Cl **168** *SC* **168.7.5** *P* **37** *L* **20** # 23

Mi, Guangcan Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **A** *D2.0 unresolved*

looking back at CL 140.7 and other IMDD clauses in 100Gbps, the description of TDECQ and its measurement setup has been referencing as much as possible the existing content in CL 121.8.5 and writing only the changes and differences. An example in CL140 is:
"TDECQ, and for 100GBASE-DR only, TDECQ – 10log10(Ceq) shall be within the limits given in
Table 140–6 if measured using the test setup specified in 121.8.5.1, with an optical channel specified in 140.7.5.2, using the measurement method specified in 121.8.5.3, and using a reference equalizer as described in 140.7.5.1, with the following exceptions: ......"

also double checking the content of 168.7.5.1, there seems no technical difference than what was defined in CL 140.7.5 or CL 124.8.5, except need of updates to the table references. For the sake of clarity and consistence, also avoiding misleading message of new test setp, it is recommended to update the section with references to existing clauses while only listing out the exceptions.

SuggestedRemedy

delet sections 168.7.5.1, 168.7.5.3,168.7.5.4. make appropriate references to existing clauses, so that the overall standard of 802.3 is coherent. implement with editorial licenses.

some possible languages:
The TDECQ shall be within the limits given in
Table 168–6 if measured using the test setup specified in 121.8.5.1, with an optical channel specified in 168.7.5.2, using the measurement method specified in 121.8.5.3, and using a reference equalizer as described in 168.7.5.1, with the following exceptions:
The signaling rate of the test pattern generator is as given in Table 168–6 and uses a test pattern
specified for TDECQ in Table 168–10.
— The combination of the O/E converter and the oscilloscope has a 3 dB bandwidth of approximately 26.5625 GHz with a fourth-order Bessel-Thomson response to at least 1.3 × 53.125 GHz and at frequencies above 1.3 × 53.125 GHz the response should not exceed – 20 dB. Compensation may be made for any deviation from an ideal fourth-order Bessel-Thomson response.
— The normalized noise power density spectrum, N(f) in Equation (121–9), is equivalent to white noise filtered by a fourth-order Bessel-Thomson response filter with a 3 dB bandwidth of 26.5625 GHz."

or

"The TDECQ shall be within the limits given in Table 168–6 if measured using the test setup specified in 121.8.5.1, with an optical channel specified in 168.7.5.2, using the measurement method specified in 140.7.5, and using a reference equalizer as described in 140.7.5.1."

or other format that fits.

Response *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Resolve using response to comment #15.

Cl **168** *SC* **168.7.7** *P* **39** *L* **31** # 24

Mi, Guangcan Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **A** *unresolved (over/under shoot)*

There seems to be no change from the method defined in CL 140. reference to CL 140 regarding the calculation.

SuggestedRemedy

possible language from CL 151, and update the reference tables should serve the purpose :

"The over/under-shoot of each lane shall be within the limits given in Table 151–7 if measured using a test
pattern specified for over/under-shoot in Table 151–11.
Overshoot and undershoot are measured using the waveform captured for the TDECQ test (see 151.8.5) and the waveform captured for the TECQ test (see 151.8.6), but without the reference equalizer being applied in each case.
Overshoot and undershoot are calculated using the methods in 140.7.7."

Response *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Resolve using response to comment #16.

Cl **168** *SC* **168.7.11** *P* **40** *L* **51** # 25

Mi, Guangcan Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *D2.0 unresolved*

802.3 dj has extensively discussed the definition of RINxOMA. Consensus were made to update the definition of RINxOMA which better describes the actual behaviour and aligns with what is being used in the field. Related contribution from Ahmad and JJ, https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_09/chayeb_3dj_01_2409.pdf

SuggestedRemedy

align to what is defined in dj.

Response *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.
The group made consensus to keep consistent with CL140.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **25**   Page 1 of 5
2025/5/27 23:05:25

Cl **168**   *SC* **168.3.2**   *P* **29**   *L* **2**   # 27

Zimmerman, George   ADI,APLgp,Cisco,Marvell,OnSemi,Sony,SenTekse

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**   *D2.0 unresolved*

"is" is for statements of fact. The limitation on the skew seems to be a requirement. Further, the requirements in 83.5.3.4 go further and specify skew variation. Is that to be specified? While 83.5.3.4 was mentioned earlier defining skew, it isn't clear that those requirements apply. Here is where that should be stated.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Skew at SP2 is limited to 43 ns as defined by 83.5.3.4" to "Skew and skew variation at SP2 shall comply with the requirements of 83.5.3.4"

Response   *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.
The signal at SP2 in not under control of PMD, so "shall" is inappropriate.
Keep consistent with Clause 140.

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **11**   *L* **54**   # 65

Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**   *contents*

Missing table of contents
This was submitted as comment #258 on D2.0. The comment resolution was "ACCEPT", but the table has not been added.

SuggestedRemedy

Create table of contents and insert after the introductory material and before Clause 30.

Response   *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.8**   *P* **17**   *L* **22**   # 66

Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **R**   *cross-ref*

Subclause 45.2.1.8.1 should not have been removed as Table 45-12 is in this subclause.

SuggestedRemedy

Restore subclause 45.2.1.8.1

Response   *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.
Table 45-12 is part of 45.2.1.8, not 45.2.1.8.1.
See D2.0 comment #142.

Cl **157**   *SC* **157.6**   *P* **34**   *L* **14**   # 67

Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**   *external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated. Clause 160 is not in this document.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to "Clause 160".

Response   *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **168**   *SC* **168.1**   *P* **45**   *L* **29**   # 69

Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**   *external*

References to external points not properly indicated. In Table 168-1, there are links to the following which are not in the document: 81, 82, 83, 83A, 83B, 83D, 83E, 135, 135D, 135E, 135F, 135G, 120F, 120G, and 78.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to "Clause 160".

Response   *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **80**   *SC* **80.2.5**   *P* **21**   *L* **51**   # 71

Wienckowski, Natalie   IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**   *external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to: Clause 84, Clause 89, Clause 92, Clause 95, Clause 136, Clause 138, Clause 140, Clause 154, and Clause 163.

Response   *Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **71**

Page 2 of 5
2025/5/27 23:05:26

Cl **80**　　*SC* **80.4**　　　　*P* **22**　　*L* **12**　　# 74

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to: 140.3 and 88.3.1.

Response　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **80**　　*SC* **80.7**　　　　*P* **23**　　*L* **38**　　# 76

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to: Clause 73, Clause 74, Clause 71, Clause 91, Clause 95, Clause 135, Clause 138, Clause 140, Clause 152, Clause 154, Clause 161, and Clause 163.

Response　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **91**　　*SC* **91.5.3.3**　　　　*P* **24**　　*L* **35**　　# 77

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to "91.6.8".

Response　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **91**　　*SC* **91.5.3.3**　　　　*P* **24**　　*L* **36**　　# 78

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to "91.6.1".

Response　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **91**　　*SC* **91.6.3**　　　　*P* **25**　　*L* **19**　　# 79

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to "91.5.2.6".

Response　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **91**　　*SC* **91.6.3**　　　　*P* **25**　　*L* **25**　　# 80

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to "45.2.1.116".

Response　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **80**

Page 3 of 5
2025/5/27 23:05:26

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.1.4**　　　　*P* **31**　　*L* **28**　　# 87

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to: Table 157-3, Table 157-4, and Table 157-5.

Response　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.2.1**　　　　*P* **31**　　*L* **46**　　# 88

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to: Table 157-3, Table 157-4, and Table 157-5.

Response　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.2.2**　　　　*P* **31**　　*L* **54**　　# 89

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to: Table 157-3, Table 157-4, and Table 157-5.

Response　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.2.2**　　　　*P* **32**　　*L* **8**　　# 90

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to: 120F and 120G.

Response　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.2.3**　　　　*P* **32**　　*L* **36**　　# 92

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to: Table 157-3, Table 157-4, and Table 157-5.

Response　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.2.4**　　　　*P* **32**　　*L* **50**　　# 94

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to: Table 157-3, Table 157-4, and Table 157-5.

Response　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **94**

Page 4 of 5
2025/5/27 23:05:26

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.2.5**　　　　　*P* **33**　　*L* **5**　　　　# 96

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to: Table 157-3, Table 157-4, and Table 157-5.

Response　　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.3**　　　　　*P* **33**　　*L* **21**　　　　# 98

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to "80.3".

Response　　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.4.2**　　　　　*P* **33**　　*L* **48**　　　　# 100

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to "116.5".

Response　　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.5.10**　　　　　*P* **41**　　*L* **28**　　　　# 102

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the hyperlink, which goes no where, and apply a character tag of "External" to "157.5".

Response　　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.8.1**　　　　　*P* **53**　　*L* **18**　　　　# 103

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　　　IVN Solutions LLC

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **A**　　　　　　　*external*

As comment #235 on D2.0 stated: References to external points not properly indicated.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply a character tag of "External" to "J.2".

Response　　　　　　*Response Status* **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **103**

Page 5 of 5
2025/5/27 23:05:26