

E 802.3dk D2.3 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs 3rd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl	Content	SC	Contents	P13	L3	#	1
Dawe, Piers			Nvidia				
Comment Type	E		Comment Status	D			<i>editorial (Late)</i>
Layout							
SuggestedRemedy							
Missing white space after each clause number							
Proposed Response			Response Status	W			
PROPOSED ACCEPT.							

Cl	45	SC	45.2.1.145a	P24	L7	#	2
Dawe, Piers			Nvidia				
Comment Type	E		Comment Status	D			<i>editorial (Late)</i>
Some interfaces have mandatory precoding ability without this bit. This is likely to cause confusion unless explained.							
SuggestedRemedy							
Similarly to 45.2.1.117.7a, insert: This register applies to 100GBASE-BRx.							
Proposed Response			Response Status	W			
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.							

Cl	56	SC	56.1.3	P26	L1	#	3
Dawe, Piers			Nvidia				
Comment Type	E		Comment Status	D			<i>editorial (Late)</i>
802.3cp has been absorbed into 802.3-2022							
SuggestedRemedy							
Delete "(as modified by IEEE Std 802.3cp-2022)" in 3 places							
Proposed Response			Response Status	W			
PROPOSED ACCEPT.							

Cl	56	SC	56.1.3	P26	L11	#	4
Dawe, Piers			Nvidia				
Comment Type	E		Comment Status	D			<i>editorial (Late)</i>
Two ... fiber							
SuggestedRemedy							
Two ... fibers (3 times) as in the base standard							
Proposed Response			Response Status	W			
PROPOSED ACCEPT.							

Cl	56	SC	56.1.3	P30	L29	#	5
Dawe, Piers			Nvidia				
Comment Type	E		Comment Status	D			<i>quick review (Late)</i>
If this table includes 161 RS-FEC-Int							
SuggestedRemedy							
Perhaps it should include 152 Inverse RS-FEC also							
Proposed Response			Response Status	W			
PROPOSED ACCEPT.							

Cl	80	SC	80.1.5	P34	L20	#	6
Dawe, Piers			Nvidia				
Comment Type	E		Comment Status	D			<i>editorial (Late)</i>
Some of what is shown in blue in the diff version seems to be the same as in D2.2.							
SuggestedRemedy							
Proposed Response			Response Status	W			
PROPOSED ACCEPT.							

Cl	91	SC	91.7.4.1	P42	L10	#	7
Dawe, Piers			Nvidia				
Comment Type	E		Comment Status	D			<i>editorial (Late)</i>
TF10 has KR4 not KP4							
SuggestedRemedy							
Change KP4 back to KR4, once							
Proposed Response			Response Status	W			
PROPOSED ACCEPT.							

E 802.3dk D2.3 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs 3rd Working Group recirculation ballot comment

Cl 135 SC 135.6 P5287 L # 8

Dawe, Piers

Nvidia

Comment Type E Comment Status D quick review (Late)

In Table 135-3, MDIO/PMA status variable mapping

SuggestedRemedy

Insert new rows:

MDIO status variable	PMA/PMD register name	Register/bit number	PMA status variable
PMA Rx precoding ability	PMA precoding ability	1.607.1	Rx_precoding_ability
PMA Tx precoding ability	PMA precoding ability	1.607.0	Tx_precoding_ability

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 161 SC 161 P52 L1 # 9

Dawe, Piers

Nvidia

Comment Type E Comment Status D editorial (Late)

Should say that Clause 161 was added by 802.3ck

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change two editing instruction to:

Change Table 161-2 (as added by IEEE Std 802.3ck-2022) as follow (additional unchanged rows not shown):

Insert new subclauses 161.6.10a after 161.6.10 (as added by IEEE Std 802.3ck-2022) as follow:

Cl 161 SC 161 P52 L10 # 10

Dawe, Piers

Nvidia

Comment Type E Comment Status D editorial (Late)

stauts

SuggestedRemedy

status

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 168 SC 168.7.5 P65 L8 # 11

Dawe, Piers

Nvidia

Comment Type T Comment Status X technical (Late)

This says "there's a proposal to add the maximum tap weight for the tap immediately after the largest tap: max 0.07 in CL 168.7.5". chayeb_3dj_01_2505 slide 8 shows that a very asymmetric signal can pass all the specs and still be troublesome to receive. P802.3dj D2.0 comment 392 proposes "The absolute difference between c(-1) and c(1) shall be less than 0.3". However, ordinary filtering effects (pulses decay slower than they build up) can cause the optimum setting for the tap immediately after the largest tap to be more negative than the one immediately before; this is expected. Having the tap before at -0.2 and the tap after at +0.1 would be more undesirable than the reverse.

SuggestedRemedy

Add two specs:

Tap weight for the tap immediately after the largest tap: max 0.08. (Typically this tap would be -ve)

-0.3 <= (tap after - tap before) <= 0.15

Proposed Response Response Status W

For group discussion.

Cl 168 SC 168.10.1 P72 L7 # 12

Dawe, Piers

Nvidia

Comment Type E Comment Status D quick review (Late)

Note b about dispersion doesn't relate to the insertion loss row.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the b after Channel insertion loss a,

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add "over the wavelength range 1303.6nm to 1310.1nm" at the end of note b.

Cl TOC SC TOC P14 L24 # 13

Simms, William

NVIDIA

Comment Type ER Comment Status D editorial

Typo, no space between "networksPhysical"

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "networks Physical" Medium Attachment...

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete "Introduction to 50 Gb/s networks" in the CL135 title in the content.

E 802.3dk D2.3 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs 3rd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl TOC SC TOC P13 L12 # 14
 Simms, William NVIDIA
Comment Type E Comment Status D *quick review*
 Possible Typo aMAUType
SuggestedRemedy
 Change from aMAUType to: MAU Type
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 Subclause title of 30.5.1.1.2 in the IEEE 802.3 base standard is: aMAUType.

Cl 30 SC 30..5.1.1.2 P18 L10 # 15
 Simms, William NVIDIA
Comment Type E Comment Status D *editorial*
 aMAUType
SuggestedRemedy
 Change from aMAUType to: MAU Type
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 See comment #14.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.145a P24 L23 # 16
 Simms, William NVIDIA
Comment Type E Comment Status D *editorial*
 order of the bits should be 1.607.1 and then 1.607.0.
SuggestedRemedy
 Suggest to flip 45.2.1.145a.1 and 45.2.1.145a.2 to make the order 1.607.1 followed by 1.607.0 to be consistent with other parts of the spec
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Cl 135 SC 135.5.7.2 P44 L24 # 17
 Simms, William NVIDIA
Comment Type ER Comment Status D *editorial*
 typo: 1/(1+D) mode 4
SuggestedRemedy
 substitute 1/(1+D) mod 4
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl Introduc SC Introduction P12 L3 # 18
 Lewis, Jon Dell Technologies
Comment Type ER Comment Status D *editorial*
 The first line states that Amendment 11 "adds Clause ." but doesn't include the clause
SuggestedRemedy
 Change the end of the first sentence to "adds Clause 168."
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.