

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 157 SC 157.2 P21 L15 # 1 [REDACTED]  
 D'Ambrosia, John Futurewei, U.S. Subsidiary of Huawei  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 As currently written, Note A only applies to the one cell where it is denoted, when in actuality it applies to all of the various cells in the clause columns  
 Also applies to Table 157-4, 157-5, and 157-6  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Move the current location of Note A in table to next to "Clause."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.1 P27 L19 # 2 [REDACTED]  
 D'Ambrosia, John Futurewei, U.S. Subsidiary of Huawei  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 The bottom of the "Physical Layer" is incorrect - it includes the MDI and should be drawn to the top of the "Medium"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 27  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 Maintenance required for Figure 140-1 in Clause 140.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.3 P18 L42 # 4 [REDACTED]  
 Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger Hochfrequenztechnik GmbH & Co. KG  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket  
 Table 157-2 - Multi-Gigabit Ethernet BiDi PHYs is interrupted by Figure 157-1a - Architectural positioning of 100 Gb/s Ethernet BiDi PHYs.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Reorder from: "Figure 157-1 ... Table 157-2 ... Figure 157-1a ... Table 157-2 (continued)" to "Figure 157-1 ... Figure 157-1a ... Table 157-2"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #127.

Cl 157 SC 157.2.1 P21 L15 # 5 [REDACTED]  
 Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger Hochfrequenztechnik GmbH & Co. KG  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Table 157-3 has ist footnote index on the Mandatory "M" in line 2, column 3. All other tables have this footnote index on line 2 column 2.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change the footnote index position to the Line: "10GBASE-BR10-D" , column "EEE"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #1.

Cl 00 SC 0 P7 L50 # 6 [REDACTED]  
 Maguire, Valerie Copperopolis (aff'l w/ CME Consulting and Cisco)  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 IEEE-SA Standards Board member names to be supplied at publication  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace, "Konstantinos Karachalios, Secretary"  
 with, "FirstName SecondName, Secretary"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P7 L31 # 20 [REDACTED]  
 Lusted, Kent Synopsys  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Fill in the balloter information in the introduction  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fill in the balloter information in the introduction  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

**Cl FM SC FM P1 L 26 # 25**  
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.  
**Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ**  
 Task Force review has completed.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Change "Task Force review" to "Working Group Ballot".  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 See comment #132.

**Cl FM SC FM P8 L 31 # 27**  
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.  
**Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ**  
 Placeholder should be replaced  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Change "IEEE Std 802.3xx-20xx" to "IEEE Std 802.3dk-20xx"  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.7.4 P13 L 12 # 29**  
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.  
**Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket\_EZ**  
 Table 45-9 has been amended multiple times. The editorial instruction should state which version the amendment is based on. Similarly for other tables in existing clauses (45 and 80). I believe the current version of table 45-9 is in 802.3df-2024. Other tables may be in different amendments. (P802.3da is also in flight but I assume P802.3dk is planned to be completed first)  
 The label in the suggested remedy is based on the label in 802.3df.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 In the editorial instruction before Table 45-9, change the text to:  
 Insert a new row in Table 45-9 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3db-2022, IEEE Std 802.3ck-2022, and IEEE 802.3df-2024) after the row for "100GBASE-LR4, 100GBASE-ER4", as follows (some unchanged rows not shown):"  
 Change other instructions in clause 45 and clause 80 as appropriate.  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

**Cl 157 SC 157 P17 L 1 # 30**  
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.  
**Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket\_EZ**  
 Missing editorial instruction for clause 157.  
 It seems that this amendment includes the whole clause with changes. But instructions should be given for specific changes, per the IEEE SA style manual.  
 Especially, changes to tables and the addition of a new figure 157-1a should be separate instructions. Tables that are not changed at all (such as table 157-3 through table 157-5) should not appear in the draft.

Previous amendments can be used as references.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Add editorial instructions to each subclause that is changed, as done in previous amendments.  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #102.

**Cl 157 SC 157.1.2 P17 L 30 # 31**  
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.  
**Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ**  
 Missing "and" before 80.1.3  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Insert "and"  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 157 SC 157.3 P24 L 7 # 33**  
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.  
**Comment Type E Comment Status X Bucket\_EZ**  
 Missing period at the end of the last paragraph.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Add a period.  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 168 SC 168 P26 L1 # 35  
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Missing editorial instruction for clause 168.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add an editorial instruction: "Insert new clause 168".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.1 P33 L50 # 41  
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Footnote b of Table 167-7 refers to clause 139, but this clause is for a 50 Gb/s PMD and is irrelevant. The relevant clause may be 140 instead (assuming it is consistent; if not, further changes need to be made).  
 Also, external references should be indicated by "forest green" text color.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "Clause 139" to "Clause 140" and format as external reference (forest green).  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.1 P36 L7 # 45  
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Typo in "Sidn"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to "Side"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.5.3 P38 L50 # 46  
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Reference to 121.8.5.3 is not a functional link. It should be formatted as an external reference.  
 Other similar external references appear in 168.7.13.1, 168.7.13.2, 168.7.13.3, 168.7.7 (3 references), 168.7.11, 168.8.1, and maybe other places.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Format all external references in forest green text color.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.5.4 P39 L3 # 47  
 Ran, Adee Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 "5 tap, T spaced" should be "5-tap, T-spaced".  
 (see for example 167.8.6.1 in 802.3db)

I am aware that the same text exists in many previous clauses, but an error should not be carried over to a new clause.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change per comment.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.



IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 157 SC 157.3 P24 L 23 # 61  
 Regev, Alon Keysight  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 "80.4" should be a link  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change "80.4" to a link to "80.4"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 See comment #121.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.2 P17 L 30 # 64  
 Regev, Alon Keysight  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 "80.1.3" should be "and 80.1.3"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change "80.1.3" to "and 80.1.3"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.1 P36 L 7 # 65  
 Regev, Alon Keysight  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 "sidn" should be "side"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change "sidn-mode" to "side-mode"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.1 P33 L 50 # 72  
 Johnson, John Broadcom  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 It's unnecessary to compare with Cl. 139 in footnote (b).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete "Even though the representation of the OMAouter requirement is different from that in Clause 139, they are consistent." from footnote (b).  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #41.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.2 P17 L 30 # 81  
 Simms, William NVIDIA  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 missing 'and' before 80.1.3  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 add the 'and' to be consistent with the one removed in front of 50 Gb/s  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.4 P29 L 26 # 82  
 Simms, William NVIDIA  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 strage break in body text and insertion of Tables  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Leave text at line 23 and picking up at line 49 unbroken and move tables to appropriate location  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 168 SC 168.7.5.4 P39 L3 # 83  
 Simms, William NVIDIA  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 strange break in text between line 3 and 17 with figure n the mddle.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 move figure to after the completed text  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPTED IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 168 SC 168.9 P45 L17 # 85  
 Simms, William NVIDIA  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 another break in text for table  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 move table after text  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.2 P17 L30 # 86  
 Mi, Guangcan Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 in "131.1.2 (for 50 Gb/s), 80.1.3 (for 100 Gb/s)", missing and  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change to "131.1.2 (for 50 Gb/s), and 80.1.3 (for 100 Gb/s)"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.1 P33 L15 # 89  
 Mi, Guangcan Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 the labe of wavelength is currently written as 100GBASE-BRx-D center wavelengths (range) or 100GBASE-BRx-U center wavelengths (range). This doesn't seem right. The upstream and down stream would only have one wavelength each. The wavelength can not be precisely controlled, thus a range is specified allowing the center wavelength to drift or shift. It is however a single wavelength, therefore the plural form here is not appropriate.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change wavelengths to wavelength in both cases of upstream and downstream.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Implement suggested remedy to Table 168-6 and Table 168-7.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.6 P39 L27 # 92  
 Mi, Guangcan Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 "The TECQ of each lane is measured using the methods specified for TDECQ in 168.7.5, except that the test fiber is not used."  
 There is only one lane in BRx PMDs in each direction.

SuggestedRemedy  
 delete " of each lane"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b P14 L13 # 97  
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Std 802.3-2022 BiDi PMA/PMD extended ability 2 is clause 45.2.1.33 and Table 45-37.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix the Clause numbering to align with base standard and update editing instructions appropriately.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #144.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

**Cl 45** SC **45.2.1.27b** P**14** L**44** # **98**  
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **X** bucket\_EZ  
 The descriptions of the bits are done from highest number bit to lowest. So the new clauses that are adding higher numbered bits should be inserted "before" the existing sub-classes describing bits 5:0.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change editing instruction to insert the new clauses "before 45.2.1.33.1" (after correcting to base standard clause numbers)  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

**Cl 80** SC **80.4** P**16** L**13** # **101**  
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** bucket\_EZ  
 The other optical PHYs in this table note that the delay time includes 2m of fiber.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add "Includes 2m of fiber." before the See 168.3.1  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 157** SC **157.1** P**17** L**1** # **102**  
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** bucket\_EZ  
 There is no editing instruction for Clause 157 which is an existing base standard clause.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Reduce the amount of text, Figures and Tables to only be changes being made to Clause 157 and not the entire Clause. Inserting appropriate editing instructions for section that is being changed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

**Cl 157** SC **157.6** P**24** L**51** # **103**  
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** bucket  
 Clauses 161-167 are related to things other than the BiDi PMDs  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove the strikethough of Clause 160 and insert a , between Clause 160 and Clause 168  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #167.

**Cl 168** SC **168.12.3** P**49** L**15** # **104**  
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** bucket\_EZ  
 INS is used as a conditional in 168.12.4.8 so it needs a \*  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a \* before INS in the item column in 168.12.3  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 30** SC **30.5.1.1.2** P**12** L**12** # **105**  
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **X** bucket\_EZ  
 100GBASE-T does not exist.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change the editing instructions to be "Insert the following types into the "APPROPRIATE SYNTAX" section of 30.5.1.1.2 before 100GBASE-CR1 (as inserted by IEEE Std. 802.3ck-2022):"  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #135.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

**Cl 157**    **SC 157.3**                    **P24**            **L7**            # **106**  
 Zimmerman, George                    ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse  
**Comment Type**    **E**                    **Comment Status**    **D**                    *bucket\_EZ*  
 80.3 should be an External cross reference or else bring it in to the draft (do changes need to be made? - the existing 80.3 does NOT reference that it applies to 100GBASE-BRx PHYs ....)  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Mark 80.3 as External (green) or bring it into the draft with appropriate changes to refernece application to 100GBASE-BRx PHYs.  
**Proposed Response**                    **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 See comment #60.

**Cl 168**    **SC 168.3.2**                    **P28**            **L52**            # **107**  
 Zimmerman, George                    ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse  
**Comment Type**    **E**                    **Comment Status**    **X**                    *bucket\_EZ*  
 Active cross references to sections 80.5, Figure 80-9, 83.5.3.4, all point nowhere, they are not in the draft.  
 I will not comment more on cross references - however, there are numerous ones missed and they need to be checked.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Mark cross references as external. Editor to check the draft for external cross references globally and fix.  
**Proposed Response**                    **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license and discretion.

**Cl 168**    **SC 168.6.3**                    **P35**            **L11**            # **110**  
 Zimmerman, George                    ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse  
**Comment Type**    **T**                    **Comment Status**    **R**                    *bucket\_EZ*  
 The unit for a power budget can't be dB - power has units - dBm, for example.... dB is only good for ratios.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Either rename "Power budget" so it is clear it is a ratio, or change units to reflect a unit of power (e.g., dBm)  
**Response**                                    **Response Status**    **Z**  
 REJECT.  
 This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Power budget (dB)=channel insertion loss (dB) + allocation for penalties (dB)

**Cl 30**    **SC 30.5.1.1.2**                    **P12**            **L12**            # **113**  
 Zimmerman, George                    ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse  
**Comment Type**    **E**                    **Comment Status**    **X**                    *bucket\_EZ*  
 As a card-carrying BASE-T guy, I'm pretty sure we never got so audacious as to do 100GBASE-T. Where does this go? Most of these are alphanumeric, so I think the new MAUs are the first in the 100G section... (whereas "T" would be in an odd place, near the end, and the location of the new row in the fault description tables is grouped after the LR4/ER4 row... - that's why I'm not sure)  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 change 100GBASE-T to 50GBASE-SR  
**Proposed Response**                    **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #135.

**Cl 30**    **SC 30.5.1.1.2**                    **P12**            **L20**            # **114**  
 Zimmerman, George                    ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse  
**Comment Type**    **E**                    **Comment Status**    **X**                    *bucket\_EZ*  
 "Clause 168" references should be active cross-references (hyperlinks) - they are not.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Replace "Clause 168" text at lines 20, 23, 26, 29, 32, and 35 with active cross references  
**Proposed Response**                    **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

**Cl 45**    **SC 45.2.1.27b.7**    **P14**    **L 43**    # **115**  
 Zimmerman, George    ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse  
**Comment Type**    **E**    **Comment Status**    **X**    *bucket\_EZ*  
 Insert editorial instructions are without underscores (those are for inserts on a "Change" instruction)  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Remove underscores in 45.2.1.27b.7 through 45.2.1.27b.12 (including on paragraph text).  
**Proposed Response**    **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 168**    **SC 168**    **P26**    **L 1**    # **117**  
 Zimmerman, George    ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse  
**Comment Type**    **E**    **Comment Status**    **X**    *bucket\_EZ*  
 Again, no editing instruction.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Insert editing instruction prior to header, "Insert Clause 168 after Clause 167."  
**Proposed Response**    **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

**Cl 30**    **SC 30.5.1.1.2**    **P12**    **L 11**    # **122**  
 Huber, Thomas    Nokia  
**Comment Type**    **E**    **Comment Status**    **X**    *bucket\_EZ*  
 100GBASE-T is not included in 30.5.1.1.2 of 802.3-2022 or any of its amendments. Further, in the rest of 30.5.1.1.2, the PHYs are listed alphabetically by rate; as such, this set BRxx PHYs should be inserted before 100GBASE-CR  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Change the editing instruction to say "Insert the following types into the "APPROPRIATE SYNTAX" section of 30.5.1.1.2 after 50GBASE-SR:"  
**Proposed Response**    **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #135.

**Cl 45**    **SC 45.2.1.27b**    **P14**    **L 13**    # **123**  
 Huber, Thomas    Nokia  
**Comment Type**    **E**    **Comment Status**    **D**    *bucket\_EZ*  
 The clause number for BiDi PMA/PMD extended ability 2 (register 1.35) is 45.2.1.33. The table number is 45-37.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Change the clause number from 45.2.1.27b to 45.2.1.33, change the editing instruction to say "Insert new rows in Table 45-37 above the row for "1.35.5" as shown (additional unchanged rows not shown):", and change the table number from 45-31b to 45-37.  
**Proposed Response**    **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #144.

**Cl 157**    **SC 157**    **P17**    **L 1**    # **126**  
 Huber, Thomas    Nokia  
**Comment Type**    **E**    **Comment Status**    **D**    *bucket\_EZ*  
 This clause is missing editing instructions  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Add an editing instruction at the top of the page:  
 "Change clauses 157 and 157.1 as shown:"  
 Add an editing instruction below clause 157.2: "Change clause 157.2.1 as shown"  
 Delete tables 157-3 through 157-5, as they are not being modified.  
 Add an editing instruction: "Insert Table 157-6 below Table 157-5."  
 Add an editing instruction: "Change clauses 157.2.2 through 157.2.5 as shown:"  
 Delete clauses 157.2.6 and 157.2.7 since they are not being modified.  
 Add an editing instruction: "Change clauses 157.3, 157.4, and 157.6 as shown:"  
**Proposed Response**    **Response Status**    **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #102.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 157 SC 157.6 P24 L 50 # 128  
 Huber, Thomas Nokia  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket  
 The change to replace clause 160 with 168 is not correct; clauses 161 to 167 are unrelated to bidirectional PHYs.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Undo the replacement of 160 with 168, and add Clause 168 to the list, so it reads "... Clause 114, Clause 158 through Clause 160, Clause 168, and related annexes..."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #167.

Cl 00 SC 0 P0 L0 # 131  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 pdf metadata is at default  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Populate with correct data  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 See comment #53.

Cl FM SC FM P1 L 26 # 132  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Task Force review  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Working Group ballot  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl Content SC Contents P12 L0 # 133  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Contents is missing  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add Contents  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 See comment #258.

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P12 L12 # 135  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Unlike most tables which are in order of MAC rate - reach - length, this is in alphanumeric order  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "30.5.1.1.2 after 100GBASE-T" to "30.5.1.1.2 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3ck-2022), after 50GBASE-SR and before 100GBASE-CR1"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P12 L23 # 138  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Trailing blanks  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove. It looks like there are five in this page  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.2 P12 L 23 # 139  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Three dots  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Should not be underlined  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.8.1 P13 L 48 # 142  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Table 45-12 is part of 45.2.1.8 not 45.2.1.8.1  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete "45.2.1.8.1 PMD transmit disable 14 (1.9.15)"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 80 SC 80.4 P16 L 6 # 156  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 This table is ordered by MAC rate - reach - length, so these rows don't go at the end  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "Insert three new rows at the end of Table 80-7" to "Insert three new rows in Table 80-7 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3db-2022) between 100GBASE-LR1 PMD and 100GBASE-ER4 PMD"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Implemented suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 80 SC 80.4 P16 L 13 # 158  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 To match the existing entries  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Insert "Includes 2 m of fiber." 3 times  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #101.

Cl 157 SC 157.2.4 P23 L 20 # 164  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 medium independent  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 medium-independent  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 157 SC 157.4 P24 L 22 # 165  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket  
 I think that the normative delay specs are in 168.3, and what is in 80.4 is sort of a restatement for clarity.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "in 80.4" to "in 168.3 (and see 80.4)"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Clause 80.4 and 168.3 specifications are the same.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 157 SC 157.6 P24 L 50 # 167  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Clause 114, Clause 158 through Clause 160 Clause 168, and related annexes demonstrates  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Clause 114, Clause 158 Xthrough Clause 160X , Clause 159, Clause 160, or \_Clause 168,\_  
 and related annexes demonstrates  
 [inserting a comma]  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Change the description as:  
 Clause 45, Clause 49, Clause 73, Clause 74, Clause 106 through Clause 112, Clause 114,  
 Clause 158 through Clause 160, Clause 168, and related annexes.

Cl 168 SC 168.1 P27 L 28 # 172  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Layout  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Left justify  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 168 SC 168.1 P27 L 36 # 173  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Blank line?  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove?  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.5.4 P31 L 23 # 175  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 inter-sublayer service interface primitives defined in 131.3.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 inter-sublayer service interface primitives defined in 80.3.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.5.4 P31 L 31 # 177  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 This "base text" does not agree with the published 160.5 and similar sections in other  
 clauses such as 140 and 167. "Must" is deprecated.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "an unavoidable consequence" to "a consequence". Change "must" to "need to".  
 Make any other changes to align with the published 802.3 as appropriate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.1 P33 L 19 # 178  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 For improved readability, where the parameter limits seem likely to remain the same for all 3  
 (6) PMDs...  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 As for the first four rows, merge and straddle the triple entries for  
 Side-mode suppression ratio (SMSR), (min)  
 Transmitter transition time (max)  
 RINxOMA (max)  
 Transmitter reflectance (max)  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 168 SC 168.6.1 P33 L39 # 179  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Use the emerging standard order for these parameters (see Clause 151)  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Move Average launch power of OFF transmitter (max)  
 to after Transmitter transition time (max)  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.1 P33 L51 # 181  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type T Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 A comparison with Clause 139 (50GBASE-FR LR ER) doesn't seem relevant; saying this is  
 consistent doesn't seem correct.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete the sentence "Even though the representation of the OMAouter requirement is  
 different from that in Clause 139, they are consistent."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #41.

Cl 168 SC 168.6.1 P34 L1 # 182  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 In equations, functions and abbreviations of words should be upright not italic  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change max to upright, three times  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Follow the style manual.  
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.1 P36 L7 # 184  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Sidn  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Side  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.4 P37 L2 # 185  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Blank line(s)?  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove. Set the figure to float.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.7 P39 L33 # 189  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 There is only one limit for this in the table  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change limits to limit  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.10 P40 L36 # 190  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 There is only one limit for this in the table  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change limits to limit  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 168 SC 168.7.13.1 P43 L2 # 200  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 100 MHz  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use non-breaking space  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #79.

Cl 168 SC 168.8.1 P44 L3 # 203  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Links to be made by staff  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Should be forest green. Also in 168.12.4.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.8.2 P44 L17 # 204  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Most sections like this have a footnote:  
 A host system that fails to meet the manufacturer's requirements and/or usage restrictions may emit laser radiation in excess of the safety limits of one or more safety standards. In such a case, the host manufacturer is required to obtain its own laser safety certification.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 If this footnote is required, add it  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 168 SC 168.9 P45 L44 # 207  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Other clauses have changed to the IEC definition  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "ANSI/TIA/EIA-526-7/method A-1" to "the IEC 61280-4-2 one-cord reference method"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.10 P46 L1 # 208  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Table 168-12 contains numbers not definitions  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "defined in" to "given in" or "of"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Change "defined in" to "given in".

Cl 168 SC 168.10 P46 L9 # 209  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 ...), or type G.657.A1 or type G.657.A2 (bend insensitive) fibers or the requirements in ...  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Insert comma, as in 151.11.1:  
 ...), or type G.657.A1 or type G.657.A2 (bend insensitive) fibers, or the requirements in ...  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 168 SC 168.12.1 P48 L 14 # 213  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Links to be made by staff  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Should be forest green. Also at like 47  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.12.1 P48 L 28 # 214  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Blank sub-row?  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove. Also in 168.12.3, twice  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.12.3 P49 L 13 # 215  
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 The ONU silent start applies to the U PHYs but not the D PHYs  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Create major options for U and D. Status of F12 ONU silent start becomes U:M  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 157 SC 1.3 P18 L 1 # 220  
 Effenberger, Frank Futurewei Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket  
 Figure 157-1(a) is unfortunate in how it breaks over the pages, and then Table 157-2 gets broken up in a weird way.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Try to squeeze all four speeds onto a single figure.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #127.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b P14 L 13 # 227  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change 45.2.1.27b to 45.2.1.33 and reorder to put the clauses in the correct order.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 See comment #144.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b P14 L 15 # 228  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 The Table numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change Table 45-31b to Table 45-37, also on line 19  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

**Cl 45**    **SC 45.2.1.27b.7**    **P14**    **L43**    # **229**  
 Wienckowski, Natalie    IVN Solutions LLC  
**Comment Type E**    **Comment Status D**    *bucket\_EZ*  
 The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021. Also, the higher number bits are defined before the lower number bits so the new bit definitions go before the existing ones.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Change: 45.2.1.27b.7-45.2.1.27b.12 after 45.2.1.27b.6  
 To: 45.2.1.33.a-45.2.1.33.f before 45.2.1.33.1  
**Proposed Response**    **Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 See comment #144.

**Cl 45**    **SC 45.2.1.27b.7**    **P14**    **L45**    # **230**  
 Wienckowski, Natalie    IVN Solutions LLC  
**Comment Type E**    **Comment Status D**    *bucket\_EZ*  
 The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Change 45.2.1.27b.7 to 45.2.1.33.a  
**Proposed Response**    **Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 See comment #144.

**Cl 45**    **SC 45.2.1.27b.8**    **P15**    **L1**    # **231**  
 Wienckowski, Natalie    IVN Solutions LLC  
**Comment Type E**    **Comment Status D**    *bucket\_EZ*  
 The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Change 45.2.1.27b.8 to 45.2.1.33.b  
**Proposed Response**    **Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 45**    **SC 45.2.1.27b.9**    **P15**    **L8**    # **232**  
 Wienckowski, Natalie    IVN Solutions LLC  
**Comment Type E**    **Comment Status D**    *bucket\_EZ*  
 The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Change 45.2.1.27b.9 to 45.2.1.33.c  
**Proposed Response**    **Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

**Cl 157**    **SC 157.1.1**    **P17**    **L3**    # **233**  
 Wienckowski, Natalie    IVN Solutions LLC  
**Comment Type E**    **Comment Status D**    *bucket\_EZ*  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Add editorial instruction: Change the first and second paragraphs of 157.1.1 as follows:  
 Delete third paragraph as it has no changes.  
**Proposed Response**    **Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #102.

**Cl 157**    **SC 157.1.2**    **P17**    **L23**    # **234**  
 Wienckowski, Natalie    IVN Solutions LLC  
**Comment Type E**    **Comment Status D**    *bucket\_EZ*  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Add editorial instruction: Change 157.1.2 as follows:  
**Proposed Response**    **Response Status W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #102.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 157 SC 157.1.3 P18 L1 # 237  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
 The unchanged figure should not be included.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add editorial instruction: Change title of Figure 157-1 as follows:  
 Delete the figure.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #127.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.3 P18 L35 # 239  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add editorial instruction: Change the second paragraph of 157.1.3 as follows:  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.3 P19 L1 # 240  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add editorial instruction: Insert Figure 157-1a after Figure 157-1 as follows:  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #127.

Cl 157 SC 157.1.4 P20 L37 # 241  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add editorial instruction: Change 157.1.4 as follows:  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.2.1 P20 L45 # 242  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add editorial instruction: Change title 157.2.1 as follows:  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.2.1 P20 L48 # 243  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add editorial instruction: Change the last sentence of the first paragraph of 157.2.1 as follows:  
 Move all text to before the tables. Delete the unchanged sentences as they have no changes.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 157 SC 157.2.1 P21 L1 # 244  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Delete unchanged content.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete Table 157-3, Table 157-4, Table 157-5.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 157 SC 157.2.1 P22 L26 # 245  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add editorial instruction: Insert Table 157-6 after Table 157-5 as follows:  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.2.2 P23 L5 # 246  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add editorial instruction: Change 157.2.2 as follows:  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.2.3 P23 L12 # 247  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add editorial instruction: Change 157.2.3 as follows:  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.2.4 P23 L19 # 248  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add editorial instruction: Change the second and third paragraphs of 157.2.4 as follows:  
 Delete the first paragraph as it doesn't have any changes.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.2.5 P23 L34 # 249  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add editorial instruction: Change 157.2.5 as follows:  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.2.6 P23 L39 # 250  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Unchanged subclause  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete 157.2.6  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #102.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 157 SC 157.2.7 P23 L43 # 251  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Unchanged subclause  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete 157.2.7  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #102.

Cl 157 SC 157.3 P23 L51 # 252  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add editorial instruction: Insert paragraph at the end of 157.3 as follows:  
 Delete unchanged paragraphs.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.4 P24 L10 # 253  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add editorial instruction: Insert paragraph at the end of 157.4 as follows:  
 Delete unchanged paragraphs.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.6 P24 L47 # 255  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add editorial instruction: Change the first paragraph of 157.6 as follows:  
 Delete the second paragraph as it doesn't have any changes.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl 157 SC 157.6 P24 L49 # 256  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 broken link  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 fix the Clause 45 link as it is in the document. Correct links not in the document as already requested.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168 P26 L0 # 257  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X bucket\_EZ  
 Missing editorial instruction.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add editorial instruction: Insert Clause 168.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 00 SC 0 P11 L 54 # 258  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Missing table of contents  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Create table of contents and insert after the introductory material and before Clause 30.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.1 P26 L 19 # 260  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 broken link  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 fix the Clause 45 link as it is in the document.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.4 P29 L 27 # 261  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 tables should not be in the middle of a paragraph  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Move Tables 168-2 and 168-3 after the paragraph text.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.5.4 P39 L 27 # 262  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 figures should not be in the middle of a paragraph  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Move Figure 168-5 after the paragraph text.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.13.1 P42 L 35 # 263  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 Figure 168-7 is part of 168.7.13.1, not 168.7.13.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Move Figure 168-7 after the first paragraph of 168.7.13.1.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.9 P45 L 19 # 264  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 tables should not be in the middle of a paragraph  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Move Table 168-12 after the paragraph text.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27b.10 P15 L 13 # 265  
 Wienckowski, Natalie IVN Solutions LLC  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket\_EZ  
 The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change 45.2.1.27b.10 to 45.2.1.33.d  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3dk D2.0 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs Initial Working Group ballot comments

---

**Cl 45**      **SC 45.2.1.27b.11**      **P15**      **L 19**      # **266**

Wienckowski, Natalie      IVN Solutions LLC

**Comment Type E**      **Comment Status D**      *bucket\_EZ*

The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.

*SuggestedRemedy*  
Change 45.2.1.27b.11 to 45.2.1.33.e

*Proposed Response*      **Response Status W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

**Cl 45**      **SC 45.2.1.27b.12**      **P15**      **L 25**      # **267**

Wienckowski, Natalie      IVN Solutions LLC

**Comment Type E**      **Comment Status D**      *bucket\_EZ*

The Clause numbers from P802.3-2022 need to be used, not the numbers from P802.3cp-2021.

*SuggestedRemedy*  
Change 45.2.1.27b.12 to 45.2.1.33.f

*Proposed Response*      **Response Status W**  
PROPOSED ACCEPT.