So that the reviewers can confirm that the new material is inserted in the correct place

SuggestedRemedy

Please show one row before and one after the new material

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
Follow the format of da, dj.

Cl **80**   *SC* **80.4**   *P* **16**   *L* **13**   # 158

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

To match the existing entries

SuggestedRemedy

Insert "Includes 2 m of fiber." 3 times

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #101.

Cl **80**   *SC* **80.4**   *P* **16**   *L* **17**   # 159

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

This is a long table and this amendment makes it longer, so it should make the consequential change.

SuggestedRemedy

Split the table into two, one for 40G and one for 100G.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
802.3 editor will do.

Cl **135**   *SC* **135.5.7**   *P* **16**   *L* **30**   # 162

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Should precoding be allowed as an option?

SuggestedRemedy

Consider including precoding (135.5.7) as an option. This could be controlled by the network operator according to experience.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
Clause 135 is not included in dk draft.

Cl **157**   *SC* **157.2.4**   *P* **23**   *L* **20**   # 164

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

medium independent

SuggestedRemedy

medium-independent

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **164**   Page 16 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **157**   *SC* **157.4**   *P* **24**   *L* **22**   # 165

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

I think that the normative delay specs are in 168.3, and what is in 80.4 is sort of a restatement for clarity.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "in 80.4" to "in 168.3 (and see 80.4)"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Clause 80.4 and 168.3 specifications are the same.

Cl **157**   *SC* **157.4**   *P* **24**   *L* **24**   # 166

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Skew and Skew Variation is missing

SuggestedRemedy

Add text to refer to 168.3.2, and refer to 80.5

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
Skew doen't apply to single lane PHYs.

Cl **157**   *SC* **157.6**   *P* **24**   *L* **50**   # 167

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Clause 114, Clause 158 through Clause 160Clause 168, and related annexes demonstrates

SuggestedRemedy

Clause 114, Clause 158 Xthrough Clause 160X , Clause 159, Clause 160, or _Clause 168,_
and related annexes demonstrates
[inserting a comma]

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change the description as:
Clause 45, Clause 49, Clause 73, Clause 74, Clause 106 through Clause 112, Clause 114,
Clause 158 through Clause 160, Clause 168, and related annexes.

Cl **168**   *SC* **168.1**   *P* **27**   *L* **28**   # 172

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

Layout

SuggestedRemedy

Left justify

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **168**   *SC* **168.1**   *P* **27**   *L* **36**   # 173

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

Blank line?

SuggestedRemedy

Remove?

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**   *SC* **168.5.1**   *P* **30**   *L* **39**   # 174

Dawe, Piers   Nvidia

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

This says "TP1 and TP4 ... (these test points are not typically be accessible in an implemented system)" but this is outdated. Clause 167 (100G/lane VR and SR says "might not be accessible". Linear optical modules are feasible at 100G/lane now, at least for DR.
Grammar: "are not typically be"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "are not typically be" to "might not be"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #216.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID 174

Page 17 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.5.4**　　　　*P* **31**　　*L* **23**　　　# 175

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type　**T**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

inter-sublayer service interface primitives defined in 131.3.

SuggestedRemedy

inter-sublayer service interface primitives defined in 80.3.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.5.4**　　　　*P* **31**　　*L* **31**　　　# 177

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

This "base text" does not agree with the published 160.5 and similar sections in other clauses such as 140 and 167. "Must" is deprecated.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "an unavoidable consequence" to "a consequence". Change "must" to "need to". Make any other changes to align with the published 802.3 as appropriate.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.6.1**　　　　*P* **33**　　*L* **19**　　　# 178

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

For improved readability, where the parameter limits seem likely to remain the same for all 3 (6) PMDs...

SuggestedRemedy

As for the first four rows, merge and straddle the triple entries for
Side-mode suppression ratio (SMSR), (min)
Transmitter transition time (max)
RINxOMA (max)
Transmitter reflectance (max)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.6.1**　　　　*P* **33**　　*L* **39**　　　# 179

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Use the emerging standard order for these parameters (see Clause 151)

SuggestedRemedy

Move Average launch power of OFF transmitter (max)
to after Transmitter transition time (max)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.6.1**　　　　*P* **33**　　*L* **46**　　　# 180

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type　**T**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

It's probably not worth testing some transmitters for TDECQ and RIN with 15 dB return loss and others with 15.6 dB. The cost in paperwork may outweigh any difference in yield.

SuggestedRemedy

Consider changing 15.6 to 15 here and in Table 168-11 (simplifying and being conservative).
Then RINxOMA can become RIN15OMA.
If it is thought worthwhile, the discrete reflectances for 100GBASE-BR10 in Table 168-14 and the channel optical return loss in Table 168-12 could be made slightly worse, to spend that 0.6 dB.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
Small difference exists in other clauses, such as clause 140.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.6.1**　　　　*P* **33**　　*L* **51**　　　# 181

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type　**T**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

A comparison with Clause 139 (50GBASE-FR LR ER) doesn't seem relevant; saying this is consistent doesn't seem correct.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the sentence "Even though the representation of the OMAouter requirement is different from that in Clause 139, they are consistent."

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #41.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID 181

Page 18 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.6.1**　　　　*P* **34**　　*L* **1**　　# 182

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

In equations, functions and abbreviations of words should be upright not italic

SuggestedRemedy

Change max to upright, three times

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Follow the style manual.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.7.1**　　　　*P* **36**　　*L* **7**　　# 184

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Sidn

SuggestedRemedy

Side

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.7.4**　　　　*P* **37**　　*L* **2**　　# 185

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Blank line(s)?

SuggestedRemedy

Remove. Set the figure to float.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.7.7**　　　　*P* **39**　　*L* **33**　　# 189

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

There is only one limit for this in the table

SuggestedRemedy

Change limits to limit

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.7.10**　　　　*P* **40**　　*L* **36**　　# 190

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

There is only one limit for this in the table

SuggestedRemedy

Change limits to limit

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.7.13.1**　　　　*P* **43**　　*L* **2**　　# 200

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

100
MHz

SuggestedRemedy

Use non-breaking space

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #79.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **200**

Page 19 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **168**　　　*SC* **168.8.1**　　　　　*P* **44**　　　*L* **3**　　　# 203

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Links to be made by staff

SuggestedRemedy

Should be forest green. Also in 168.12.4.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　　*SC* **168.8.2**　　　　　*P* **44**　　　*L* **17**　　　# 204

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Most sections like this have a footnote:
A host system that fails to meet the manufacturer's requirements and/or usage restrictions
may emit laser radiation in excess of the safety limits of one or more safety standards. In
such a case, the host manufacturer is required to obtain its own laser safety certification.

SuggestedRemedy

If this footnote is required, add it

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **168**　　　*SC* **168.9**　　　　　*P* **45**　　　*L* **36**　　　# 206

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type　**T**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket*

This gives the dispersion ranges for the upstream direction only

SuggestedRemedy

Add two more rows for the dispersion ranges for the downstream direction.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
The dispersion covers both directions.
(This is simplification.)

Cl **168**　　　*SC* **168.9**　　　　　*P* **45**　　　*L* **44**　　　# 207

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type　**T**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Other clauses have changed to the IEC definition

SuggestedRemedy

Change "ANSI/TIA/EIA-526-7/method A-1" to "the IEC 61280-4-2 one-cord reference
method"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　　*SC* **168.10**　　　　　*P* **46**　　　*L* **1**　　　# 208

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Table 168-12 contains numbers not definitions

SuggestedRemedy

Change "defined in" to "given in" or "of"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "defined in" to "given in".

Cl **168**　　　*SC* **168.10**　　　　　*P* **46**　　　*L* **9**　　　# 209

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

...), or type G.657.A1 or type G.657.A2 (bend insensitive) fibers or the requirements in ...

SuggestedRemedy

Insert comma, as in 151.11.1:
...), or type G.657.A1 or type G.657.A2 (bend insensitive) fibers, or the requirements in ...

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **209**

Page 20 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **168**　　　*SC* **168.10**　　　　　*P* **46**　　　*L* **26**　　　# 210

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

may not support operation 10 km for 100GBASE-BR10, 20 km for 100GBASE-BR20 or 40 km for 100GBASE-BR40.

SuggestedRemedy

may not support operation *at* 10 km for 100GBASE-BR10, 20 km for 100GBASE-BR20 or 40 km for 100GBASE-BR40.

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　　*SC* **168.12.1**　　　　*P* **48**　　　*L* **14**　　　# 213

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Links to be made by staff

SuggestedRemedy

Should be forest green. Also at like 47

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　　*SC* **168.12.1**　　　　*P* **48**　　　*L* **28**　　　# 214

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Blank sub-row?

SuggestedRemedy

Remove. Also in 168.12.3, twice

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　　*SC* **168.12.3**　　　　*P* **49**　　　*L* **13**　　　# 215

Dawe, Piers　　　　　　　　　　　　　Nvidia

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

The ONU silent start applies to the U PHYs but not the D PHYs

SuggestedRemedy

Create major options for U and D. Status of F12 ONU silent start becomes U:M

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　　*SC* **168.5.1**　　　　*P* **30**　　　*L* **38**　　　# 216

Dudek, Mike　　　　　　　　　　　　　Marvell

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

poor English.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the "be" in "are not typically be accessible"

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Maintenance required for Clause 160.

Cl **157**　　　*SC* **1.3**　　　　　*P* **18**　　　*L* **1**　　　# 220

Effenberger, Frank　　　　　　　　　Futurewei Technologies

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　　　　*bucket*

Figure 157-1(a) is unfortunate in how it breaks over the pages, and then Table 157-2 gets broken up in a weird way.

SuggestedRemedy

Try to squeeze all four speeds onto a single figure.

Proposed Response　　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #127.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **220**　　　　Page 21 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　　*P* **1**　　*L* **13**　　# **222**
Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC
Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*
　　The Ammendment title is supposed to match the name in the PAR

SuggestedRemedy
　　Change: Amendment: Bidirectional 100 Gb/s Optical Access PHYs
　　To: Amendment: Greater than 50 Gb/s Bidirectional Optical Access PHYs Task Force
　　Also change this on the heading of each page.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
　　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　　*P* **8**　　*L* **4**　　# **223**
Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC
Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*
　　The box under "Introduction" needs to be updated with P802.3dk information.

SuggestedRemedy
　　Change: Std 802.3-20xx
　　To: Std 802.3dk-202x
　　and Change: Amendment title (copy from PAR)
　　To: Greater than 50 Gb/s Bidirectional Optical Access PHYs Task Force

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
　　PROPOSED ACCEPT.
　　See comment #26.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.7.4**　　　*P* **13**　　*L* **10**　　# **224**
Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC
Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*
　　Includes an unchanged row when the editing instructions say it doesn't.

SuggestedRemedy
　　Delete unchanged row

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
　　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.7.5**　　　*P* **13**　　*L* **40**　　# **225**
Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC
Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*
　　Includes an unchanged row when the editing instructions say it doesn't.

SuggestedRemedy
　　Delete unchanged row

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
　　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.8.1**　　　*P* **14**　　*L* **7**　　# **226**
Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC
Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*
　　Includes an unchanged row when the editing instructions say it doesn't.

SuggestedRemedy
　　Delete unchanged row

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
　　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.27b**　　　*P* **14**　　*L* **13**　　# **227**
Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC
Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*
　　The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.

SuggestedRemedy
　　Change 45.2.1.27b to 45.2.1.33 and reorder to put the clauses in the correct order.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
　　PROPOSED ACCEPT.
　　See comment #144.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **227**

Page 22 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.27b**   *P* **14**   *L* **15**   # 228

Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

The Table numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.

SuggestedRemedy

Change Table 45-31b to Table 45-37, also on line 19

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.27b.7**   *P* **14**   *L* **43**   # 229

Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021. Also, the higher number bits are defined before the lower number bits so the new bit definitions go before the existing ones.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: 45.2.1.27b.7-45.2.1.27b.12 after 45.2.1.27b.6
To: 45.2.1.33.a-45.2.1.33.f before 45.2.1.33.1

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
See comment #144.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.27b.7**   *P* **14**   *L* **45**   # 230

Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 45.2.1.27b.7 to 45.2.1.33.a

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
See comment #144.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.27b.8**   *P* **15**   *L* **1**   # 231

Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 45.2.1.27b.8 to 45.2.1.33.b

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.27b.9**   *P* **15**   *L* **8**   # 232

Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 45.2.1.27b.9 to 45.2.1.33.c

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **157**   *SC* **157.1.1**   *P* **17**   *L* **3**   # 233

Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

Missing editorial instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instruction: Change the first and second paragraphs of 157.1.1 as follows: Delete third paragraph as it has no changes.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #102.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **233**

Page 23 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **157** *SC* **157.1.2** *P* **17** *L* **23** # 234

Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *bucket_EZ*

Missing editorial instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instruction: Change 157.1.2 as follows:

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #102.

Cl **157** *SC* **157.1.2** *P* **17** *L* **28** # 235

Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **D** *bucket_EZ*

References to external points not properly indicated. Per the instructions in the FM draft template: Any cross references that refer to clauses, tables, equations, or figures not covered by this amendment are highlighted in green. This is done by applying a character tag of "External".

SuggestedRemedy

Correct all external references per instructions throughout the document.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **157** *SC* **157.1.3** *P* **17** *L* **51** # 236

Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *bucket_EZ*

Missing editorial instruction.
The entire subclause shouldn't be included, only the changes should be included.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instruction: Change row "r" of Table 157-1 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):
Delete text before the table and unchanged table rows.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157** *SC* **157.1.3** *P* **18** *L* **1** # 237

Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *bucket*

Missing editorial instruction.
The unchanged figure should not be included.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instruction: Change title of Figure 157-1 as follows:
Delete the figure.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #127.

Cl **157** *SC* **157.1.3** *P* **18** *L* **35** # 238

Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *bucket_EZ*

The table should not be broken up with a Figure in the middle of it. Only the new rows should be shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instruction: Insert new rows at the end of Table 157-2 as follows (unchanged rows not shown):
Delete the first 18 rows of the table which are not changed.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157** *SC* **157.1.3** *P* **18** *L* **35** # 239

Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

Missing editorial instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instruction: Change the second paragraph of 157.1.3 as follows:

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **239**

Page 24 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **157** *SC* **157.1.3** *P* **19** *L* **1** # 240

Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket*

Missing editorial instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instruction: Insert Figure 157-1a after Figure 157-1 as follows:

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #127.

Cl **157** *SC* **157.1.4** *P* **20** *L* **37** # 241

Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

Missing editorial instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instruction: Change 157.1.4 as follows:

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157** *SC* **157.2.1** *P* **20** *L* **45** # 242

Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

Missing editorial instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instruction: Change title 157.2.1 as follows:

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157** *SC* **157.2.1** *P* **20** *L* **48** # 243

Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

Missing editorial instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instruction: Change the last sentence of the first paragraph of 157.2.1 as follows:
Move all text to before the tables. Delete the unchanged sentences as they have no changes.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157** *SC* **157.2.1** *P* **21** *L* **1** # 244

Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *bucket_EZ*

Delete unchanged content.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete Table 157-3, Table 157-4, Table 157-5.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **157** *SC* **157.2.1** *P* **22** *L* **26** # 245

Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X** *bucket_EZ*

Missing editorial instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instruction: Insert Table 157-6 after Table 157-5 as follows:

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **245**

Page 25 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **157**   *SC* **157.2.2**   *P* **23**   *L* **5**   # 246
Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC
Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *bucket_EZ*
   Missing editorial instruction.
SuggestedRemedy
   Add editorial instruction: Change 157.2.2 as follows:
Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**   *SC* **157.2.3**   *P* **23**   *L* **12**   # 247
Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC
Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *bucket_EZ*
   Missing editorial instruction.
SuggestedRemedy
   Add editorial instruction: Change 157.2.3 as follows:
Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**   *SC* **157.2.4**   *P* **23**   *L* **19**   # 248
Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC
Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *bucket_EZ*
   Missing editorial instruction.
SuggestedRemedy
   Add editorial instruction: Change the second and third paragraphs of 157.2.4 as follows:
   Delete the first paragraph as it doesn't have any changes.
Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**   *SC* **157.2.5**   *P* **23**   *L* **34**   # 249
Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC
Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *bucket*
   Missing editorial instruction.
SuggestedRemedy
   Add editorial instruction: Change 157.2.5 as follows:
Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**   *SC* **157.2.6**   *P* **23**   *L* **39**   # 250
Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC
Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*
   Unchanged subclause
SuggestedRemedy
   Delete 157.2.6
Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
   See comment #102.

Cl **157**   *SC* **157.2.7**   *P* **23**   *L* **43**   # 251
Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC
Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*
   Unchanged subclause
SuggestedRemedy
   Delete 157.2.7
Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
   See comment #102.

Cl **157**   *SC* **157.3**   *P* **23**   *L* **51**   # 252
Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC
Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **X**   *bucket_EZ*
   Missing editorial instruction.
SuggestedRemedy
   Add editorial instruction: Insert paragraph at the end of 157.3 as follows:
   Delete unchanged paragraphs.
Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **252**

Page 26 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.4**　　　　　*P* **24**　　　*L* **10**　　　# 253

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Missing editorial instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instruction: Insert paragraph at the end of 157.4 as follows:
Delete unchanged paragraphs.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.5**　　　　　*P* **24**　　　*L* **39**　　　# 254

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Unchanged subclause

SuggestedRemedy

Delete 157.5

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #102.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.6**　　　　　*P* **24**　　　*L* **47**　　　# 255

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Missing editorial instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instruction: Change the first paragraph of 157.6 as follows:
Delete the second paragraph as it doesn't have any changes.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.6**　　　　　*P* **24**　　　*L* **49**　　　# 256

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

broken link

SuggestedRemedy

fix the Clause 45 link as it is in the document. Correct links not in the document as already requested.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168**　　　　　*P* **26**　　　*L* **0**　　　# 257

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **X**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Missing editorial instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editorial instruction: Insert Clause 168.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　　　*P* **11**　　　*L* **54**　　　# 258

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Missing table of contents

SuggestedRemedy

Create table of contents and insert after the introductory material and before Clause 30.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **258**

Page 27 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.1**　　　　*P* **26**　　*L* **7**　　# 259

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

There should not be editor's notes in D2.0 or later.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete note indicating which subclause this is based on. Delete similar notes in 168.2, 168.3, 168.4, 168.5, 168.7, 168.8, 168.9, 168.10, and 168.12.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #120.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.1**　　　　*P* **26**　　*L* **19**　　# 260

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

broken link

SuggestedRemedy

fix the Clause 45 link as it is in the document.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.4**　　　　*P* **29**　　*L* **27**　　# 261

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

tables should not be in the middle of a paragraph

SuggestedRemedy

Move Tables 168-2 and 168-3 after the paragraph text.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.7.5.4**　　　　*P* **39**　　*L* **27**　　# 262

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

figures should not be in the middle of a paragraph

SuggestedRemedy

Move Figure 168-5 after the paragraph text.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.7.13.1**　　　　*P* **42**　　*L* **35**　　# 263

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

Figure 168-7 is part of 168.7.13.1, not 168.7.13.

SuggestedRemedy

Move Figure 168-7 after the first paragraph of 168.7.13.1.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.9**　　　　*P* **45**　　*L* **19**　　# 264

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

tables should not be in the middle of a paragraph

SuggestedRemedy

Move Table 168-12 after the paragraph text.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1.27b.10**　　　　*P* **15**　　*L* **13**　　# 265

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*bucket_EZ*

The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 45.2.1.27b.10 to 45.2.1.33.d

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **265**

Page 28 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.27b.11**   *P* **15**   *L* **19**   # 266

Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 45.2.1.27b.11 to 45.2.1.33.e

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.27b.12**   *P* **15**   *L* **25**   # 267

Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket_EZ*

The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 45.2.1.27b.12 to 45.2.1.33.f

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **267**   Page 29 of 29
2025/4/18 22:58:03