

IEEE P802.3at DTE power via MDI Enhancements

Procedure for Conditional Approval to Forward a Draft Standard report

The following is the Clause 19 'Procedure for Conditional Approval to Forward a Draft Standard' report for IEEE P802.3at DTE power via MDI Enhancements which received conditional approval to proceed to sponsor ballot at the November 2008 IEEE 802 Plenary meeting.

a) Recirculation ballot is completed. Generally, the recirculation ballot and resolution should occur in accordance with the schedule presented at the time of conditional approval.

The schedule presented to November 2008 closing IEEE 802 EC meeting when requesting conditional approval was:

Draft 3.3 of IEEE P802.3at will begin a recirculation ballot on or before Dec 1, 2008
Recirculation will close no later than Dec 16, 2008 AOE.
Comment resolution to be conducted of January 13-15, 2009

BALLOT OPEN: Wednesday, 3rd December 2008
BALLOT CLOSE: Thursday, 18th December 2008, 11:59 p.m. AOE

Complete set of comment resolution responses generated and accepted at IEEE P802.3at January interim as planned. All comments received during the recirculation that closed 18th December 2008 were considered.

The recirculation and resolution occurred essentially in accordance of the plan presented.

b) After resolution of the recirculation ballot is completed, the approval percentage is at least 75% and there are no new DISAPPROVE votes.

The ballot results after resolution are:

Voters:	211
Approve:	116
Disapprove:	8
Abstain:	38
Returns:	162
Response Rate:	76.78%
Approval Rate:	93.55%

The approval rate after resolution of the ballot is greater than 75% and there were no new negative DISAPPROVES votes.

IEEE P802.3at DTE power via MDI Enhancements
Procedure for Conditional Approval to Forward a Draft Standard report

c) No technical changes, as determined by the WG Chair, were made as a result of the recirculation ballot.

Changes have been made to the draft, but they are simply to update the draft number to D4.0, update the draft date to January 15th 2009, update the front matter to state the draft is for sponsor ballot, and to update the copyright year to 2009.

No technical changes have been made.

d) No new valid DISAPPROVE comments on new issues that are not resolved to the satisfaction of the submitter from existing DISAPPROVE voters.

There were no new valid DISAPPROVE comments.

e) If the WG Chair determines that there is a new invalid DISAPPROVE comment or vote, the WG Chair shall promptly provide details to the EC.

Two Technical Required comments were received from one existing DISAPPROVE voter. Verbatim copies of those comments and the detail rulings of the chair are provided below.

Comment #15:

Cl 25	SC 25.4.4a.1	P 19	L 31	# 15
Dawe, Piers		Avago Technologies		
Comment Type	TR	Comment Status	R	
To resolve comment D3.2/119, 'This is not a standard for test equipment.' We can't tell the tester to use accurate or inaccurate test fixtures. It's his job to work out his own tolerances so that when he says something passes (or fails), it does. If you want to give guidance, NOTE 1 is an ideal place.				
SuggestedRemedy				
Delete the +- 1% from the figure. Change note to: NOTE 1-The value of the 100 W termination resistor can be adjusted to compensate for the test circuit resistance. A 1% resistor tolerance is recommended. The test circuit resistance should exceed 2 kW.				
Response	Response Status W			
REJECT.				
Comment 15 is a restatement of comment 32119.				
Comment 32119 was previously rejected and has already been re-circulated.				
The WG chair rules that this comment is a restatement of a previous comment not requiring recirculation.				
The Task Force has reviewed 32119 and has reaffirmed our previous position.				

The WG chair rules this comment is a new invalid DISAPPROVE comment.

IEEE P802.3at DTE power via MDI Enhancements
Procedure for Conditional Approval to Forward a Draft Standard report

Comment #16:

Cl 33	SC 33.1.3	P 37	L 8	# 16
Dawe, Piers		Avago Technologies		
Comment Type	TR	Comment Status	R	
To resolve comment D3.2/123, which points out that Fig 33-3 shows a PI connected to a non-PoE PHY through a midspan.				
Suggested Remedy				
Label the broken right hand end of the medium 'To PD' and add PD to the abbreviations list in the figure. Draw a rectangle (or something) over the medium within the midspan to the left of the connection to the PSE, and label 'See 33.2.2'.				
Response		Response Status	W	
REJECT.				
This comment is out of scope because there were no substantive changes to the material being commented on.				
This appear to be a restatement of 32123, which was also out of scope, but was not noted as such during that comment resolution.				
The WG chair rules that this comment is out of scope not requiring recirculation.				
The Task Force has reviewed the 32123 and reaffirms our position.				
The midspan may not connect to a PD, and the midspan PSE is already drawn as a rectangle.				

The WG chair rules this comment is a new invalid DISAPPROVE comment.

There were two new DISAPPROVE comments ruled invalid by the WG chair.

f) The WG Chair shall immediately report the results of the ballot to the EC including: the date the ballot closed, vote tally and comments associated with any remaining disapproves (valid and invalid), the WG responses and the rationale for ruling any vote invalid.

Please see above.